



DERBY CITY COUNCIL

SCRUTINY MANAGEMENT COMMISSION 20 APRIL 2006

Report of the Chair of the Scrutiny Management Commission

Proposal to Change the Structure of the Overview and Scrutiny Commissions

RECOMMENDATION

1. That the Scrutiny Management Commission consider and comment on the proposed structure of the Overview and Scrutiny Commissions.

SUPPORTING INFORMATION

- 2.1 The review of the Council's scrutiny arrangements that was carried out by the Scrutiny Management Commission in 2004/05, suggested that there would be benefit in reducing the number of Overview and Scrutiny Commissions. However, the proposals contained in the report were not agreed at the Annual Meeting of the Council in May 2005, and the six Commissions were retained for 2005/06.
- 2.2 The retention of the six Commissions has perpetuated the problems that were identified in the review of scrutiny. In particular it is considered that there are problems associated with mismatch of Commission portfolios with those of the Council Cabinet. This has always caused some difficulties both for the Commissions and the Cabinet members. However the introduction during the past year of Cabinet Member meetings has increased the workload of Chairs and Vice Chairs and with the current arrangement means that some of them may find that each cycle they are invited to attend four or five additional meetings with Cabinet members.
- 2.3 In order to address these problems I met recently with Cabinet members to discuss the ways in which the present six Commission structure might be changed to improve the match between Cabinet and Commission portfolios and where possible to reduce the workload of members.

- 2.4 As a consequence of that meeting I suggest that one way forward might be to reduce the number of Commissions from six to five and to revise the Commission portfolios so that they correspond to the existing Cabinet portfolios. In practice this might give the following structure:

Commission	Cabinet Portfolios
Corporate and Neighbourhood Commission	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Corporate Policy • Community Services, Regeneration and E-Government
City Life Commission	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Personnel, Performance Management and Economic Development • Leisure and Cultural Services
Planning Transportation and Environment Commission	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Environment and Direct Services • Planning and Transportation
Children and Young People's Commission	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Children's and Education Services
Health and Housing Commission	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Adult Services • Housing and Social Inclusion

Appendix 2 of this report gives full details of the portfolios of the proposed Commissions.

- 2.5 Under this structure I envisage that the Corporate and Neighbourhood Commission would have a co-ordinating role. Its membership would comprise its own Chair and Vice Chair together with the Chairs and Vice Chairs of the other four Commissions. There would be no requirement for a separate Corporate Parenting Sub Commission as this role would be undertaken by the Children and Young People's Commission.
- 2.6 I believe that the Constitution should specifically require that the Commission carrying out the co-ordination role (currently the Scrutiny Management Commission) should comprise its own Chair and Vice Chair together with the Chairs and Vice Chairs of the other Commissions. This is not currently the case and we presently have a Chair and Vice Chair who are not members of the Scrutiny Management Commission.
- 2.7 I invite Scrutiny Management Commission to consider and comment upon my proposed Overview and Scrutiny structure. If the Commission are in agreement with the proposals I intend to submit a report on the proposed restructuring of the Overview and Scrutiny Commissions to the Annual Meeting of the Council on 24 May 2006.

<p>For more information contact:</p> <p>Background papers:</p> <p>List of appendices:</p>	<p>Councillor Alan Graves e-mail alan.graves@derby.gov.uk</p> <p>Appendix 1 – Implications</p> <p>Appendix 2 - Proposed Commission Portfolios</p>
--	---

IMPLICATIONS

Financial

1. None arising from this report.

Legal

- 2.1 If the proposals are approved it will be necessary under the so-called Widdicombe Rules to ensure that the political balance on each Commission reflects as far as is practicable the political balance of the Council. It is desirable that all non-Cabinet members are able to serve on at least one Commission. In order to make sure that this happens for Opposition Groups, the size of the Commissions would have to be increased. However, this would mean that non-Council Cabinet members of the Controlling Group (currently 16 or 17 members) would each have to serve on two or three Commissions
- 2.2 Rule OS6 of the Constitution requires the Overview and Scrutiny Commission dealing with education matters to include in its membership the following voting representatives:
 - 1 Church of England diocese representative
 - 1 Roman Catholic diocese representative
 - 2 parent governor representatives
 - 1 representative of other faiths or denominations

Under the current scrutiny structure with a separate Education Commission these statutory co-opted members attend and can take part in the whole Commission meeting.

