

Time commenced – 5.21pm
Time finished – 7.10pm

CONSERVATION AREA ADVISORY COMMITTEE 14 SEPTEMBER 2006

Present: Mr M Craven (Victorian Society) (in the Chair)
Councillor Poulter
Mr M Mallender (Co-opted)
Mr P Billson (Derbyshire Historic Building Trust)
Mrs J D'Arcy (Derby Archaeological Society)
Mr B Wyatt (RIBA Notts & Derby Soc)
Mrs A Hutchinson (Derby Civic Society)
Mr D Armstrong (Co-opted)
Mr J Sharpe (Ancient Monument society)
Mr C Glenn (IBHC East Midlands)

City Council Officers:

Mr H Hopkinson (Regeneration and Community)
Miss J Kirkpatrick (Democratic Services)
Mrs D Maltby (Regeneration and Community)

21/06 Apologies

Apologies were received from Councillor Rawson and Mrs C Carven.

22/06 Late Items Introduced by the Chair

In accordance with Section 100(B)(4) of the Local Government Act 1972, the Chair agreed to admit the following two items on the grounds that advice was required from the Committee before the next scheduled meeting of the Committee:

Darley Lane/Edward Street granite setts and kerb stones

The Committee supported the public concern over the missing granite setts in Darley Street, within the Strutts Park Conservation Area, but was pleased to note that they are now to be reinstated. As a matter of principle, the Committee considered that the loss of any historic paving/highway materials from the City's conservation areas would be highly regrettable. The Committee recommended that the Council should ensure that any salvaged historic highway materials should be retained for reuse in a safe and secure store.

Market Place big screen

The Committee recommended that the Council do not proceed with the proposed free standing big screen in the Market Place, as it would be an over-dominant and inappropriate intrusion into the historic open space, and would therefore neither preserve or enhance the character of the City Centre Conservation Area. The Committee felt that the introduction of the screen, projecting images 24 hours a day, would adversely affect the special integrity of the Market Place's public open space. It was suggested that other locations outside of the Conservation Area within the city centre may be more appropriate and less sensitive.

23/06 Declarations of Interest

There were no declarations of interest.

24/06 Minutes of the Previous Meeting

The minutes of the meeting held on 10 August 2006 were confirmed as a correct record and signed by the Chair.

25/06 Report on Applications Determined Since the Last Report

The Committee received an update on previous applications that had been determined since the last report.

26/06 Committee Report

The Committee considered a report of the Assistant Director – Development, concerning applications received and resolved to make the following comments:

City Centre Conservation Area

- a) Code No: DER/806/1247 – 39 Cornmarket – installation of shop front

The Committee objected and recommend refusal on the grounds that the fixed canopy, the lanterns fixed to the new, striped and brightly coloured fascia and the new replacement door were all inappropriate to the traditional character of the shop front introducing unnecessary clutter and discordant features to this property that forms part of a group of historically/architecturally important buildings within the Conservation Area. The proposal would therefore be detrimental to the appearance and character of the Conservation Area.

- b) Code No: DER/806/1294 – 39 Corn Market, Derby, display of internally illuminated fascia sign and externally illuminated hanging sign

The Committee objected and recommend refusal on the grounds that the signage, by virtue of its size, design and colour content was inappropriate to the traditional character of the shop front/façade of this property that forms part of a group of historically/architecturally important buildings within the Conservation Area. The proposal would therefore be detrimental to the appearance and character of the Conservation Area.

Darley Abbey Conservation Area

- c) Code No. DER/806/1286 - Alterations to form pitched roof, 2b Mileash Lane, Darley Abbey

The Committee raised no objections subject to the use of an appropriate roof tile.

- d) Code No. DER/806/1343 – Erection of detached garage – 4 Mill Cottages, Darley Abbey Mills, Darley Abbey
- e) Code No. DER/806/1345 – Listed Building Consent - Erection of detached garage – 4 Mill Cottages, Darley Abbey Mills, Darley Abbey

The Committee objected and recommend refusal on the grounds that the elevational changes to the previous scheme that was refused planning permission/listed building consent, do not address the reasons for refusal of that previous scheme and therefore the proposed garage, by virtue of it's size and location on the plot, would be seen as disproportionate to the scale of the listed building and as such would be seriously detrimental to the setting of the listed building and to the appearance and character of the Conservation Area.

