

ITEM 5

Time commenced – 5.15pm

Time finished – 7.35pm

CONSERVATION AREA ADVISORY COMMITTEE 7 DECEMBER 2006

Present: Mr M Craven (Victorian Society) (in the Chair)
Councillors Care, Rawson, Travis and Turner
Mr D Armstrong (Co-opted)
Mrs J D'arcy (Derby Archaeological Society)
Mrs A Hutchinson (Derby Civic Society)
Mr J James (Chamber of Commerce)
Mr M Mallender (Co-opted)
Mr B Wyatt (RIBA)
Mr N Consterdine (Derby Civic Society)
Mr C Glenn

City Council Officers:

Mr H Hopkinson (Regeneration and Community)
Miss G Barlow (Democratic Services)
Mrs D Maltby (Regeneration and Community)

40/06 Apologies

Apologies were received from Councillor Smalley, Mrs Craven, Mr Sharpe, Mr Wyatt and Mr Bilson.

41/06 Late Items Introduced by the Chair

In accordance with Section 100(B)(4) of the Local Government Act 1972, the Chair agreed to admit the following item on the grounds that advice was required from the Committee before the next scheduled meeting of the Committee:

Code No. DER/1006/1660 – Formation of car parking area and incorporation of land into curtilage of apartments, Amber House, Railway Terrace, Derby

The Committee had no objection in principle subject to the wall and copings being of appropriate design and using traditional materials to match the existing historic building.

No. 4 Bold Lane

The Committee noted that this proposal had come to the meeting for pre-application advice, and concluded that no objection would be raised to this

proposal provided that a condition to time limit the display of the hoardings was applied.

42/06 Declarations of Interest

Mr Mallender and Mr Craven declared personal prejudicial interests in applications DER/1006/1740 – Alterations to Cathedral to provide window guards, Derby Cathedral Church of All Saints, Iron Gate and DER/806/1384 – Formation of parking spaces, St Mary's Bridge/Sowter Road.

43/06 Minutes of the Previous Meeting

The minutes of the meeting held on 2 November 2006 were confirmed as a correct record and signed by the Chair.

44/06 Report on Applications Determined Since the Last Report

The Committee received an update on previous applications that had been determined since the last report.

45/06 Committee Report

The Committee considered a report of the Assistant Director – Development, concerning applications received and resolved to make the following comments:

City Centre Conservation Area

- a) Code No DER/1006/1645 – Amendment to previously approved permission DER/506/765 to form additional 3 apartments, 15-16 Market Place

The Committee recommend refusal on the grounds that the extension at roof level in the form proposed, would be visually dominant & overbearing and would seriously detract from the skyline/eaves silhouette to the serious detriment of the appearance/character of the Conservation Area.

- b) Code No DER/1106/1873 - Alterations and extensions to form hotel, 16 Code No DER/1106/1872 St Mary's Gate

The Committee recommended refusal on the grounds that the proposed alterations/extensions to the annex building (the fourth floor and the stairwell) were of an inappropriate design/materials which would appear as incongruous and discordant features that would be seriously harmful to the historic/architectural character of this grade II listed building and to the setting of the adjacent grade II listed Judges Lodgings. These alterations/extensions

would also have a detrimental impact on the broader street scene to the detriment of the appearance/character of the Conservation Area. Notwithstanding this objection to these particular elements of the scheme, the Committee was supportive of the principle of the change of use/conversion of the main listed building to a hotel subject to the details being to the satisfaction of the Councils Conservation Officer.

- c) Code No DER/1006/1671 – Change of use from financial and professional services (use class A2) to bar/restaurant, Century House, 6 Bold Lane

The Committee had no objection subject to there being no implied approval to any future external alterations to the premises.

- d) Code No DER/1006/1740 – Alterations to Cathedral to provide window guards, Derby Cathedral Church of All Saints, Iron Gate

The Committee raised no objection.

- e) Code No DER/706/1789 - Display of internally illuminated projecting signs & 2 fascia signs. 43 Iron Gate, Derby (Lloyds TSB).

The Committee raised no objection to the submitted proposal on the basis of the existing signage display although the Committee expressed a strong preference that the hanging projecting signs be non-illuminated board signs rather than internally-illuminated box signs.

Friar Gate Conservation Area

- f) Code No DER/1006/1742 - Retention of use of building for training and medical aesthetic use at Unit 4 Wentworth House, Vernon Gate, South Street

The Committee raised no objection.

- g) Code No DER/1106/1794 - Alterations to elevations to include Formation of new side entrance, building of 2nd floor walls and bricking up of windows and alteration to front access at 110 Friar Gate, (Mosh Nightclub)

The Committee recommended refusal on the grounds that the proposed alterations to the front shop entrance would result in the unjustified loss of historic fabric/character which, together with the reduction in the depth of the recessed doorway, would erode the traditional character of this part of the Conservation Area.

- h) Code No DER/1006/1749 – Change of use to MOT testing centre, The Arch, 14 Agard Street

The Committee raised no objection.

