

Time commenced – 5.15pm
Time finished – 8.30pm

CONSERVATION AREA ADVISORY COMMITTEE 13 JANUARY 2005

Present:

Mr K Hamilton (Twentieth Century Society) (in the Chair)
Mr P Billson (Derby Historical Buildings Trust)
Mr M Craven (Victorian Society)
Mr M Mallender (Co-opted)
Mrs J D'Arcy (Derby Archaeological Society)
Mr D Armstrong (Co-opted)
Mr C Glenn (IHBC East Midlands)
Mr J James (Chamber of Commerce)
Mrs A Hutchinson (Derby Civic Society)
Councillor Tittley

City Council Officers:

Mr H Hopkinson (Development and Cultural Services)
Ms C Oswald (Development and Cultural Services)
Mrs J Coates (Corporate Services)

Apologies: Councillor Willitts,
Mrs C Craven (Georgian Group)
Mr J Sharp (Ancient Monument Society)

44/04 Late Items Introduced by the Chair

The Chair introduced the following as a late item:

Proposed redevelopment of the Leylands Estate, Broadway.

Keith Hamilton reported that a site visit had taken place on 6 January 2005. Discussion took place around the suggested proposals for demolition of certain buildings on the site. Committee members did not feel that they had sufficient information to support the number of buildings that were proposed for demolition, and in some cases could not see the justification for demolition of certain buildings, in particular the Chapel, Dovedale House and Trent House. Members of the Committee felt it was desirable to retain the original concept of the estate design and that demolition of some of the central buildings would constitute a loss of the architect's original intention for the site.

In summary, the Committee concluded:

- That any statement of justification for demolition submitted as part of any future planning application, should include more financial information to clarify why the buildings could not be retained and repaired, reference was made to sections of PPG15. On the basis of this information it was felt likely that a case may be able to be made for the demolition of the nursing home building but not for the other buildings on this site. It was considered that any redevelopment of this building would need to respect the current context, be kept to the same height as the existing building so as to respect views across the site and to maintain the enclosure of the lawned garden. Details, such as brick details, should match that of the existing buildings.
- The bungalows 47 to 50, the Chapel, Dovedale House and Trent House should be retained and refurbished.
- The form of the lean-to conservatory to Fraser Hall would be unacceptable.
- Any link-buildings that may be proposed should be lightweight and transparent structures rather than of a solid character.

45/04 Declarations of Interest

Mr James declared a personal prejudicial interest in application 1104/2106 - Change of use to car park and installation of Access Gates, land north of St Mary's RC Church, access off Darley Lane.

46/04 Minutes of the Previous Meeting

The minutes of the meeting held on 2 December 2004 were confirmed as a correct record and signed by the Chair, subject to Mr K Hamilton and not MR P Billson being listed as the Chair.

47/04 St Mary's Gate, City Centre Conservation Area

Harry Hopkinson presented an oral report on a proposal to install a wall-mounted CCTV camera at No. 8 St Mary's Gate as part of the comprehensive CCTV network within the City. Committee members supported the use of small discreet cameras in conservation areas and had no objection to a camera being positioned on the corner of 8 St Mary's Gate, as indicated on the photograph presented to the Committee. However, it was recommended that:

- the manner in which the camera would be mounted and its colour required careful consideration by the City Council's Conservation Officer;
- the cabling should be painted the same colour as the walls; and
- the height of the camera should be within the lower half of the second floor window.

48/04 Former Royal Oak PH, Tenant Street, City Centre Conservation Area

Harry Hopkinson presented an oral report on the proposed signage to be displayed in connection with the future use of the building as the City's new Registry Office. Committee members felt that the sign was inappropriate and over elaborate and competed with the decorative façade of the building. The Committee suggested that a simpler approach be adopted, such as a traditional rectangular portrait hanging/swinging sign with a simple bracket. One member suggested the use of the Derby Coat of Arms. It was pointed out that two signs would be needed to make the Registry Office visible from all sides. A re-design was requested.

49/04 Report on applications determined since the last report dated 1 December 2004

The Committee received an update on previous applications that had been determined since the last report dated 1 December 2004.

50/04 Committee Report

The Committee considered a report of the Assistant Director - Development, concerning applications received and resolved to make the following comments:

City Centre Conservation Area

- a) Code Number DER/1104/2188 – Display on non-illuminated fascia sign at 25 St James Street.
 - The Committee objected to the application on the grounds that the proposed sign was poorly related to the architectural features of the building and would therefore detract from its special historic / architectural interest. It was considered that the proposed sign should be sited at normal fascia height.

- b) Code Number 1204/2386 - Change of use from financial and professional services (Use Class A2) to restaurant (Use Class A3) at 15 - 16 Market Place
 - No objection to this application for the proposed change of use of the premises, but it was noted that the submitted plans indicated future alterations to the ground floor front elevation which the Committee felt would seriously disturb the rhythm of this important building on the corner of the Market Place and would therefore be unacceptable. The Committee also noted the absence of any proposals for the ventilation of cooking odours and advised that these should be the subject of careful detailing to ensure that the terminal flue did not detract from the appearance and character of the building or this

sensitive location. It was further advised that the terminal flue should not be visible from the Cathedral tower.

