

COUNCIL CABINET 7 JUNE 2011



Report of the Strategic Director of Neighbourhoods

Review of Public Transport Supported Services and Concessionary Fares

SUMMARY

- 1.1 The Council currently contracts a number of bus services which are not commercially viable, but which provide specific services to meet the needs of local people. These include five traditional bus services and five services operated by Community Transport. The Council also pays for some public transport related services, including provision of public transport information, the b_line concessionary fares scheme for young people and additional travel concessions for Gold Card holders.
- 1.2 To help inform any future funding decisions the City Council, alongside Derbyshire County Council, undertook a major public consultation exercise. During the consultation, which ran for 13 weeks ending at the end of January 2011 and involves service users, service providers and representative groups, people were encouraged to complete a questionnaire indicating which supported services were of most importance to them and also where they thought savings could be made. The overall results of the consultation are summarised in Appendix 2. A complete analysis of the survey results is available on CMIS.
- 1.3 In setting its budget in March, Council approved that budget savings of £160,000 would be brought forward from 2012/13 to be delivered through service reductions in 2011/12. A further saving of £133,000 from community transport services and £80,000 from supported bus service are to be made in 2012/13. The detailed savings now proposed entail the withdrawal of all the current Community Transport Services and the majority of the five traditional Council supported bus services. This report sets out how these savings could be achieved but still allows the most popular supported bus service to be supported until the end of the current financial year.
- 1.4 An Equality Impact Assessment has been undertaken to consider the impacts of removing services. A summary of the Impact Assessment is included at Appendix 3 and a copy of the full assessment is attached at Appendix 4.
- 1.5 In April the Department For Transport introduced significant changes in the way reimbursement to bus operators for accepting the English National Concessionary Travel Scheme (known in Derby and Derbyshire as Gold Card) was calculated. This has resulted in significant reduction in the amount of money that our main public transport operators will receive in 2011/12 from the Council for carrying Gold Card users. The new method of calculating reimbursement has particularly impacted upon one operator and, in order to assist the operator in adjusting their activities to take account of the reduction, this report sets out a proposal to cushion the financial impact by making a discretionary one off payment in 2011/12.

RECOMMENDATION

- 2.1 That, to achieve approved budget savings in 2011/12 and 2012/13, the following actions be taken:
 - to withdraw all Community Transport services, in their current form, with effect from September 2011. The Dial a Bus Supermarket service would be able to continue until the end of the financial year as long as the other actions listed below are implemented but it would end on 31 March 2012 at the latest.
 - to withdraw all support for bus services 9, 19 and 35 with effect from September 2011.
 - to implement changes to bus service 111 from September 2011, currently supported by Derby City Council, in order to reduce costs.
 - to remove the Gold Card rail fare discount with effect from August 2011, in line with proposals from Derbyshire County Council. Remove free travel on Community Transport Dial a Bus Supermarket service and introduce a flat £2 return fare on this service with effect from September 2011.
 - Reduce the b_line subsidy from 50% to 33%, in line with proposals from Derbyshire County Council, with effect from August 2011.
- 2.2 To approve, subject to paragraph 2.3, that a one off payment is made to a key public transport operator, Arriva, to ensure that a minimum fee reimbursement of £3m is provided in 2011/12 under the National Concessionary Fares Scheme.
- 2.3 To authorise the Strategic Director of Resources to enter into a legal agreement with Arriva to ensure that the companies service frequencies and fares extant at 31 March 2011 are retained until at least 31 December 2011 at the same levels.
- 2.4 That the budget saving arising from any change in payments to service operators under the revised reimbursement scheme be transferred to a specific corporate concessionary fares contingency budget, to mitigate future concessionary fares cost risk.