Under the proposed structure the work currently carried out by the Education Commission would form part of the larger and more diverse Commission for Children and Young People. There would still be a statutory requirement to appoint these co-optees to the Commission but unless they were co-opted as members of the whole Commission for Children and Young People, they would only be able to take part in the business of the Commission that related specifically to education matters.

Personnel

3. A reduction in the number of Overview and Scrutiny Commissions will reduce pressures on support Officers and enable the OSCers to manage their workload more effectively.

Equalities impact

4. Effective scrutiny is of benefit to all Derby people.

Corporate Objectives, Values and Priorities

5. This report has the potential to link to all the Council's Corporate Objectives, Values and Priorities

Appendix 2

Corporate & Neighbourhood Commission	
<p>Corporate Policy Corporate Council Policies and Strategies, including Community Strategy Corporate Finance and Financial Services, including Taxation Corporate Legal and Administrative Services Corporate Communications, including Derby Pointer Community Consultation Customer Services Sub Regional Strategic Partnership Derby City Partnership Local Area Agreement External Affairs – European, National, Regional and Local Mayoral Office/Electoral Issues/Registrars Emergency Planning</p>	<p>Community Services, Regeneration, and E-Government Area and Neighbourhood Co-ordination, including Area Panels Community Development Community Safety Partnership Neighbourhood Renewal Strategy External Regeneration Funding New Deal for Communities Equality Grants E-Government Computer Services/Development Telecommunications</p>
City Life Commission	
<p>Personnel, Performance Management and Economic Development Performance Management Best Value functions and Best Value Performance Plan Corporate Personnel and Equalities Economic Development and Tourism, including External Employment Initiatives Estates/Property Services including Markets Building Design Services and Repair and Maintenance Health and Safety Members Services/Allowances</p>	<p>Leisure and Cultural Services Arts and Libraries Assembly Rooms/Guildhall Museums/Art Gallery Festivities Outdoor Events Leisure Centres and Coaching Parks and Allotments, including Client Grounds Maintenance Sports including Grants</p>
Planning, Transportation & Environment Commission	
<p>Environment and Direct Services Local Agenda 21 Strategy, Environment Co-ordination and Initiatives Environmental Health and Trading Standards Grounds Maintenance Client – Street Cleaning/Waste Collection and Disposal/Public Conveniences Recycling Land Drainage Energy Conservation City Centre and Neighbourhood Horticultural Features All Direct Services Non-Highway Engineering Cemeteries and Crematorium</p>	<p>Planning and Transportation Strategic Planning and Transportation Planning and Building Control Footpaths, Highways and Maintenance, Car Parks Roads – Engineering and Design Services Car Parking Strategy and Client Highways Property Administration City Centre Management</p>

Commission for Children and Young People

Children's and Education Services
--

Schools, including Repairs and Maintenance Centrally funded Schools Services, including Special Needs Access Support, including Ethnic Minority Achievement Grant Adult Education Mandatory and Discretionary Education Awards Children and Family Services Social Services Support Services Health Services Partnerships – Children Early Years Play Development
--

Health & Housing Commission
--

Adult Services	Housing and Social Inclusion
-----------------------	-------------------------------------

Adult Social Services Assessment and Care Planning Health Improvement Planning Health Services Partnerships - Adults Mandatory and Discretionary Awards (Excluding Education Awards) Community Centres Community Grants Youth Service	Housing Management Client Housing Strategy and Development Private Sector Housing Housing Options, including Homelessness Supporting People Social Cohesion Housing and Council Tax Benefits Derby Advice Service Community Legal Services Partnership
---	--

Health Scrutiny will be carried out by this Commission
--