



## COUNCIL CABINET 26 APRIL 2005

Report of the Leader and Deputy Leader of the Council

### **The Review of the Council's Overview and Scrutiny Function – Proposals for a Revised Structure**

#### **RECOMMENDATION**

- 1.1 To commend the Scrutiny Management Commission for its work in reviewing the current overview and scrutiny function, including options for reform.
- 1.2 To recommend Council to agree:
  - a) to adopt the scrutiny structure set out in Option 3b of the Commission's report
  - b) to approve the terms of reference of a four commission overview and scrutiny structure

#### **SUPPORTING INFORMATION**

- 2.1 We have considered the draft report on the Review of Derby City Council's Overview and Scrutiny function that the Scrutiny Management Commission has circulated to all members of the City Council.
- 2.2 We note that the IDeA facilitated workshop held on 22 January 2005 and attended by most Cabinet members, concluded that the overview and scrutiny commissions should have greater focus and provide greater support to the Council in delivering its priorities. It was also concluded that there was a need for an open and frank examination of the scrutiny commission structure to ensure it is fit for purpose.
- 2.3 We believe that the current six commission structure is too unwieldy and produces too many formal and informal meetings. This means that the time and energy of members is stretched too thinly and they are not able to undertake their scrutiny and policy review work as effectively as they might. The restricted availability of some members in the daytime and the demands of the Council's new licensing responsibilities contribute to these difficulties.

- 2.4 A smaller number of commissions, each with a cross cutting set of functions, would result in fewer meetings. This would free up members time to concentrate on more focussed, better quality, policy reviews and/or in-depth scrutiny reviews.
- 2.5 We are sure that the rest of the Council Cabinet would join us in emphasising our wish to work constructively with the overview and scrutiny commissions to the benefit of the Council and the citizens of Derby. We believe the Commissions play an important role in making the Council's decision-making effective and accountable.
- 2.6 For these reasons we are of the opinion that a scrutiny structure of the form shown in Option 3b of the Review of Scrutiny report would best meet the needs of the Council.
- 2.7 Appendix 2 of this report details some possible portfolio groupings for a four commission scrutiny structure of the form shown in Option 3b. We invite Council Cabinet to express a preference for one of these portfolio groupings, or for a different grouping.
- 2.8 An Internet trawl has shown that both Tameside and Trafford Metropolitan Borough Councils have overview and scrutiny structures that comprise four commissions or their equivalents. To provide additional information a comparison of the overview and scrutiny arrangements of these local authorities with Derby is shown in Appendix 3. If it is wished, arrangements can be made to visit these authorities to discuss their experience of operating a four commission overview and scrutiny structure.

**For more information contact:**

**Background papers:**

**List of appendices:**

Appendix 1 – Implications

Appendix 2 – Possible Commission portfolios for a scrutiny structure of the form shown in Option 3b of the Review of Scrutiny report

Appendix 3 – Comparison of Tameside and Trafford with Derby

<b>IMPLICATIONS</b>
---------------------

**Financial**

1. None arising from this report.

**Legal**

2. None arising from this report.

**Personnel**

3. None arising from this report.

**Equalities impact**

4. Effective scrutiny will be of benefit to all Derby people.

**Corporate Objectives, Values and Priorities**

This report has the potential to link to all the Council's Objectives, Values and Priorities.

## Appendix 2

### Possible Four Commission Structure – Option 1

<p><b>Central Functions and Co-ordination Commission</b>  Corporate Council policies and strategies  Corporate Legal, Administrative, Estates/Property Services and Repair and Maintenance  Chief Executive's Policy, European, Best Value and Communications functions  Corporate Finance and Financial Services including Taxation  External Affairs – European, National, Regional and Local  Democratic Representation  Mayoral Office/Electoral Issues/Registrars  Best Value Performance Plan and Derby Pointer  Members Services/Allowances  Corporate Personnel, Recruitment and Training functions and issues  Employment training  Health and Safety  Corporate Equality Functions and Issues  E-government, IT services/development and telecommunications  Repairs and Maintenance Programmes  Design Services  Emergency Planning</p> <p><i>Community Governance and Consultation  Community Regeneration and Development, including Community Planning  Special Programmes Management including all Single Regeneration Budget Schemes  New Deal for Communities</i></p>	<p>Retained from Scrutiny Management Commission portfolio</p> <p>Transferred from Community Regeneration Commission portfolio</p>
<p><b>Education Sport and Leisure Commission</b>  Schools  Centrally Funded School Services, including Special Needs  Youth Service  Adult Education  Mandatory and Discretionary Awards  Access Support, including Ethnic Minority Achievement Grant  (Role of Education Evaluation Panel)</p> <p><i>Community Centres and Council Activity Centres  Arts and Libraries  Assembly Rooms/Guildhall  Museums/Art Gallery  Outdoor events  Sports and Play including Grants  Leisure Centres and Coaching</i></p>	<p>Retained from Education Commission portfolio</p> <p>Transferred from Culture and Prosperity Commission portfolio</p>

