

# ITEM 4

Time started: 17:17  
Time ended: 20:37

## **CONSERVATION AREA ADVISORY COMMITTEE 16 December 2016**

Present: Maxwell Craven(Chair) – Georgian Group  
Chris Collison – Co-opted Member  
Jeff James – Chamber of Commerce  
Chris Twomey–Royal Institute of British Architects  
John Sharpe - Ancient Monuments Society  
Cllr Dom Anderson – Elected Member  
Cllr Mike Carr – Elected Member

Officers in Attendance: Chloe Oswald  
Penny McKnight  
Clare Harrison

### **29/16 Apologies**

Apologies were received from Councillor Turner, Councillor Wood, Joan D'Arcy, Carol Craven

### **30/16 Late Items to be Introduced by the Chair**

There were no late items.

### **31/16 Declarations of Interest**

There were no declarations of interest.

### **32/16 Confirmation of the Minutes of the Meeting held on 20 October 2016**

Chris Collison pointed out that his name was recorded in the minutes incorrectly with an erroneous 'n' in his last name. The minutes of the meeting held on 20 October 2016 were otherwise agreed as an accurate record.

### **33/16 Appeal Decisions**

There were no appeal decision to report.

**Resolved to note the report.**

## 34/16 CAAC Items Determined since the last meeting

The Committee received an update on previous applications that had been determined since the last report.

**Resolved to note the report.**

## 35/16 Applications not being considered following consultation with the Chair

A report of the Strategic Director of Communities and Place, detailing matters not brought before the committee for comment following consultation with the Chair, was considered.

**Resolved to note the report.**

## 36/16 Former D.R.I Site Pre-application

The committee brought forward an item on the agenda to receive a report of the Strategic Director of Communities and Place to enable the developers to obtain some pre-application advice from the Advisory Committee prior to the developers submitting formal planning permission.

The Committee received a presentation from Andrew Williams, Director of Define, on the proposed DRI development.

Following the presentation members of the Committee discussed the detail and merits of the scheme. The proposed development was generally welcomed, in particular the restoration of both Wilderslowe House and the Osmaston Road properties. However, concerns were raised over the potential loss of both part of the London Road boundary wall proposed for removal and the southern 'Pepper Pot'. The Board suggested that if part of the boundary wall was to be removed this could be reinstated elsewhere around the boundary of the site. The Committee was also keen to see the statue of Florence Nightingale more prominently placed.

**It was resolved to advise the Director of Define that the Committee:**

- 1. Welcomes the scheme as a whole and look forward to seeing the formal application and finer detail under the RMA and listed building applications for Wilderslowe House, the Osmaston Road properties and the boundary wall amendments.**

2. **Would like to see any loss of the London Road boundary wall reinstated elsewhere around the boundary of the site.**
3. **Would regret the loss of the second pair of pepper pot towers and should the application be submitted with this element within it the Committee would object to its removal.**

## 37/16 Applications to be considered

The Committee received a report presented on behalf of the Strategic Director of Communities and Place on the applications requiring consideration by the Committee.

### **No Conservation Area**

**Application No. & Location:** DER/09/16/01103- The First Church of Christ Scientist, Friary Street, Derby, DE1 1JF  
**Proposal:** Change of use from place of worship (Use Class D2) to restaurant (Use Class A3) including an extension and alterations to the south west and south east elevations of the building  
**Expiry Date:** 02/11/2016  
**Listed Building:** GD2

**Application No. & Location:** DER/09/16/01104- The First Church of Christ Scientist, Friary Street, Derby, DE1 1JF  
**Proposal:** Internal and external alterations in association with the change of use from place of worship (Use Class D2) to restaurant (Use Class A3) including an extension and alterations to the south west and south east elevations of the building  
**Expiry Date:** 02/11/2016  
**Listed Building:** GD2

The Committee welcomed the additional information received from developers during the site visit and justifications given for alternations to the building. The only remaining query from the Committee was in relation to the visibility of the flue and freezer/chiller building located to the rear of the building.

**The Committee resolved to amend their previous objection recommendation to no objection, however felt that cladding of the freezer/chiller building with brick and painting of the flue to a dark green or black would benefit the aesthetics of the scheme proposals by limiting the visibility of these elements.**

### **City Centre Conservation Area**

**Application No. & Location:** DER/10/16/01300- Lighting columns on Bold Lane and Jury Street, Derby

**Proposal:** Display of banners on various lighting columns

**Expiry Date:** 23/12/2016

**Listed Building:**

The Committee expressed concern over the display of banners on lighting columns which were included within the conservation area and which would have a negative impact on the listed buildings in the area.