REASONS FOR RECOMMENDATION

- 3.1 The ending of supported services is necessary to meet the approved budget savings set by Council in March 2011. The proposals address budget savings for both 2011/12 and 2012/13.
- 3.2 The discretionary payment will guarantee that the level of bus service currently provided by Arriva within Derby, including fares, is maintained until the end of 2011. This will assist public transport users across the city and will potentially ensure that where supported services are removed, options for people to use commercial bus services will be retained.
- 3.3 The level of reimbursement under the National Concessionary Fares scheme is dependent on many factors including the level of usage. Variations in the payments

we are required to make may well vary in future years and it is prudent to ensure that a contingency budget is available to help lessen potential future financial risks.

SUPPORTING INFORMATION

4 <u>Community Transport and Conventional Council Supported Bus service</u>

- 4.1 The Council provide support to enable a number of transport services to operate. The services have been commissioned to meet particular needs and many have been operating for some time. The services are provided in the form of traditional bus services and specialised transport operated on behalf of the Council by Community Transport. The services are:
- 4.2 Community Transport Services:
 - Dial a Bus (Supermarket). A service which operates at a cost of approximately £81,000 per annum and which provides access to supermarkets from most suburbs on a fortnightly basis. The service currently transports approximately 8,000 people per year. Typical subsidy levels are £10 to £13 per passenger.
 - Dial a Bus (City Centre). A service bringing people into the city centre from most suburbs. This service is essentially provided alongside the Dial a Ride (Supermarket) service and costs approximately £76,000 per annum to operate. The service carries approximately 6,000 people per year. Typical subsidy levels are £13 to £18 per passenger.
 - Ring & Ride to Health. Operated to assist people to access medical services across the city. The service costs approximately £60,000 per annum and provides transport for approximately 1,600 people per annum. Typical subsidy levels are £32 to £63 per passenger.
 - Group Hire. Transport support to enable groups of people to access activities. The cost of this service is approximately £50,000 per year. Typical subsidy levels are £13 to £27 per passenger.
 - Football Service. A service to transport people to and from Derby County football matches at Pride Park. The service costs approximately £2,000 per annum and provides transport for approximately 500 people per year. Typical subsidy levels are £3 to £4 per passenger.

All Community Transport services provide accessible vehicles to meet the needs of users.

•

4.3 Supported Bus Service

- Service 17 and 17A. A cross boundary service subsidised in part by the City Council and in part by Derbyshire County Council. The service accesses areas of Darley and Allestree ward which are not accessed by other bus services. The subsidy costs approximately £9,000 per annum and is used by some 24,660 people. Typical subsidy is 36p per passenger.
- Service 35. A service which provides access to areas of Littleover and Mickleover. The service costs £37,000, per year and is used by some 24,725 people. Typical subsidy is £1.50p per passenger.
- Service 9. A cross boundary service subsidised in part by the City Council and in part by Derbyshire County Council. The service provides accessibility between Ockbrook and Spondon at a cost of £15,000 per annum. Approximately 58,275 passengers use the service each year. Typical subsidy is 26p per passenger.
- Service 111&19. Service 111 provides transport into and out of Pride Park and Wyvern including access to and from the park and ride site. Service 19 operates using the same vehicles which run Service 111 but is only operated outside of peak hours. This service runs into the Albert Road area of Chaddesden. Service 19 is used by some 21,841 people each year while Service 111 attracts 168,566 passengers. The combined cost of the service is approximately £81,000 per annum. Typical subsidy is 91p per passenger for service 19 and 36p per passenger for service 111.
- 4.4 The total budget for operating Community Transport services is approximately £293,000 per annum. As a consequence of decisions made by Council in setting the budget for 2011/12, a saving of £160,000 needs to be made in 2011/12, with the remaining budget of £133,000 being removed in 2012/13. In 2012/13, a further saving of £80,000 has been identified as arising from the reduction of supported bus services.