<p><i>Tourism and Tourist Information Centre Festivities</i></p> <p><i>Cultural Diversity</i> <i>Community and Equalities Grants</i> <i>External Employment Initiatives</i></p>	Transferred from Community Regeneration Commission portfolio
<p><b>Housing, Health and Welfare Commission</b> Children and Family Services Corporate Parenting Adult Services Assessment and Care Planning Social Services Support Services Health Improvement Planning Health Services</p> <p><i>Housing and Council Tax Benefits</i> <i>Welfare Rights</i> <i>Community Legal Services including Law Centre and Citizens Advice Bureau Crime and Disorder, including Youth Offending Service</i> <i>Housing Management</i> <i>Housing Strategy and Development</i> <i>Private Sector Housing</i> <i>Social Inclusion, including Anti-Poverty initiatives</i></p> <p><i>Environmental Health and Trading Standards</i></p>	<p>Retained from Social Care and Health portfolio</p> <p>Transferred from Culture and Prosperity Commission portfolio</p> <p>Transferred from Planning and Environment Commission portfolio</p>
<p><b>Planning, Environment and Transportation Commission</b> Strategic Planning, including Traffic and Transportation Development Control and Building Control Footpaths, Highways and Maintenance, Car Parks Roads - Engineering and Design Service Highways Property Administration City Centre Management Licensing policy issues - Taxis/Entertainment etc Local Agenda 21 Strategy, Environmental Co-ordination and Initiatives Outdoor Amenities Client - Street Cleaning/Waste Collection and Disposal/Conveniences Recycling Land Drainage Energy Conservation Building cleaning All Direct Services Non-Highway Engineering Cemeteries and Crematorium</p> <p><i>Economic Development</i> <i>Parks and Allotments, including Client Grounds Maintenance</i></p> <p><i>Concessionary Fares</i></p>	<p>Retained from Planning and Environment Commission portfolio</p> <p>Transferred from Culture and Prosperity Commission portfolio</p> <p>Transferred from Scrutiny Management Commission portfolio</p>

## **Possible Four Commission Structure – Option 2**

### **1. Central Functions and Co-ordination Commission**

Corporate Council policies and strategies  
Corporate Legal, Administrative, Estates/Property Services and Repair and Maintenance  
Chief Executive's Policy, European, Best Value and Communications functions  
Corporate Finance and Financial Services including Taxation  
External Affairs – European, National, Regional and Local  
Democratic Representation  
Mayoral Office/Electoral Issues/Registrars  
Concessionary Fares and Emergency Planning  
Best Value Performance Plan and Derby Pointer  
Members Services/Allowances  
Corporate Personnel, Recruitment and Training functions and issues  
Employment training  
Health and Safety  
Corporate Equality Functions and Issues  
E-government, IT services/development and telecommunications  
Repairs and Maintenance Programmes  
Design Services  
Emergency Planning

### **2. Children and Young People**

Schools  
Play schemes  
Centrally Funded School Services, including Special Needs  
Youth Service  
Children and Family Social Services  
Corporate Parenting  
Assessment and Care Planning  
Health Improvement Planning - children  
Children's Health Services

### **3. Environment, Planning and Housing**

Strategic Planning, including Traffic and Transportation  
External Employment Initiatives  
Economic Development  
Tourism and Tourist Information Centre  
Parks and Allotments, including Client Grounds Maintenance  
Development Control and Building Control  
Footpaths, Highways and Maintenance, Car Parks  
Roads - Engineering and Design Service  
Highways Property Administration  
City Centre Management  
Licensing policy issues - Taxis/Entertainment etc  
Local Agenda 21 Strategy, Environmental Co-ordination and Initiatives

Environmental Health and Trading Standards  
Outdoor Amenities  
Client - Street Cleaning/Waste Collection and Disposal/Conveniences  
Recycling  
Land Drainage  
Energy Conservation  
Building cleaning  
All Direct Services  
Non-Highway Engineering  
Housing Management  
Housing Strategy and Development  
Private Sector Housing  
Supporting People  
Housing Options

