

Time commenced – 5.15pm
Time finished – 7.55pm

CONSERVATION AREA ADVISORY COMMITTEE 2 DECEMBER 2004

Present:

Mr K Hamilton (Twentieth Century Society)
Mr P Billson (Derby Historical Buildings Trust) (in the chair)
Mr M Craven (Victorian Society)
Mr M Mallender (Co-opted)
Mrs J D'Arcy (Derby Archaeological Society)
Mr D Armstrong (Co-opted)
Councillor Travis
Mr J Sharp (Ancient Monument Society)

City Council Officers:

Mr H Hopkinson (Development & Cultural Services)
Ms C Oswald (Development and Cultural Services)
Mrs J Coates (Corporate Services)

Apologies: Councillors Roberts and Willitts,
Mrs C Craven (Georgian Group)
Mr J James (Chamber of Commerce)
Mr R Pegg (Derby Civic Society)

37/04 Late Items Introduced by the Chair

There were no late items.

38/04 Declarations of Interest

There were no declarations of interest.

39/04 Minutes of the Previous Meeting

The minutes of the meeting held on 11 November 2004 were confirmed as a correct record and signed by the Chair.

40/04 Installation of bollards at Marcus Street/Chester Green Road, Little Chester Conservation Area

Photographs of bollards in the vicinity of Chester Green were shown to Members to give them an impression of the design of the new bollards to be commissioned. It was intended that any new bollards would have a very similar design to those originally situated in the area. Members disagreed with the use of reproduction bollards and expressed a strong preference for the re-siting of original bollards that were currently located around the town centre.

Resolved to recommend an investigation to locate the original bollards that existed in the Chester Green area and cost the re-siting of the bollards.

41/04 Proposed redevelopment at the Leylands Estate, Broadway

Before Members discussed the proposals fully, they decided to arrange a site visit to the Leylands Estate. Some Members had already visited the site and had concerns that different levels of the buildings and the erection of security fencing and gates would adversely affect the character of the Estate. The General Manager of The Leylands, who was at the meeting, agreed to a site visit taking place.

Resolved to arrange a site visit for Members to meet at Eborn House, Leylands Estate on Thursday 6 January 2005 at 2pm

42/04 Report on applications determined since the last report dated 1 November 2004

The Committee received an update on previous applications that had been determined since the last report, dated 1 November 2004.

43/04 Committee Report

The Committee considered a report of the Assistant Director – Development concerning applications received and resolved to make the following comments:

City Centre Conservation Area

- a) Code Number DER/1004/1985 – Change of use from retail (Class A1) to financial and professional services (Class A2) at 6 St James Street
 - No objections
- b) Code Numbers DER/1104/2120 – Change of use from office to dentist surgery (Use class D1) at 8-9 St Mary's Gate
 - No objections
- c) Code Number DER/1004/1931 & DER/1004/1919 – Display of externally illuminated fascia signs and one projecting sign at 19 Corn Market
 - The Committee did not object to the advertisements but advised that control should be exercised over the colour/finish of the timber shop front.
- d) Code Number DER/1104/2104 – Installation of shop front at 25 Corn Market
Code Number DER/1104/2105 – Display of internally illuminated fascia sign and internally illuminated projecting sign at 25 Corn Market
 - The Committee objected to the applications on the grounds that the proposal fails to match up to the quality of the upper part of the building within the Conservation Area and adjacent to a grade II listed building and felt that greater effort should be made to either re-instate the original form of shop front or achieve a higher standard of contemporary design with better integration of the signage.
- e) Code Number DER/1104/2213 – Alterations to first and second floor and providing link at second floor between 24 and 25 Corn Market
 - No objection subject to the works being reversible and not being destructive of the internal architectural features, especially the cornice detailing.
- f) Code Number DER/1104/1755 – Display of various signage, 3 Albert Street
 - The Committee objected and recommended refusal on the grounds that the proposed advertisements, by virtue of their number, size, illuminated nature and position on the building, are over-intensive and seriously detract from the architectural qualities of the building and from the appearance/character of the street scene and the Conservation Area, to the detriment of visual amenity.

Darley Abbey Conservation Area

- g) Code Numbers 1004/1971 and DER/1004/1974 – Change of use and alterations to listed buildings to form Café at Unit 5, Darley Abbey Mills
- No objection to the principle of the change of use but the Committee recommended deferral of the application for Listed Building Consent, pending submission of full details of all the proposed internal conversion works associated with the proposal including details of plumbing, ventilation etc.

Friar Gate Conservation Area

- h) Code Number DER/1004/2034 – Extension and change of use from office to bar/restaurant/café (Use Class A3) at 3 Friar Gate.
- The Committee noted that planning permission had been granted contrary to it's recommendation for the previous scheme of development on this site (ref DER/503/881) and considered that this present proposal was of an even lesser design quality for this gap-site between two listed buildings, than the previous scheme.
- i) Code Number DER/1104/2204 – Demolition of existing two storey building and adjoining links to Stafford House and 102 Friar Gate (Conservation Area Consent), 4-6 Stafford Street
Code Number DER/1104/2203 – Erection of four storey apartment block comprising 16 units (planning permission) site of 4-6 Stafford Street
- The Committee noted the amendments that had been made to the proposal since the previous application (ref DER/604/1152), which it had recommended refusal of. The Committee remained concerned however over the unsatisfactory form of the roof, set back to accommodate the fourth storey behind the parapet, which had not changed from the previous scheme.

The Committee reiterated it's previous concern that the development should be limited to three storeys in height to avoid the design issues at roof level. It was recommended therefore that the application be refused on the grounds that the design of the proposal, particularly at roof level, is inappropriate to the character of the Conservation Area.