5 Public and stakeholder consultation

- 5.1 Extensive consultation with interested people and service users has been undertaken to identify those services which were most valued and to inform our decisions. The consultation was undertaken in parallel with Derbyshire County Council and the consultation closed at the end of January. The results of the City Council's consultation are summarised in Appendix 2. The following points are worthy of highlighting:
 - The overall conclusions are broadly similar to those of the County Council's survey; with many respondents suggesting that some of the most costly or lightly used supported bus services should be regarded as being the areas of least importance. The b_line concession discount for young people was also seen to be comparatively unimportant, although the age profile of survey respondents was skewed towards older people.
 - Respondents considered the Pride Park service 111 (Park & Ride), service 17/17a to Darley Abbey, the Dial a Bus (supermarket) service and information about public transport to be the services of most importance to them. The bus services above also featured as being the top three services that people considered we should try to keep running.

- The three most popular areas for saving money were proposals to cut the community transport football service; for Gold Card passengers to pay a fare to subsidise the community transport Dial a Bus service and for the Council to stop the funding for bus service 19 to Chaddesden & Spondon.
- 5.2 In developing the recommendations contained within this report, consideration has been given to the views expressed by service users, although the budget position does not leave room for any significant concessions. In addition, we have undertaken an Equality Impact Assessment to consider the potential impact of removing the various services. The full Impact Assessment is available at Appendix 4 and a brief summary, setting out the key impacts arising from these proposals as well as proposed mitigation measures to help lessen the impacts, is attached at Appendix 3.

6 Gold Card and B line Concessionary Fares

6.1 We work closely with Derbyshire County Council in administering the English National Concessionary Fares scheme for Derby and Derbyshire. It is important that the scheme operates consistently across the city and county. Derbyshire County Council has determined that they will make changes to the discretionary elements of the Concessionary Fares scheme from August 2011. The changes will include the removal of the subsidy provided for rail passengers who travel within Derby and Derbyshire and the reduction in subsidy provided for young people through 'b-line' from 50% to 33%. It is appropriate that these changes are also introduced within Derby. Savings achieved through these changes will be used to meet existing pressures within the budget set aside for b-line reimbursement and the remaining saving will be transferred to a specific corporate concessionary fares contingency budget.

7 Proposed Changes

- 7.1 In determining where service reductions can best be achieved, in order to meet the approved budget savings, it seems logical that we examine all supported services and that we seek to make decisions now that will take account not only of the budget reductions for 2011/12 but also the reductions that we need to deliver in 2012/13. Having regard to the level of savings required and considering the views expressed during the consultation then the proposal is:
 - Withdraw all Community Transport services, including the Dial a Bus supermarket service in its current form, with effect from the beginning of September 2011. This will save £171,000 per annum in 2011/12 and the full budget of £293,000 in 2012/13.
 - Introduce a revised Dial a bus supermarket service and charge Gold Card holders a flat return fare of £2 to use it with effect from the beginning of September 2011. This will cost approximately £23,000 assuming usage is as forecast following the introduction of the flat fare charge. This will be funded through the early introduction of reductions in the provision of supported services. This service will end on or before 31 March 2012, subject to agreement from the present operator
 - Withdraw support for bus services 9, 19 and 35 with effect from the beginning of September 2011. This will save approximately £46,000 in 2011/12 and a

further \pounds 34,000 in 2012/13 on an ongoing basis. The full 2012/13 \pounds 80,000 saving will be achieved as follows:

- £37,000 from the removal of the 35 service
- £15,000 from the removal of the 9 service
- £20,000 from the reduction of the 111 / 19
- £8,000 above inflation increase in income from the remaining service 111 and 17 / 17a
- To continue to subsidise a revised service 111 and service 17/17a.
- 7.2 Removal of the funding for the majority of Community Transport services will cause concern to many people with many of the service users having particular needs. The Equality Impact Assessment indicates that alternative travel options do exist for all journeys which are currently undertaken by Community Transport. The city is well served with accessible commercial bus services operating at high frequency and throughout the week. Many local companies offer accessible taxis and mini buses and the health service operate specialist transport for some out patients with particular needs. By using some of the savings arising from withdrawing the Community Transport services, implementing cuts to supported services in 2011/12 in advance of the required date of 2012/13 and using a subsidy from service users, it will be possible to retain the most popular Community Transport service, the Dial a Bus supermarket service, until the end of March 2012. However, the requirement to achieve £80,000 of savings for this remaining budget will mean that the revised Dial a Bus option, which will cost approximately £39,000 per annum, cannot be supported beyond 31 March 2012.
- 7.3 Ending the subsidies paid to bus operators for service 9 and service 35 could lead ultimately to the bus services being withdrawn; however this will be a matter for the operator. It is possible that the services could be retained, perhaps through minor alterations to frequency of service and or route, but this will not be within the control of the Council.
- 7.4 It is proposed that service 111 and service 17/17a be retained. In the case of service 111, there is a significant level of demand arising from both park and ride and other users who require access to Pride Park and Wyvern. Removing the requirement to operate service 19 will enable consideration to be given to adjusting the operation of service 111 and to find ways to reduce the cost of subsidising this service. Service 17/17a provides accessibility to Darley Abbey and parts of the Darley and Allestree ward which are otherwise not serviced by buses. Access for residents of Darley Abbey would be particularly challenging if the service were withdrawn due to the topography of the area. The cost of subsidising Service 17/17a is quite small, at just £9,000 per annum, and it is therefore recommended that this service be retained.
- 7.5 The Equality Impact Assessment indicates that some service users will be disadvantaged by the withdrawal of these services. It is important to recognise that while alternative travel options exist they may, in some instances, be more expensive. Existing services provide a point where users can interact socially with other users and this may not exist in commercially provided transport. There are measures proposed within the Equality Impact Assessment to help ensure that where services are removed we help people understand what alternatives exist and that we also work with service providers to encourage them to continue to offer transport where the demand is sufficient and where it can be provided commercially. We will also guide

people to ensure that they have access to existing financial support to ensure that they are best able to meet the cost of transport.

8 Additional concessionary fares payment

- 8.1 Nationally the way concessionary fares reimbursement is calculated changed in April 2011. This change has resulted in the amount of money bus operators receive being reduced. Whilst this will affect all operators in the Derby/Derbyshire scheme, Arriva who operate over 60% of bus services in the City, will see a particularly large drop in the funding they receive. In 2010/11, Arriva received £3,593,000 through the Derby/Derbyshire concessionary fares scheme. Under the new calculation method we estimated they will receive £2,861,471 in 2011/12 a drop of £731,529 or 20.3%. By comparison, the city's other main bus operator, Trent Barton, is less affected by the change in the calculation of reimbursement amounts and will receive a reduction of just 9.9%.
- 8.2 Arriva have informed us that they would be unable to absorb such a reduction in concessionary fares income without making some major reductions in the number of routes they operate within the city and cuts in service frequencies on the routes which remain. This could have a major impact on many peoples ability to access key services and employment opportunities from the most deprived areas of the city. At the same time they are also proposing to increase fares over and above those we have already taken account of. This could increase the amount the Council would need to pay them in concessionary fares reimbursement, as the calculation for this is partly based on their average ticket price.
- 8.3 In an effort to overcome this issue discussions have taken place with Arriva. As a result, Arriva have proposed that they will maintain the current level of service provision and fares existing at 31 March 2011 within the city, at least until the end of 2011, in exchange for a guaranteed reimbursement of £3m. This is £139,000 higher than the estimated reimbursement figure which under the new method of calculating payments we would expect to make. The calculation for reimbursement depends on many factors. The estimated reimbursement figure is based on passenger numbers from 2010/11 and accounts for all reimbursement payable to Arriva under the Derby/Derbyshire scheme. Some elements of reimbursement relate to journeys which originate outside the city but the significant majority of reimbursement arises from journeys made within Derby.
- 8.4 In setting the 2011/12 budget we were prudent in respect of concessionary fares and budgeted for costs of approximately £6.6m. Taking account of the potential arrangement to guarantee Arriva £3m in 2011/12 will be affordable within the budget, due to the reduction in overall payments to bus operators through changes in the reimbursement methodology. As there are a number of future reimbursement cost risks, the balance of the budget will be transferred to a specific corporate concessionary fares contingency budget.