#### **4. Adult and Community Regeneration**

Adult Social Services  
Health Improvement Planning - adults  
Adult Health Services  
Adult Education  
Mandatory and Discretionary Awards  
Access Support, including Ethnic Minority Achievement Grant  
Community Centres and Council Activity Centres  
Arts and Libraries  
Assembly Rooms/Guildhall  
Museums/Art Gallery  
Outdoor events  
Sports including Grants  
Leisure Centres and Coaching  
Festivities  
Cemeteries and Crematorium  
Community Cohesion and Social Inclusion  
Community Governance and Consultation  
Community Regeneration and Development, including Community Planning  
Special Programmes Management including all Single Regeneration Budget  
Schemes  
New Deal for Communities  
Cultural Diversity  
Housing and Council Tax Benefits  
Welfare Rights  
Community Legal Services including Law Centre and Citizens Advice Bureau  
Crime and Disorder, including Youth Offending Service

## Possible Four Commission Structure – Option 3 – Based on Cabinet Portfolios

<b>COMMISSION 1</b>	
<b>1. Corporate Policy</b> Corporate Council Policies and Strategies Corporate Finance and Financial Services including Taxation Corporate Legal and Administrative Services Corporate Communications European Policy Local Strategic Partnership Sub Regional Strategic Partnership External Affairs – European, National, Regional and Local Mayoral Office/Electoral Issues/Registrars Emergency Planning Members Services/Allowances Markets	<b>2. Performance Management, Economic Development and Housing</b> Performance Management Best Value functions Best Value Performance Plan Estates, Property Services and Repair and Maintenance Building Design Services External Employment Initiatives Economic Development Housing Management Client Housing Strategy and Development Private Sector Housing Homelessness Tourism and TIC City Centre Management Computer Services Development, Telecommunications and e-Government
<b>COMMISSION 2</b>	
<b>3. Community Regeneration</b> Social Inclusion Housing and Council Tax Benefits Derby Advice, including Home Energy Advice Community Legal Services including Law Centre and Citizens Advice Bureau Youth Service Community Safety Partnership Community Centres Community Grants and Equality Grants Community Governance and Consultation Community Regeneration and Development, including Community Planning Community Strategy and Neighbourhood Renewal Strategy Community Cohesion Derby Pointer Panel Area Neighbourhood Working, including Area Panels	<b>4. Social Care and Youth</b> Children and Family Services Adult Services Assessment and Care Planning Social Services Support Services Health Improvement Planning Health Services Partnerships Supporting People Youth Service



<p>New Deal for Communities Special Programmes Management, including all Single Regeneration Budget Schemes, Neighbourhood Renewal Fund and European Objective 2 and URBAN</p>	
<b>COMMISSION 3</b>	
<p><b>5. Lifelong Learning</b> Schools, including Repairs and Maintenance Centrally funded Schools Services, including Special Needs Adult Education Mandatory and Discretionary Awards Access Support, including Ethnic Minority Achievement Grant</p>	<p><b>7. Leisure and Cultural Services</b> Arts and Libraries Assembly Rooms, Guildhall Museums, Art Gallery Festivities Outdoor Events Parks and Allotments, including all non-highway Client Grounds Maintenance City Centre and Neighbourhood Horticultural Features Sports and Play including Grants Leisure Centres and Coaching Health and Fitness</p>
<b>COMMISSION 4</b>	
<p><b>6. Planning, Transportation and Environment</b> Planning and Building Control Strategic Planning and Transportation including Car Parking Strategy Footpaths, Highways and Maintenance Roads – Engineering and Design Services Highways Property Administration Local Agenda 21 Strategy, Environment Co-ordination and Initiatives Client – Street Cleaning/Waste Collection and Disposal/Public Conveniences/Highways Grounds Maintenance Recycling Land Drainage Energy Conservation</p>	<p><b>8. Personnel, Equalities and Direct Services</b> Corporate Personnel, Recruitment and Training functions Employment Training Health and Safety Corporate Equalities Functions and Issues All Direct Services Non-Highway Engineering Cemeteries and Crematorium Environmental Health and Trading Standards On-Street and off-street Car parking (other than car parking strategy)</p>

<b>Derby</b>	<b>Tameside</b>	<b>Trafford</b>
Unitary Authority	Metropolitan Borough	Metropolitan Borough
Population 221,708	Population 213,043	Population 210,145
17 Wards	19 Wards	21 Wards
51 Councillors	57 Councillors	63 Councillors
Six Overview and Scrutiny Commissions <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Scrutiny Management</li> <li>• Community Regeneration</li> <li>• Culture and Prosperity</li> <li>• Education</li> <li>• Planning and Environment</li> <li>• Social Care and Health</li> </ul>	Four Scrutiny Panels <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Personal Health and Service</li> <li>• Lifelong Learning and Cultural Services</li> <li>• Technical, Economic and Environmental Services</li> <li>• Resources and Community Services</li> </ul>	Four Scrutiny Committees <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Pivotal</li> <li>• Community</li> <li>• Technical</li> <li>• Education</li> </ul>