Friar Gate Conservation Area

- a) Code Number DER/1204/2054 - Site of Derby Tapes Ltd, Agard Street Mills, Agard Street
- The Committee noted the desktop archaeological study that had been submitted in support of this application, which it considered, failed to address the archaeological issues of the site, including the existing industrial buildings. It was requested that this desktop study be revisited and members offered their assistance in researching the site history should it be necessary. In terms of the proposed scheme of redevelopment, the Committee objected to the scheme as presented. The Committee objected to the proposed demolition of the existing C19 mill buildings situated at the north eastern corner of the site, wishing them to be retained and converted. The demolition of the existing single storey building and the siting of new buildings around the perimeter of the site on the Bridge Street and Agard Street frontages was however, considered to be appropriate in principle. Nonetheless, it was considered that the design of the new development failed to respond to the important local context with too much reference being taken from the nearby university halls of residence. It was considered that the proposed four storey height was too great at the Bridge Street end of the site where it was likely to have a harmful relationship with the grade II listed Church of St John the Evangelist. Concerns were further expressed over the impact of the potential highway improvements indicated on the submitted plans at the Agard Street / Bridge Street junction, without which the Committee indicated that a preferred scheme would be to site new development on the existing back of footpath. It was further suggested that any further submission should include a street scene elevation in order to properly assess the relationship of any proposed development with the existing adjacent buildings, including the listed church.
- b) Code Number DER/1104/2249 - Alterations to listed building and extension (conservatory) - 1 St Johns Terrace
- No objection subject to appropriate details and conditions, particularly relating to materials.
- c) Code Number DER/1104/1654 - Erection of 10 apartments at the site of 121a Nuns Street
- The Committee objected to the application on the grounds that the proposed scheme of redevelopment was too intense at the proposed five storeys in height and that elevations, both front and rear, failed to respond to the local context. It was considered therefore that the proposal would be harmful to the setting of the Friar Gate Conservation Area and also to the setting of the grade II listed 126 Nuns Street. It was advised that a satisfactory scheme of redevelopment should be limited to three/four storeys in height with an appropriate relationship with the Markeaton Brook and Nuns Bridge. Any further submission should

include more detailed plans showing the proposal in its wider context and the three dimensional form of the proposal. Details of materials should also be included in any further submission together with an archaeological assessment of the site.

Little Chester Conservation Area

- a) Code Number DER/1004/1985 - Erection of 15 houses and 147 apartments, site of Aida Bliss premises and City Road Industrial Park, City Road, Derby
- The Committee were concerned that the proposal did not appear to have addressed the issues, which it raised in response to the pre-application consultation at its meeting on 11 November 2004. The Committee was informed however, that amended plans were to be submitted to the Local Planning Authority and accordingly, the Committee deferred consideration of this application pending the submission of an amended scheme.

Spondon Conservation Area

- a) Code Number DER/1204/2325 – Demolition of existing double garage and demolition or part of existing front wall within Spondon Conservation area, in connection with DER/704/1289 – 4 West Road, Spondon
- No objection.

Strutts Park Conservation Area

- a) Code Number DER/1104/2267 – Change of use of residential care home and external alterations to form 5 apartments, 126 Duffield Road
 - No objection subject to detailed approval of any replacement doors and windows and any other additions or alterations affecting the external elevations.
- b) Code number DER/1204/2244&DER/1204/2271 – Demolition of garage and erection of new garage, Southerly, South Avenue
 - The Committee objected to this application on the grounds that the proposed replacement garage, being constructed of reconstructed stone with a stone balustrade around the flat roof is contrary to the character of the conservation area and this particular property, it being too elaborate and pretentious and therefore would be detrimental to the appearance and character of the Strutts Park Conservation Area. Furthermore, it was considered that the large, single garage doors opening directly facing Derwent Park was equally inappropriate.
- c) Code number DER/1204/2349 – First floor extension to dwelling (bedroom / study) at 65 Belper Road

- No objection to the proposed first floor extension, however, the Committee advised that further clarification was required over the proposed new canopy roof and it's relationship to the existing door canopy that appears to be retained.
- d) Code number DER/1104/2106 – Change of use to car park and installation of Access Gates, land north of St Mary's RC Church, access off Darley Lane
- No objection subject to the use of traditional wrought iron, in the proposed new iron rail fences and gates.

Railway Conservation Area

- a) Code number DER/1204/2390 – Alterations to front elevation at 6-7 Midland Road (Masala Art Restaurant)
- The Committee objected on the grounds that the proposed alterations to the existing shop display windows are inappropriate, being poorly related in design terms to both the upper elevation of this property and also to the shop windows of adjacent properties. The lack of an appropriate fascia above the shop windows and the cladding of the ground floor elevation with a modern tile, would further detract from the appearance of the premises to the detriment of the appearance and character of the Conservation Area.

Others

- a) Code number DER/804/1379 – Erection of 23 apartments, land at corner of King Street and St Helens Street and 4 Orchard Street
- The Committee noted the amendments that had been made to this scheme in response to previous comments and considered that the scheme was now generally acceptable. It was considered however that the success of this scheme would rest on the details of the proposed new building, brickwork, windows eaves, dormers, materials and advised that appropriate conditions be imposed to require further approval of all detailing of the external elevations. It was also requested that the indicative landscaping adjacent to the Friends Meeting House should be substantial in nature in order to effectively protect the curtilage of the listed building from the vehicle service area to the side and rear of the proposed new development.
- b) Code number DER/1004/1829 – Erection of summerhouse, kennel and perimeter fence, Toll Bar Cottage, Kedlestone Road
- No objection subject to appropriate conditions.

MINUTES END