The Committee raised no objection in principle to the demolition of 4-6 Stafford Street but in the absence of a satisfactory scheme of redevelopment for the site, it was considered that the application for Conservation Area Consent was premature and should be refused.

- j) Code Number DER/1104/2205 – Change of use of second floor to one apartment, planning permission, 100-102 Friar Gate and a car park to rear of 4-10 Stafford Street

- No objection subject to appropriate conditions relating to details, particularly of the railings.

- k) Code Number DER/1104/2121 – Change of use of ground floor and basement to licenced restaurant, including disabled access and new railings and gate (Planning Permission) 100-102 Friar Gate and car park to rear of 4-10 Stafford Street

Code Number DER/1104/2223 – Change of use of ground floor and basement To licenced restaurant and change of use of second floor to create one Apartment – 99-100 Friar Gate

Code Number DER/1104/2130 – Construction of fire resistant partition to rear of two ground floor doors, in connection with change of use of ground floor to licensed restaurant (Listed Building Consent) – part of 100 Friar Gate

- No objection subject to appropriate conditions relating to details, particularly of the railings. The Committee regretted the level of internal demolition at no. 100-102 Friargate, a locally listed building and requested that Officers seek the applicants agreement to the retention of as much architectural detailing and fittings as possible.

- l) Code Nos. DER/1004/2080 and DER/1004/2081 - Demolition of offices and erection of 24 apartments at the site of 55 Ashbourne Road

- The Committee vehemently objected in the strongest possible terms to this proposal and recommended that the applications be refused as being seriously harmful to the appearance and character of the Conservation Area and contrary to Planning Policy Guidance Note 15. It was noted that no. 55 Ashbourne Road is a key building within the Conservation Area with a strong historic association within the area being built in 1852 to the design of Frederick Alec Stephens (of Derby) as the Vicarage of St Werburghs Church. Set well back from Ashbourne Road behind a boundary wall/tree frontage, this substantial villa and the open space of it's foreground, are critical, intrinsic elements within the character of the Conservation Area representing part of the incremental growth of development along Ashbourne Road, a key route into the City culminating in the Georgian townhouses of Friargate. The Committee were totally opposed to the loss of this important building and any development on the openspace that creates it's setting. The proposed loss of trees from the frontage was considered to be of yet further detriment to the character of the Conservation Area. The Committee expressed concerns over the incremental degradation of the Conservation Area through inappropriate redevelopment schemes and were strongly of the view that this process should not be allowed to continue with the

loss of this important building that makes such a major contribution to the historic character of the Conservation Area. In accordance with PPG 15, the Committee considered that the reuse of the existing building should be rigorously investigated and subject to the same considerations as applied to listed buildings.

Leylands Conservation Area

m) Code Number 1104/2142 – Erection of security fencing and gates at the Leylands, Broadway

- The Committee had several concerns over the details of the proposal (position of the fence, methods of fixing/support, style of rails and design of gates/posts) and recommended deferment of the application to allow the submission of such details and further consideration of the issues by the Committee at the Committee site visit to be undertaken before the next meeting in connection with a future scheme of redevelopment.

Little Chester Conservation Area

n) Code Number DER/1004/1615 – Installation of windows and door to front elevation of 14 Camp Street

- No objection subject to details being to the satisfaction of the Council's Conservation Officer.

o) Code Number DER/1104/2103 – Installation of replacement windows and door in front elevation of 89 Old Chester Road

- The Committee recommended refusal on the grounds that the proposed replacement door and windows are of an inappropriate design and material to the character of the Conservation Area. The point was made that a new development of housing would not be permitted within the Conservation Area with UPVC doors/windows and that these relatively recently constructed dwellings should be subject to the same level of control.

Railway Conservation Area

p) Code Number 1104/2164 – Change of use from offices to maisonette at 10 Midland Road

- No objection subject to appropriate control over the routing of external services.

Others

- q) Code Numbers 1004/1920 and DER/1004/1921 – Display of various signage at former Wesley Chapel, Brook Street (Masa Restaurant)
- The Committee recommend refusal on the grounds that the proposed signs, by virtue of their size, positions, materials and illuminated nature would seriously detract from the historic/architectural character of the listed building and be detrimental to the visual amenities of the street scene. It was considered that a more appropriate form of signage on the Brook Street frontage would be a free standing board sign just behind the railings. It was considered that there was some scope for signage on the building on the Lodge Lane frontage and no concerns were expressed over the illuminated menu boards as proposed.
- r) Code Numbers DER/1004/1829 and DER/1004/1831 - Erection of detached garage, kennel and perimeter fence, at Toll Bar Cottage, Kedleston Road.
- Object and recommend refusal on the grounds that the siting of the proposed garage and the detailing of the proposed fence, particularly adjacent to the listed building, would be harmful to it's setting and historic character.
- s) Code No. 1004/1930 – Creation of internal doorway, alterations to store and garden wall at 8 Foxes Walk, Allestree
- No objection
- t) Code Numbers DER/1104/2125 and DER/1104/2128 – Erection of a sports Hall at Derby Independent Grammar School for Boys, Rykneld Road, Littleover
- Object and recommend refusal on the grounds that the proposed sports hall will have a seriously harmful impact on the setting of the grade II listed building by virtue of the consequential tree loss, it's size, scale, close proximity and conflicting architectural style. The Committee was mindful of the planning permission previously granted that included for the construction of a sports hall but considered this previous proposal to have lesser impact due to it's lesser size, more traditional design and it being more removed from the listed building.