

ITEM 04

Time Commenced: 17:15
Time Finished: 19:17

CONSERVATION AREA ADVISORY COMMITTEE 05 December 2019

Present: Chris Collison (Chair)
Chris Twomey, (Vice Chair) RIBA
Maxwell Craven – Georgian Society
Carole Craven – Georgian Group
Joan D'Arcy - Derbyshire Archaeological Society
Cllr Mike Carr – Elected Member
Cllr Jack Stanton – Elected Member
Cllr Robin Wood – Elected Member

Officers in Attendance Chloe Oswald, Conservation and Urban Design Team
Leader

Jenny Nightingale, Planning Officer
Rachel North, Strategic Director Communities and Place
Verna Bayliss, Acting Director of Planning and
Transportation
Richard Carruthers, Senior Planning Officer
Andy Waterhouse, Spatial Planning Group Manager
Stephen Bate, Senior Planning Officer

35/19 Apologies

Apologies were received from Ian Goodwin, Derby Civic Society, David Ling, Derby Civic Society, Paul McLocklin, Chamber of Commerce, John Sharpe – Ancient Monuments Society

36/19 Late Items to be introduced by the Chair

There were no late items.

37/19 Declarations of Interest

There were no Declarations of Interest.

38/19 Confirmation of the Minutes of the Meeting held on 17 October 2019

The minutes of the meeting held on 17 October 2019 were agreed as an accurate record.

39/19 Tall Building Strategy Update

Matthias Wunderlich, from Urban Initiatives attended CAAC to give a presentation on the Tall Building Strategy. The Committee noted that two stakeholder workshops had taken place to present the early work on the strategy. Positive feedback had been received from the second workshop but concerns were raised about the level of detail of the final strategy and policy.

Objectives for Tall Buildings include:

- support intensification of central areas with high transport accessibility
- conform with a plan-led approach to place making
- fulfil a clear purpose either providing a landmark or clustering in areas that can accommodate high density and animation
- avoid harm to designated heritage assets and their setting
- integrate well with the existing townscape and enhance local character
- preserve and enhance sensitive views of townscape and skyline and contribute to an attractive and distinct city image
- support delivery of high standard living environments
- deliver the highest quality of urban and architectural design

An initial sifting of areas considered public transport accessibility and identified areas of highest sensitivity to Tall Buildings.

The existing height of the City Centre was mapped to establish local context heights. Tall Buildings were defined as Local Landmarks, being 2 to 3 times context heights, and District Landmarks, being 3 to 5 times context heights.

The potential for Tall Buildings in each of the character areas of the City Centre was examined. Potential locations that are either 'landmark' gateway sites or mark key regeneration areas were identified. Heritage sensitivity testing identified sensitive locations that will need specific scrutiny and this led to exclusion of sites east of the Railway Station and on Friar Gate Goods Yard.

Skyline views were also mapped focusing on specific landmarks; most concentrated on the Cathedral. Views were identified which would need particular scrutiny and visual testing. Iterative testing took place using the 3D model. Tall Buildings were placed with heights appropriate to role and context, and their impact on the surrounding area was tested.

The conclusions for character areas were:

- Historic City Centre – this was essentially excluded for Tall Buildings. Any development should be limited to sensitive intensification and infill with a general height of 4-5 storeys.
- Intu and St Peter's Quarter – increased pressure of change due to changing retail patterns. Tall buildings could be included in the opportunity to redevelop Eagle Market and perform the role of landmarks on the bus station, London Road and Babington Lane gateways as well as emphasise the Becket Well regeneration site but need to respond sensitively to surrounding heritage assets and skyline views.
- Derby Riverside – The river front is underutilised and it would provide a major regeneration opportunity to animate the City. Tall Buildings could form part of a new character for the River Gardens and Meadow Road areas, and there is a 'cluster opportunity' centred at the junction of East Gate and the Ring Road stepping down height towards the World Heritage Site and the waterfront. It was advised that more detailed masterplanning would need to be undertaken.
- Castle Ward – this area has potential for transformation into a mixed-use neighbourhood where tall buildings could perform the role of landmarks at gateways on the Ring Road and at key locations near it.
- Western Fringe – this area was fragmented and lacks a clear sense of place. Tall Buildings could perform the role of landmarks at gateways.
- Northern Fringe – A defined and continuous frontage development along the ring road could be established. Each gateway is already distinctive and tall buildings would detract from views to the Cathedral which is not justified. There is potential for 4-5 storey urban living including a student village.
- Derby Station Area – The arrival experience lacks a sense of welcome and also direction on how to reach the City Centre. A tall building could function to mark the gateway into the city centre.