9 Conclusion

The approach recommended within this report:

- Takes account of the responses to the consultation and the Equality Impact Assessment
- mirrors the approach proposed by Derbyshire County Council in respect of their corresponding service revisions and changes to the concessionary fares scheme
- will achieve the necessary budget savings for 2011/12 and 2012/13
- preserves the services identified by survey respondents as being the most popular services, services 111, 17/17a and Dial a Bus to supermarket (although there will be insufficient budget to allow the Dial a Bus to Supermarket service to continue to be supported in 2012/13)
- ensures that the level of bus service provided by the largest commercial operator within the city is preserved at least until the end of 2011

OTHER OPTIONS CONSIDERED

- 10.1 Given the need to achieve significant budgetary savings over a range of services, there are invariably numerous alternatives which could be pursued in order to achieve the required targets. However, after careful consideration, officers consider that the options presented are those which are best aligned with the outcomes of the consultation exercise.
- 10.2 In terms of the proposal to guarantee a reimbursement of £3m to Arriva; should the alternative approach of not providing a guaranteed level of reimbursement be taken, the company could implement significant reductions in service provision in Derby and/or fare increases, in an effort to mitigate any reduction in reimbursement when compared with previous years.

For more information contact:	David Dowbenko 01332 641754 e-mail dave.dowbenko@derby.gov.uk
Background papers: List of appendices:	None Appendix 1 – Implications Appendix 2 –.Consultation Summary Appendix 3 – Equality Impact Summary and Proposed Mitigation Measures Appendix 4 – Equality Impact Assessment

IMPLICATIONS

Financial and Value for Money

- 1.1 Ending Community Transport provision, in its current form, from September 2011 will deliver ongoing savings of £171,000 in 2011/12 and a further £122,000 in 2012/13. The budgeted savings are £160,000 in 2011/12 and £133,000 in 2012/13, totalling the £293,000 savings that are to be delivered.
- 1.2 Changes to supported bus services with effect from the beginning of September 2011 will deliver ongoing savings of approximately £46,000 in 2011/12 and a further £34,000 in 2012/13. The budgeted saving of £80,000 was planned for 2012/13. The early introduction part funds the remaining Dial a Bus Supermarket Service provision and the balance of £34,000 being an additional 2011/12 saving.
- 1.3 Introducing a revised Dial a Bus supermarket service from September 2011 to March 2012 will cost approximately £23,000. This will be funded by £11,000 from the changes to the existing Community Transport Provision and £12,000 from the earlier than originally planned reduction in the supported bus services.
- 1.4 Discretionary Gold Card rail cost £87,000 in 2010/11. Withdrawing this in August 2011 is estimated to deliver an ongoing saving of £58,000 in 2011/12 and a further £29,000 in 2012/13. Any saving over and above that required to meet budget savings and service costs will be transferred to a specific corporate concessionary fares contingency budget.
- 1.5 Reducing the B Line subsidy from August 2011 from 50% to 33% is anticipated to deliver an ongoing saving of £124,000 in 2011/12 and a further £62,000 in 2012/13. This saving assumes demand reduces to 85% of its current level due to the increased cost to users. B Line cost in 2010/11 was £425,000 and is therefore anticipated to reduce to £301,000 in 2011/12 and to £239,000 in 2012/13, although this will be affected by any inflationary cost increases. Any saving over and above that required to meet budget savings, service costs and restating the B Line base budget will be transferred to a specific corporate concessionary fares contingency budget.