**The Committee resolved to object and recommend refusal as there were strong concerns over the impact of the proposed banners on the character of the conservation area and on the setting of a number of listed buildings in the area.**

**City Centre Conservation Area**

**Application No. &** DER/11/16/01362- 35-36 St. Marys Gate, Derby, DE1 3JU

**Location:**

**Proposal:** Internal alterations to include the installation of six 'pod' en-suite bathrooms and sanitary accommodation to the basement

**Expiry Date:** 09/01/2017

**Listed Building:** G2S

The Committee felt that the new proposals for this listed building were in excess of what would be deemed acceptable and that the proposed alterations would seriously compromise the integrity of this Grade II Listed Building.

**The Committee resolved to object and recommend refusal due to the harm of the alterations to the significance of the listed building in terms of new openings and introduction of bathrooms. Committee felt that there were opportunities for some reinstatement of what was lost and that it would be better to return it to a single residence.**

**City Centre Conservation Area**

**Application No. &** DER/11/16/01424- Assembly Rooms Car Park, Full Street, Derby

**Location:**

**Proposal:** Installation of galvanised mesh security grilles together with entrance doors and entry/exit gates

**Expiry Date:** 24/01/2017

**Listed Building:**

The Committee felt that the security grilles would be visibility intrusive to the area and would do nothing to enhance or preserve the buildings contained within the conservation area.

**The Committee resolved to object and recommend refusal on grounds that it adversely affects the conservation area and does not preserve or enhance it.**

## **Friar Gate Conservation Area**

**Application No. &** DER/09/16/01156- 62 Friar Gate, Derby, DE1 1DJ

**Location:**

**Proposal:** Alterations in connection with change of use from offices (use class B1a) into 3 apartments (use class C3), including removal of internal walls, blocking up of doorways and windows, and provision of stud walling

**Expiry Date:** 02/12/2016

**Listed Building:** GD2

**Application No. &** DER/09/16/01155- 62 Friar Gate, Derby, DE1 1DJ

**Location:**

**Proposal:** Alterations to offices (use class B1a) to form three apartments (use class C3)

**Expiry Date:** 02/12/2016

**Listed Building:** GD2

The Committee felt that amendments to the detail of doorways, partitions and enclosures not included in the previous application would cause excessive intrusive damage to this Listed Building.

**The Committee resolved to object and recommend refusal due to the harm of the alterations to the significance of the listed building in terms of new openings and introduction of bathrooms. Committee felt that there were opportunities for some reinstatement of what was lost and that it would be better to return it to a single residence.**

## **Friar Gate Conservation Area**

**Application No. &** DER/10/16/01200- 48-49 Friar Gate, Derby, DE1 1DF

**Location:**

**Proposal:** Reconfiguring the ground floor layout to provide a new open plan office, kitchen and toilet, opening up the entrance/reception. Reconfiguring of the first and second floors to provide an additional toilet and tea making area. Forming 5 new door openings to provide access between 49 Friar Gate and 48 & 47 Friar Gate across the four floors (two on the ground floor and one on the basement, first and second). Separating 49 Friar Gate from 36 Agard Street. Adapt the existing toilet in the basement to provide a toilet and shower room. Installation of a new air conditioning unit on the rear of the property and sub-division of an office into two on the first and second floor

**Expiry Date:** 07/12/2016

**Listed Building:** G2S

The Committee recognised that the building had already undergone a serious of amendments to allow for the space to be used as office premises, however felt that the alternations should be made in a way that would be sympathetic to the original features of the building and that there was a lack of detail in the application to support this as the proposed course of action. .

**The Committee resolved to object and recommend refusal due to number of new openings harming significance of listed building, unless a statement of significance is submitted with adequate justification for the proposals.**

### **Friar Gate Conservation Area**

**Application No. &** DER/09/16/01129- 38 Friar Gate, Derby, DE1 1DA

**Location:**

**Proposal:** Installation of a pizza oven and extraction flue

**Expiry Date:** 08/12/2016

**Listed Building:** GD2

**The Committee resolved to have no objection to the proposals.**

### **Green Lane & St. Peters Conservation Area**

**Application No. &** DER/11/16/01319- 45-53 Green Lane, Derby, DE1 1RS

**Location:**

**Proposal:** Change of use from amusement centre/nightclub to retail (use class A1) at basement and ground floor level, theatre (sui generis use) at first and second floor level and cafe (use class A3) and gallery (use class D1) in the existing side extension to the building. Alterations to the elevations to include the installation of replacement windows , reinstatement of window openings, towers and pinnacles.