Friar Gate Conservation Area

- f) Code No. DER/806/1243 – Retention of use as training centre - 119A Friar Gate

This Committee raised no objections.

Leylands Estate Conservation Area

- g) Code Nos. DER/806/1340, DER/806/1341 – Demolition of 29 bed nursing home and DER/806/1342 and erection of 38 residential care units and support facilities, alterations to Eborn House (Grade II) listed building and form extension to provide restaurant, erection of extensions to Fraser Hall, to provide lounge and glazed link, external alterations to Dovedale and Trent Houses to provide 16 residential care units and associated site works at Leylands Estate, Broadway

The Committee noted that it's pre-application advice to the applicant/architect of this scheme had been followed and raised no objection to the principle of this major development proposal. It was considered that a justification had

been adequately made for the demolition/redevelopment of the nursing home and that the proposed new buildings were appropriately designed and had an acceptable relationship to the setting of the listed building and the other existing buildings that form part of the planned estate. The Committee welcomed the retention and adaptation of Dovedale and Trent Houses and raised no objection to the submitted proposal.

The Committee noted that the proposals for Eborn House, the grade II listed building, involved the reinstatement of many of the internal rooms/features but also involved the demolition of part of the service wing to create the proposed restaurant. The Committee raised no objections to the principle of these proposals to the listed building however it did express concerns over the semi-circular element of the proposed extension and to the extent of the internal demolition within the retained parts of the service wing. It was recommended therefore that these elements be discussed further with the applicant and that appropriate amendments to the scheme be sought to the satisfaction of the Council's Conservation Officer.

Little Chester Conservation Area

- h) Code No. DER/806/1283 - 19 St Pauls Road, installation of two windows in rear elevation

The Committee objected and recommend refusal on the grounds that the design of the proposed replacement windows was of a non-traditional dummy sash which by virtue of its general form of construction, its top-opening form and heavy central glazing bar, would be an inferior replacement to the existing window frames and therefore would fail to preserve or enhance the appearance/character of the Conservation Area.

Railway Conservation Area

- i) Code No. DER/706/1231 - Installation of new shopfront, 8-9 Midland Road

The Committee objected and recommend refusal on the grounds that this revised proposal contained no greater level of detailing/clarity than the previous scheme that was refused planning permission on the basis that it would be out of keeping with character of the existing premises, detrimental to the visual quality of the street scene and would fail either to enhance or preserve the appearance of the Conservation Area.

Strutts Park Conservation Area

- j) Code No. DER/806/1312 - Residential development, 40 West Avenue

The Committee noted that this was an application for outline planning permission but that it was subject to a Design Statement that set out key design principles that would be deployed in the preparation of the ultimate detailed scheme. Given that the Secretary of State had granted conditional

Conservation Area Consent for the demolition of 40 West Avenue, the Committee was supportive of the proposal for the residential development of the residual land but considered that any development should be of a greater height and scale than that depicted in the Design Statement; the indicative proposal was considered to be of insufficient height, scale and mass to satisfactorily conclude the truncated terrace of dwellings. It was recommended therefore that this application as submitted should be refused.

- k) Code No: DER/806/1262 – 38 Arthur Street, Derby, Insertion of door and window in rear elevation

The Committee raised no objections.

- l) Code No: DER/806/1352 – Land at rear of 4 Grove Court, Edward Street – Conversion of barn to residential use to form ancillary accommodation to 4 Grove Court

The Committee raised no objections subject to the details being to the satisfaction of the Council's Conservation Officer and a condition limiting the use/occupation of the accommodation as being ancillary to the use of 4 Grove Court.

Allestree Conservation Area

- m) Code No DER/806/1333 -339 Duffield Road/Church Walk (Shell Service Station)

The Committee objected and recommend refusal on the grounds that the proposed timber fence would detract from the setting of the Conservation Area since the existing mature boundary wall that it would replace currently provides an attractive and traditional boundary feature to Church Walk that could simply be extended across that part of the boundary that is presently undefined.

Minutes End