- 1.6 The discretionary payment to a key public transport operator to ensure that a minimum fee reimbursement of £3m is provided in 2011/12 is estimated to cost £139,000 based on applying the revised reimbursement formula to 2010/11 journey data. Changes to journeys or fares would impact on the amount paid and the operator is only proposing to maintain the current level of service provision and fares until 31 December 2011, not 31 March 2012 which is when the value of the discretionary payment would be determined.
- 1.7 Should the amount the operator receives through the scheme be below the £2,861,000 estimated this would increase the value of the discretionary payment. It is proposed to guarantee a £3m payment and not to limit the discretionary payment to a maximum value.
- 1.8 It is anticipated that the cost of the payment to the operator can be managed within the savings expected as a result of changes to the way concessionary fares reimbursement is calculated, introduced in April 2011.
- 1.9 The savings estimated from the reduced reimbursement costs due to bus operators, arising from the change in the reimbursement methodology, will be transferred to a specific corporate concessionary fares contingency budget

Legal

Equality Duty

- 2.1 The Public Sector equality duty consists of a general equality duty, which is set out in section 149 of the Equality Act 2010 (the Act), and specific duties which are imposed by secondary legislation. The general equality duty came into force on 5 April 2011.
- 2.2 Those subject to the equality duty, such as the Council, must, in the exercise of their functions, have due regard to the need to:
 - Eliminate unlawful discrimination, harassment and victimisation and other conduct prohibited by the Act.
 - Advance equality of opportunity between people who share a protected characteristic and those who do not.
 - Foster good relations between people who share a protected characteristic and those who do not.
- 2.3 The Act effectively broadens and extends the positive equality duties and previously found in the Race Relations, Disability Discrimination & Sex Discrimination Act so it now applies to cover age, sexual orientation, pregnancy and maternity, religion and belief.
- 2.4 In order to comply with this duty the Council must, when making decisions, assess the impact they will have on different members of the community. This duty can best be discharged in cases of possible significant impact by undertaking an Equality Impact Study, as was done in this case.

2.5 The equality duties do not prevent a local authority, or other public body, from making difficult decisions which may effect one group more than another but they must have "due regard" to these matters in the decision making process by properly assessing and considering the potential equality impact of the proposed change.

Personnel

3.1 None directly arising.

Equalities Impact

4.1 Although the proposals involve the withdrawal of some services used by elderly and disabled people, since the original contract was let there have been fundamental improvements in the accessibility of commercial bus services in Derby and significant service improvements to the destinations such as the Derby Royal Hospital and other health facilities. A detailed Equalities Impact Assessment has been undertaken to inform the decision. A summary is attached at Appendix 3 and the full assessment is appended at Appendix 4.

Health and Safety

5.1 None directly arising.

Environmental Sustainability

6.1 Ensuring that everyone within the city has access to high quality, high frequency bus services is essential in providing people with real choices in how they access essential services and ensuring that those choices are sustainable.

Asset Management

7.1 None identified.

Risk Management

8.1 None identified.

Corporate objectives and priorities for change

9.1 The changes would represent good value for the reduced standards of service.

A. Consultation Summary –Derby City Council Questionnaire on Public Transport Services

The consultation process ran for 13 weeks from the beginning of November 2010 until the end of January 2011 and was promoted through articles in the Derby Evening Telegraph, the Gold Card magazine and the b_line website. Questionnaires were made available on all of the Councils supported bus services, in libraries, at area and neighbourhood panel meetings, in secondary schools, at the diversity forum meeting, in community centres and on the respective Council's websites.In total, 1506 questionnaire responses were returned for the City Council survey.

Table 1: Respondents were asked to indicate which services they considered most and least important.

Services respondents considered most important	Services respondents considered least important.
Bus service 111 to Pride Park and Wyvern	Bus service 19 to Chaddesden and Spondon
Bus service 17/17a to Darley Abbey and Allestree	Bus service 35 to Littleover and Mickleover
Community Transport Dial a Bus service to supermarket	Community Transport Football Service
Public Transport information	B-Line concessionary fares scheme for young people

Table 2: Respondents were asked which three public transport services which the Council currently supports would you choose to save money in?