**Expiry Date:** 05/01/2017

**Listed Building:**

**The Committee resolved to welcome and have no objection to the proposals.**

### **Green Lane & St. Peters Conservation Area**

**Application No. &** DER/11/16/01390- 48 St. Peters Street, Derby, DE1 1SR (Greggs)

**Location:**

**Proposal:** Alterations to shopfront to include the installation of a sun blind

**Expiry Date:** 13/01/2017

**Listed Building:**

### **Green Lane & St. Peters Conservation Area**

**Application No. &** DER/11/16/01391- 48 St. Peters Street, Derby, DE1 1SR (Greggs)

**Location:**

**Proposal:** Display of one internally illuminated fascia sign, one internally illuminated projecting sign and two non-illuminated poster signs  
**Expiry Date:** 13/01/2017  
**Listed Building:**

The Committee accepted the principle of the signage change and the blind in principle, but felt that detailed design is inappropriate given that the location of the premises is now within a Conservation Area. The Committee felt that the business could have also taken this as an opportunity to enhance the frontage of the building.

**The Committee resolved to object and recommend refusal unless the proposals for the signs are altered and are non-illuminated.**

### **Green Lane & St. Peters Conservation Area**

**Application No. & Location:** DER/10/16/01291- Land to the rear of St. Peters House, Gower Street, Derby, DE1 (fronting St Peters Churchyard)  
**Proposal:** Erection of five storey 65 bedroom student accommodation  
**Expiry Date:** 15/02/2017  
**Listed Building:**

The Committee felt that the proposal was inappropriate for the conservation area and would seriously and negatively impact on the setting of several other Grade II Listed Buildings in the area.

**The Committee resolved to object and recommend refusal as the proposal harms the character and appearance of the conservation area and the settings of several listed buildings, and builds on an important piece of open space. It was also agreed that the proposal does not preserve or enhance the character and appearance of the conservation area.**

### **Highfield Cottages Conservation Area**

**Application No. & Location:** DER/11/16/01368- Highfield House, Highfield Lane, Chaddesden, Derby, DE21 6PJ  
**Proposal:** Erection of a detached garage and two sections of boundary wall  
**Expiry Date:** 24/01/2017  
**Listed Building:**

**The Committee resolved to make no objections to the proposals.**

### **Nottingham Road Conservation Area**

**Application No. & Location:** DER/10/16/01250- 65-69 Nottingham Road, Derby, DE1 3QS  
**Proposal:** Change of use from offices (use class B1) to eight apartments (use class C3) to include two storey extensions, alteration to the

fenestration and installation of a dormer to the rear elevation

**Expiry Date:** 16/12/2016

**Listed Building:**

Jeff James declared an interest in the Liversage Trust and left the room for the duration of this item.

The Committee felt that the extent of the proposals were inappropriate for the conservation area and if granted, would set an unhealthy precedent for similar proposals. However, the Committee wished to clarify that it is not opposed to the change of use of the building.

**The Committee resolved to object and recommend refusal as the extend of the proposals would cause harm to the conservation area and does not preserve or enhance this.**

### **Others - not in Conservation Areas**

**Application No. &** DER/07/16/00924- Bio House, Derwent Street, Derby, DE1 2ED

**Location:**

**Proposal:** Demolition of existing office buildings and the erection of a new building providing 99 apartments, ground floor retail and car parking, including all supporting accommodation and a new substation.

**Expiry Date:** 28/10/2016

**Listed Building:**

The Committee noted that additional information on the proposals as requested was not provided. The Committee had concerns over the imposing nature of the design of the building and context within the proposed location.

**The Committee resolved to object and recommend refusal due to the adverse impact and harm to the significance of a number of heritage assets close to the proposed location, including listed buildings, locally listed buildings and the City and Nottingham Road conservation areas.**

### **Others - not in Conservation Areas**

**Application No. &** DER/10/16/01241- Unit 7, Northedge Business Park, Alfreton Road,

**Location:** Derby, DE21 4BN

**Proposal:** Development of facilities to enable the testing of a new technology based on a pyrothermic conversion process utilising RDF for a temporary period of 18 months

**Expiry Date:** 14/12/2016

**Listed Building:**



The Committee felt that the proposed structure was not intrusive to its surroundings or skyline and was in keeping with the historical nature of industry located within the area.

**The Committee resolved to recommend no objection to the proposals.**

### **Others - not in Conservation Areas**

**Application No. & Location:** DER/10/16/01285- Garages adjacent Lilac Court, Lilac Close, Alvaston, Derby  
**Proposal:** Erection of three bungalows (use class C3)  
**Expiry Date:** 21/12/2016  
**Listed Building:** GD2

The Committee felt that the proposals would affect the setting of other listed buildings within the area and were inappropriate for the context of the setting.