- i) Code No DER/1006/1708 – Installation of a shop front, 19-20 Friar Gate, Fat Cat Bar

The Committee raised no objection to the amended plan.

- j) Code No DER/1006/1709 – Extensions to bar, first floor terrace and staircase 19-20 Friar Gate, Fat Cat Bar

- k) Code No DER/1006/1710 – Extensions to bar, first floor terrace and staircase with light well, demolition of roof at rear, and installation of shop front, internal alterations to relocate toilets from ground floor to first floor, 19-20 Friar Gate, Fat Cat Bar

The Committee recommended refusal on the grounds that the proposed alterations involving the relocation of the wc provision to the first floor would have a seriously unjustified impact on the internal historic fabric and character of the listed building.

Mickleover Conservation Area

- l) Code No DER/1106/1687 – Erection of a bungalow on land adjacent to 9 The Hollow, Mickleover, access off Ingham Drive

The Committee raised no objection.

Railway Conservation Area

- m) Code No: DER/1006/1683– Wyvern House, Railway Terrace Formation of 18 apartments

The Committee raised no objection subject to the details being to the satisfaction of the Councils Conservation Officer.

Spondon Conservation Area

- n) Code No: DER/1006/1673 – Extension to dwelling house (garden, two bedrooms and bathroom) and erection of garden room, 5 Porter Place, Spondon

The Committee raised no objection.

- o) Code No DER/1006/1568 - Extension to School (Classroom, Toilets, Cloakroom and P.E. Store) St. Werburgh's, C of E School, Church Street, Spondon.

The Committee raised no objection.

Strutts Park Conservation Area

- p) Code No. DER/1006/1587 - Retention of side and rear elevation windows and retention of lobby to rear of listed building 50 Kedleston Road

The Committee recommended refusal on the grounds that the modern casement windows and the flat-roofed extension are wholly inappropriate to this grade II listed building and seriously detract from the traditional historic/architectural character of the building.

- q) Code No DER/1006/1646 – Extension to dwelling house, (2 bathrooms), 53 Arthur Street

The Committee recommended refusal on the grounds that the two storey extension to the rear out-rigger would disturb the strong rhythm of the rear elevation of this terrace of dwellings that is highly visible from the adjacent Milford Street and which forms an important element to the character of the Conservation Area. It was noted that the first floor extension was to enable a second bedroom to the upper-floor flat and it was considered that this was therefore an unwarranted extension that did not justify the harm it would cause to the Conservation Area.

Others

- r) Code No DER/806/1384 - Formation of parking spaces, St Mary's Bridge/Sowter Road

The Committee recommended refusal on the grounds that the parking of vehicles on the proposed car parking area would seriously detract from the setting of the grade II listed building. Whilst it was noted that the car park was to be formed simply by the reinforcement of the existing grassed surface, it was felt that the lack of any definition of the perimeter of the car park would lead to vehicles trespassing over the remainder of the grass verge or to the future provision of some form of perimeter definition.

- s) Code No DER/1106/1802 - Alterations to the Roundhouse group to form college, with new linking building, freestanding college building, day nursery, access, parking and landscaping.

- t) Code No DER/1106/1803 - Demolition of parts of former railway workshops and alterations to retained buildings. Both at the Roundhouse, Roundhouse Road, Pride Park

The Committee expressed a desire to undertake a site visit in order to fully appreciate the issues involved in this complex proposal. Notwithstanding this, the Committee generally welcomed this proposal to bring about the renovation and reuse of this complex of listed buildings that have been severely at risk for many years. The Committee expressed reservations over the demolition proposals but was of the view that these may be justified within the broader context of the overall scheme. It was felt that the proposed link building was of an inappropriate design being too elaborate/detailed without sufficient simple industrial character. It was considered that a more simple, robust design that reflected the strong rhythm of the listed railway buildings would be a more appropriate form of contemporary architecture in this instance. The Committee had similar concerns re the proposed new building at the northern corner of the site. With regard to the treatment of the external areas, the Committee considered the proposals illustrated on the submitted plans to be inappropriate due to the amount of "soft" landscaping and the vertical elements created by the green walls and the raised grassed areas. It was considered that a more simple hard-paving scheme that reflected the past railway use of the site, should be sought. The Committee was mindful of the complexity of the proposal and recommended that all details relating to alteration, repair and refurbishment of the listed buildings be to the complete satisfaction of the Councils Conservation Officer.

- u) Code No DER/806/1333 – Erection of fence, 339 Duffield Road/Church Walk (Shell Service Station), Allestree

The Committee recommended refusal on the grounds that the proposed infill timber fence would detract from the setting of the Conservation Area. The Committee noted its previous recommendation in respect of this proposal and suggested that the remaining brick wall simply needs to be fully reinstated to provide an appropriate and traditional boundary feature to Church Walk.

- v) Code No DER/1106/1682 – Alterations to listed building to change use from joinery workshop to training centres for construction trainees, former engine house, Great Northern Road

The Committee raised no objection.

Minutes End