Service area	% supporting saving money in this area
Community Transport Football Service	43%
Reduce the amount of funding provided to Community Transport Dial a Bus service by getting Gold Card holders to pay a fare	27%
Stop funding bus service 19	26%

Table 3 Which one service is the most important to try to keep running?

Service Area	% supporting this service
Community Transport Dial a Bus service to local supermarket	19%
Bus Service 17/17a	16%
Bus Service 111	12%

Derby Community Transport – Annual Costs Β.

Table 4: Derby Community T	able 4: Derby Community Transport Costs (January – December 2010)		
Service	Cost, £	Cost range (Min to Max, £ per passenger)	
Dial a Ride (Supermarket)	81,000	£10 – 13	
Dial a Ride (City Centre)	76,000	£13 – 18	
Ring & Ride to Health	60,000	£32 – 63	
Group Hire	50,000	£13 – 27	
Football Service	2,000	£3 – 4	
Total Expenditure	£269,000		

NB – The actual costs incurred are less than the budget for the service, due to some services not running on all possible days, or lack of demand. The original 2012/13 budget for the service was £293,000 but was reduced to £133,000 at Full Council 2 March 2011.

C. Supported Bus Services in Derby – Annual Costs

Service	2010/2011 Costs	Passenger numbers per year
17/17a	£9,000	24,660
35	£37,000	24,725
111/19	£81,000	190,407
9	£15,000 (50% towards the total cost of this County- provided service)	58,275 (including passengers in County area)

Costs shown are the actual cost of the service (i.e. after any income from concessionary fares, Egg, pride park car park revenue, fares etc is taken into account)

APPENDIX 3

EQUALITY IMPACT ASSESSMENT – SUMMARY

Following receipt of the results from the recent consultation on pubic transport, a detailed Equalities Impact Assessment has been performed to inform the decision making process.

We recognise that the withdrawal of community transport and supported bus services will have an impact on those who currently use the services. The Equality Impact Assessment highlights the concerns of users and others who responded to the consultation and sets out who is likely to be affected by the removal of these services. The impacts are particularly going to be felt by older, disabled and younger people.

The equality impact assessment revealed that, since the tendering of the original Community Transport contract in 2008, there have been fundamental improvements to the accessibility of bus services in Derby; with virtually all local commercial bus services now using fully-accessible low-floor vehicles.

In addition, Derby currently has a well-developed network of commercial services, which operate at least every 20 minutes from virtually all areas to the city centre. Bus services to Royal Derby Hospital were also improved significantly in January 2011, with the introduction of 33/33a and 36/36a services. This created a direct route to the hospital from a number of areas in the south of the city for first time. As a result, many passengers from these areas no longer need to change buses in the city centre to reach the hospital.

It is considered that the existing commercial bus services network is capable of providing alternative forms of transport provision for all of the Community Transport current services.

Moving to supported bus services; the 17/17A services are subsidised at minimal cost and are valued by many elderly people living in the Darley Abbey village area. Although alternative bus provision exists along both Duffield Rd and Kedleston Rd, some elderly residents would have to walk up a steep hill from the village to the A6 road for more than the Department for Transport's (DfT's) recommended minimum distance of 400m to reach these services; it is therefore recommended that these services should be retained.

The 19 and 35 services both have suitable alternative commercial services within the 400m distance for the all the route (19) and the majority of the route (35), and although there is no alternative commercial service to Ockbrook if service 9 is to be withdrawn which will be a matter for the service operator to determine, all of its route within the Council's area has alternative bus service provision within 400m of the present service route.

The remaining service delivery proposals are concerned with the withdrawal of optional local elements of the concessionary fares scheme over and above the national scheme specification agreed by the Government.

To mitigate the effects of the service modifications and withdrawals recommended in this report, the assessment proposes a comprehensive range of measures designed to inform people of any decisions arising from this report, initiatives to investigate alternative service provision by commercial operators at no cost to the Council, access to funding to meet travel costs and consideration and promotion of public transport ticketing and publicity initiatives.