Committee resolved to note the presentation and comment as follows:

- 1. The Committee strongly supported the conclusion that there is no role for new tall buildings in the Historic City Centre and considered that the Cathedral should be the most dominant and largest building in the historic area although there were other historic buildings with distinctive decorative roof shapes that were important including the Silk Mill, Guildhall tower, Former Central Library, St Werburgh's Church, St Mary's Church etc.**

2. The Committee considered it is essential the height of developments in the Riverside area should step down to respect the World Heritage Site.
3. The Committee felt it important that proposals for the Becket Well regeneration site need to respond sensitively to surrounding heritage assets and skyline views.
4. The Committee did not consider it necessary to have tall buildings mark the gateway into the City Centre in the Derby Station area and that such a proposal could not be supported due to adverse impact on the designated Conservation Area and nearby listed buildings in that location.
5. The Committee felt it essential that the Tall Buildings Strategy should emphasise the need for high quality of development. Tall Buildings in any location should be integrated into and enhance the surrounding area. Given their inevitable prominence Tall Buildings should be of the highest quality in terms of building style/detailed design and materials used. It was suggested that some form of competition could be used to attract suitable potential designs and that a Design Panel could fulfil an important role. Tall buildings need to be proportionate and in scale with the local area and they should also be environmentally sustainable. Landmarks do not always have to be tall but they do have to be brilliant examples of high quality well-designed buildings.

40/19 CAAC Items Determined since last agenda

The Committee received an update on previous applications that had been determined since the last report.

Resolved to note the report.

41/19 Applications not being considered following consultation with the Chair

A report of the Strategic Director of Communities and Place, detailing matters not brought before the committee for comment following consultation with the Chair, was considered.

Resolved to note the report.

42/19 Applications to be considered

The committee received a report presented on behalf of the Strategic Director of Communities and Place on the applications requiring consideration by the Committee.

Green Lane and St Peter's Conservation Area

Application No. & 19/01245/OUT

Location: "Becketwell" Land off Victoria Street, Green Lane, Macklin Street, Becket Street, Colyear Street and Becketwell Lane, Derby

Proposal: Hybrid application for: Outline Planning Permission – Phased demolition of buildings (with the exception of those fronting Green Lane and the former stable block to the rear of Green Lane) and structures, and the erection of a phased mixed-use development (Classes A1, A2, A3, A4, A5, B1, C3, D1, D2 and sui generis), with all matters reserved for future consideration with the exception of access.
Full Planning Permission – Demolition of buildings (former Debenhams building, United Reform Church, and associated ground floor units) and the erection of two buildings for residential use (Class C3), including 342 apartments with flexible commercial space (Classes A1, A2, A3, A4, A5 B1(a), D1, D2) at ground floor level, with access, car parking, servicing and the creation of a new public square with associated works.

Resolved: To object, detailed objections previously submitted still stand. Committee Members considered that the amendments are superficial with no reference to the previous objections made. See previous comments below for reference:

1. The proposals are entirely inappropriate and will cause significant irreparable harm to the historic core of Derby City Centre.

The National Planning Policy Framework requires permission to be refused for development of poor design that fails to take opportunities for improving the character and quality of an area. National policy requires developments to be sympathetic to an area's prevailing local character and history. Great weight should be given to the conservation of designated heritage assets and their setting in a manner appropriate to their significance.

The proposals fail to have regard for these elements of national policy. The development is far too high; completely out of context; and would represent a lasting hindrance to successful regeneration of the locality. At 19 storeys this speculative proposal would detrimentally compromise the City's important historic skyline and block south light from one of the City's most important and impressive streets. The new buildings would cause irreversible harm to the setting of adjacent Statutory Conservation Areas and many Statutorily Listed Buildings, most importantly the former Royal Hotel and Athenaeum (Robert Wallace 1837-1839 LGII), the former Corporation Tramways Offices (Alexander MacPherson of

Nottingham 1904 LGII), and the former Head Post Office (James Williams 1868, 1871, 1883; Sir Henry Tanner 1898, 1904 & David Nicholas Dyke 1934, LGII) as well as those in The Strand, St. James Street corner and in The Wardwick, east end, as set out in Section 66 (1) of the 1990 Act and subsequent advice in the National Planning Policy Framework and Planning Practice Guidance.

