CONSERVATION AREA ADVISORY COMMITTEE 13 APRIL 2006

Present: Mr Keith Hamilton (Twentieth Century Society) (in the Chair) Mr Donald Armstrong (Co-opted) Mrs Carole Craven (Georgian Society) Mrs Joan D'Arcy (Derbyshire Archaeological Society) Mr Charles Glenn (IHBC East Midlands) Mr Jeff James (Chamber of Commerce) Mr Michael Mallender (Co-opted)

City Council Officers:

Mr H Hopkinson (Development and Cultural Services)

72/05 Apologies

Apologies were received from Councillors Samra and Travis, Mr M Craven, Mr P Billson, Mrs A Hutchinson, Mr J Sharpe and Mr B Wyatt.

73/05 Late Items Introduced by the Chair

In accordance with Section 100(B)(4) of the Local Government Act 1972, the Chair agreed to admit the following two items on the grounds that advice was required from the Committee before the next scheduled meeting of the Committee:

- 1. Code DER/306/379 Internal alterations to listed building and new cast iron gates to archway at 28 Ashbourne Road
- 2. Code DER/406/622 Change of use from tanning studio/beauty salon to tattoo studio at 3 Duffield Road.

74/05 Declarations of Interest

There were no declarations of interest.

75/05 Minutes of the Previous Meeting

The minutes of the meeting held on 16 March 2006 were confirmed as a correct record and signed by the Chair.

76/05 The George Rennie Award

It was agreed to visit to following sites and determine their suitability for the George Rennie Award at the next meeting:

- The Arboretum
- Parker's Piece Cricket Pavilion
- The Royal Building Canopy
- 37-39 Friar Gate Bridge
- Mill House, Brook Street

It was decided that the award would not be given at the Annual Meeting this year as the recipient would not be known in time for the meeting.

77/05 Report on Applications Determined Since the Last Report

The Committee received an update on previous applications that had been determined since the last report.

78/05 Committee Report

The Committee considered a report of the Assistant Director – Development, concerning applications received and resolved to make the following comments:

Allestree Conservation Area

3. Code No. DER/1105/1918 – Extension to village hall (office and wc), Allestree Memorial Hall, 1 Cornhill, Allestree

The Committee raised no objections subject to the use of matching materials.

City Centre Conservation Area

4. Code No. DER/206/345 – Display of externally illuminated fascia sign and internally illuminated projecting sign, 5 Queen Street

The Committee objected and recommend refusal on the grounds that the proposed fascia sign was unrelated to the architectural features of the building and it being an inappropriate form of shop signage to this brick-fronted ground floor elevation. It was considered that it would therefore appear discordant and harmful to the appearance and character of this sensitive part of the Conservation Area being adjacent to the grade II listed Dolphin Public House and within the environs of the Cathedral. It was similarly felt that the internally illuminated projecting box sign was inappropriate although it was considered that a non-illuminated sign of appropriate detail/design may be acceptable.

 Code No. DER/106/33 – Demolition of extension to public house and extension and DER/106/36 to public house (enlargement of bar area) at 10 Victoria Street (Bar V) The Committee raised no objections subject to the imposition of an archaeological condition, the use of matching brickwork and a natural welsh slate roof, and appropriate further detailing of the proposed extension re eaves, blind window openings and heads/cills.

 Code No. DER/206/339 – Installation of vision panel to door, signage to courts 1 and 2 and fix curtain poles within Courts 1 and 2 at Southern Derbyshire Magistrates Court, St Mary's Gate

The Committee objected and recommend refusal to the introduction of glazed visibility panels into the existing doors on the grounds of an unjustified loss of historic fabric to this grade I listed building. It was considered that the creation of a visibility panel would not provide tangible benefits that outweighed the loss of the original door construction and no demonstrable need had been put forward. The Committee raised no objections to the new/replacement internal signage or the fixing of curtain poles.

Chester Green Conservation Area

7. Code No. DER/106/176 – Extension to dwelling house (alteration to roof) at 135 City Road, Chester Green

The Committee objected and recommend refusal on the grounds that the proposed alterations at eaves level would erode the subtle differences in the constitution of this terrace of dwellings that is an intrinsic part of the character of the Conservation Area. In the absence of any justification for the proposed alterations or potential benefits, it was felt that the loss of character to the Conservation Area was unjustified and in the further absence of appropriate detailing on the submitted plan, it was not apparent how the new eaves would be created and how it would relate to it's neighbours.

Friar Gate Conservation Area

8. Code No. DER/306/447 – Change of use from offices to leisure (D2) for use as ladies only gymnasium at Vernon House, 2 Vernon Street

The Committee raised no objections subject to no implied approval to any future external alterations to the premises.

9. Code No. DER/206/257 – Erection of 15 apartments, land corner of George Street/Cavendish Street

The Committee noted with regret the previous grant of Conservation Area Consent for the demolition of the existing workshop building that occupies the rear corner of the site. The Committee was also mindful of the grant of outline planning permission for a form of residential development of the footprint now proposed. In these circumstances, the Committee raised no objection in principle to the proposal but requested that Officers negotiate amendment to the scheme to reduce the height of the development along a greater length of the George Street frontage, to close the gap between this development and the Creative Industries Centre presently under construction on the adjacent site and to seek confirmation over the use of natural materials and detailing throughout the new development. Additionally, the Committee requested appropriate conditions including a requirement to undertake the recording of the workshop building prior to it's demolition.

10. Code No. DER/106/99 – Change of use from offices to training facility/class rooms and offices for a temporary period on the ground floor at Norman House, Friar Gate

The Committee raised no objections.

11. Code No. DER/306/445 – Installation of new shop front on both elevations of the shop, Jacksons Store, 121 Nun Street

The Committee raised no objections.

12. Code No. DER/306/393 – Erection of a satellite dish at land to the rear of 38 Ashbourne Road

The Committee raised no objections.

Railway Conservation Area

13. Code No. DER/206/333 – Demolition of buildings, change of use and extension and DER/206/334 of former offices to form 53 apartments, with ancillary facilities and car parking, Churnet House and 1/2 Carrington Street

The Committee objected and recommend refusal on the grounds that the existing buildings standing on part of the site represent an intrinsic part of the character of the Railway Conservation Area and that their demolition has not been justified in terms of PPG 15 re both the viability of retention/reuse and the quality of the proposed replacement development which was considered to have a poor relationship with the adjacent buildings and to the character of the Conservation Area.

14. Code No. DER/306/397- Installation of new shopfront, 8-9 Midland Road

The Committee raised no objections subject to appropriate detailing of the new shop front.

Strutts Park Conservation Area

15. Code No. DER/306/371 – Replacement of front and rear doors and rear window, 20 Otter Street

The Committee raised no objections subject to the retention of the arched head to the French door opening and to the subdivision of the replacement first floor rear window into three lights rather than two lights as shown on the submitted plan.

16. Code No. DER/306/370 – Extension to apartments (2 kitchens) and formation of four additional apartments at Epworth Villas, Duffield Road

The Committee objected and recommend refusal on the grounds that the proposal seems ill-conceived being of poor massing/proportions and inappropriate detailing, particularly the door & window opening and would therefore be harmful to the appearance/character of the Conservation Area.

Late Items

17. Code DER/306/379 – Internal alterations to listed building and new cast iron gates to archway at 28 Ashbourne Road

The Committee raised no objections in principle but subject to the Council's Conservation Officer being satisfied over the justification of the need to create the false ceiling at first floor level.

18. Code DER/406/622 – Change of use from tanning studio/beauty salon to tattoo studio at 3 Duffield Road

The Committee raised no objections.

MINUTES END