**The Committee resolved to object and recommend refusal due to the harm to the significance (setting) of the listed buildings. They noted the outline permission and suggested that the proposal be limited to one bungalow or a terrace.**

### **Others - not in Conservation Areas**

**Application No. & Location:** DER/10/16/01228- 25-33 Babington Lane, Derby, DE1 1SX  
**Proposal:** Conversion and change of use of first and second floor to studio flats and the construction of additional floors over to create 81 studio apartments  
**Expiry Date:** 20/01/2017  
**Listed Building:**

The Committee felt that an extension to the building in it's current design would be visually intrusive and would negatively impact on other buildings in the area and on the views towards Normanton Road and the Church.

**The Committee resolved to object and recommend refusal as the proposal has a detrimental impact on the setting of the Green Lane and St Peter's Conservation Area due to its mass and design, and would harm views of the church on Normanton Road, which was highlighted in the Conservation Area Appraisal as a significant view.**

### **Others - not in Conservation Areas**

**Application No. & Location:** DER/07/16/00837- The Audley Centre, 21-33 St. Peters Street & 22-38 East Street, Derby  
**Proposal:** Erection of additional storeys at 21-23 St Peter's Street and 22-36

East Street to provide 48 residential units (use class C3), alterations to the first and second floor elevations and change of use of 21 St Peter's Street from retail (use class A1) to restaurant (use class A3)

**Expiry Date:** 30/01/2017

**Listed Building:**

The Committee felt that the scale, mass, height and form of the proposed development and alterations would be acceptable for the area, but that the quality of proposed building would be insufficient quality in relation to the standard of the conservation area and other listed buildings in the vicinity.

**The Committee resolved to object and recommend refusal on the basis that the detailed design was of insufficient quality and would therefore adversely affect the significance of the nearby listed buildings and the conservation areas in terms of their setting.**

### **Railway Conservation Area**

**Application No. & Location:** DER/11/16/01394- Churnet House, Carrington Street, Derby

**Proposal:** Installation of replacement doors to the front elevation

**Expiry Date:** 18/01/2017

**Listed Building:**

**The Committee resolved to raise no objection to the proposal.**

### **Spondon Conservation Area**

**Application No. & Location:** DER/11/16/01321- Orchard Cottage, 23 Church Street, Spondon, Derby, DE21 7LL

**Proposal:** Two storey side and rear extensions to dwelling house (kitchen/dining area, w.c., bedroom, en-suite and enlargement of bedroom)

**Expiry Date:** 04/01/2017

**Listed Building:**

**The Committee resolved to object and recommend refusal as the proposals would be harmful to the character and appearance of the conservation area due to its mass, form and materials.**

### **Strutt's Park Conservation Area**

**Application No. & Location:** DER/10/16/01237- Claremont, 109 Duffield Road, Derby, DE22 1AE

**Proposal:** Erection of outbuilding (shed)

**Expiry Date:** 15/12/2016

**Listed Building:**

**The Committee resolved to raise no objection to the proposal.**

### **Strutt's Park Conservation Area**

**Application No. &** DER/10/16/01234- Land adjacent to 29 Arthur Street, Derby, DE1

**Location:** 3EF

**Proposal:** Demolition of three garages and erection of two dwelling houses for student accommodation (use class C3)

**Expiry Date:** 30/12/2016

**Listed Building:**

The Committee felt that there was sufficient precedent for this type of development in close vicinity to the site location to deem the proposals acceptable, however were keen to see the inclusion of appropriate features in keeping with other similar buildings in the conservation area.

**The Committee resolved to raise no objection subject to the inclusion of sash windows and appropriate details within the proposals; and to ensure that any issues in relation to the close proximity of chimneys of neighbouring properties are sufficiently resolved.**

### **Strutt's Park Conservation Area**

**Application No. &** DER/10/16/01266- 33 North Parade, Derby, DE1 3AY

**Location:**

**Proposal:** Alterations to the front elevation including replacement windows, door, render and timber cladding

**Expiry Date:** 03/01/2017

**Listed Building:**

**The Committee resolved to raise no objection subject to changes to materials, including the introduction of timber cladding and grey windows out of character with the Conservation Area.**

### **Friar Gate Conservation Area**

**Application No. &** DER/11/16/01354- 63 & 64 Friar Gate, Derby, DE1 1DJ

**Location:**

**Proposal:** Change of use from office (use class B1a) to one residential serviced apartment (use class C3)

**Expiry Date:** 24/01/2017

**Listed Building:** GD2

### **Friar Gate Conservation Area**

**Application No. &** DER/11/16/01355- 63 & 64 Friar Gate, Derby, DE1 1DJ

**Location:**

**Proposal:** Alterations in connection with the change of use from an office (use class B1a) to one residential serviced apartment (use class C3) to include the removal of internal walls and the re-instatement of walls within the original openings

**Expiry Date:** 24/01/2017

**Listed Building:** GD2

**The Committee resolved to raise no objection to the proposals.**

MINUTES END