2. The proposal is partial.

Consideration should be postponed until a comprehensive scheme for the entire site has been prepared. It is unacceptable that only phase one should be put forward in detail because: (i) it is highly contentious in its detrimental townscape terms, and (ii) the danger is that, having taken their profit the applicant will offload the remainder of the site unbuilt, and a huge opportunity will be lost. The impression being given currently is that what is being sought is merely an opportunist profit-driven scheme and not part of a positive, coordinated, sustainable, well-thought out scheme that will enhance the City. There are alternative ways to secure 300 plus housing units in a compact development of appropriate density without building an eyesore tower that will blight the City for decades.

3. Additional Issues

- a. Consideration should be postponed until the City's Tall Buildings Strategy has been approved later in the year. The impression currently being given is that the applicant is aware of this timing and has submitted an application with the aim of obtaining consent in advance of this happening.
- b. CAAC would wish to be made aware of Historic England's view before passing final judgement upon a scheme of this size and potentially damaging impact on the historic environment.
- c. The proposal is lacking in essential detail. Consideration of the proposals should be withheld until such time as consent for the adaptation of Stuart House, Green Lane as a new URC church is obtained, and clarification is obtained concerning the historic stained glass and other relics now incorporated into the present URC structure in Victoria Street.
- d. The proposal represents inappropriate response to community input. It is disappointing none of the objections and positive suggestions, raised by CAAC with the proposers, have been addressed.
- e. There should be no demolition prior to approval of a detailed scheme of sufficient quality to enhance the designated heritage assets, and a statement of assurance is submitted that demonstrates the scheme is viable and deliverable, and will proceed.
- f. The scheme should adopt a sustainable energy-conscious approach based on renovation (modification including re-frontings) wherever possible, rather than replacement.
- g. Archaeology has been inadequately investigated
- h. The scheme is inward looking and fails to recognise the potential to have regard for important buildings adjacent to the application site, in particular the Grade II

Listed Building Hippodrome site.

- i. There is inadequate consideration of views both into and out of the site.

Other Conservation Area

Application No. & 19/01582FUL

Location: Fireplace Workshop, Wyvern Way, Derby DE21 6PS

Proposal: Demolition of existing retail unit. Erection of a retail unit (use Class A1), landscaping, revised parking and access and associated works.

Resolved: To object

Although the Committee Members acknowledged that amendments have been made, in respect of the reduction in unit numbers and siting of the building, they considered that all previous objections still stand. See previous comments below:

DER/12/17/01643 - The Fireplace Workshop Ltd, Wyvern Way, Chaddesden, Derby
Proposal: Demolition of existing retail unit. Erection of retail units (use class A1) with ancillary cafe, a restaurant (use class A3/A5) with 'drive thru' facility together with landscaping, revised parking and access and associated works

Listed Building:

Object and recommend refusal: CAAC felt that the former railway workshop building was an attractive and prominent building worth saving. They felt this building was a reminder of the heritage of Chaddesden sidings and strongly considered this to be a landmark heritage asset at the gateway to Derby. They felt the building could be restored and usefully incorporated in any development. Proposed layout needs revising, with more imaginative solution to restore and redevelop the building. This is a non-designated heritage asset but under para 135 of the NPPF this needs to be considered when undertaking the planning balance exercise.

City Centre Conservation Area

Application No. & 19/01632/FUL

Location: 27-32 Victoria Street, Derby DE1 1ES

Proposal: Change of use of upper floors to student accommodation (34 self contained units) and part of basement to ancillary cycle store.

Resolved: No objection in principle however, Committee Members recommend that Officers explore the possibility of improvements to the ground floor front elevation and signage.

Friar Gate Conservation Area

Application No. & 19/01641/FUL

Location: Land Adjacent to 73 Friar Gate, Derby, DE1 1FN

Proposal: Demolition of social club outbuilding. Erection of six apartments (Use Class C3).

Resolved: To object

Committee Members considered the proposal to be inappropriate, failing to enhance the existing Conservation Area. The proposal was without merit and fails to be sympathetic and would be detrimental to the Listed Building in the vicinity of the site. It was suggested that the building could be relocated further forward on the site.

Minutes End