

Time commenced – 5.15pm

Time finished – 7.35pm

CONSERVATION AREA ADVISORY COMMITTEE 13 MAY 2010

Present: Mr D Ling (Derby Civic Society) (In the Chair)
Councillors Grimadell and Wood
Mr P Billson (Derbys Historic Buildings Trust)
Ms J D'Arcy (Derbys Archaeological Society)
Mr Craven (Victorian Society)
Mr C Glenn (IHBC East Midlands)
Mr M Mallender (Co-opted)

91/09 Apologies

Apologies for absence were received from Councillors Naitta, Rawson and Turner. Apologies were also received from Mr Sharpe, Mr James, Mr Armstrong and Mrs Craven.

92/09 Late Items Introduced by the Chair

There were no late items.

93/09 Declarations of Interest

There were no declarations of interest.

94/09 Confirmation of the minutes of the meeting held on 15 April 2010

An amended copy of the minutes was circulated to members prior to the meeting. The minutes of the meeting held on 15 April 2010 were confirmed as a correct record and signed by the Chair.

95/09 Report on applications determined since the last meeting

The Committee received an update on previous applications that had been determined since the last report.

96/09 Council House Refurbishment Project

The Committee received a presentation on the proposals to refurbish the Council House. Members were pleased to hear that important historic areas of the building are to be restored as part of the project.

Resolved to note the presentation

97/09 Morledge Regeneration Public Art Project

The Committee received an oral update report of the Director of Planning and Transportation on the Morledge Regeneration Public Art Project. Members were asked for their views on the 'Site Sight' public art project (www.sitesightderby.com), part of Full Street corridor section of the Public Realm Programme, and the consultation process used for the project.

It was noted that there is an historic chair in existence named the 'Derby Chair' which, it was suggested, could assist with the design process of the physical part of the project. Members also suggested that it would be helpful to provide interpretation of the project and general awareness raising of the existence of the 10 to 20 chairs proposed to be located throughout the city centre. Concerns were raised regarding potential clutter, which were acknowledged by the Project Manager. He stated that reducing street furniture clutter was a key subject in the Public Realm Strategy.

It was reported that the Committee were invited to a formal event, to meet the artist and the team. Invitations would be sent out shortly.

Resolved to note the oral report.

98/09 Museum Square Design Public Art Project

The Committee received an oral update report of the Director of Planning and Transportation on the Museum Square Design Public Art Project.

Members stated that the current historic gas lamp standard in the square was acquired by the Museum and placed in its current spot in the 1980s, and that the space was envisaged as a public garden from the 1930s, and laid out in the 1950s. It was suggested that additional lighting could be fixed to buildings. The Committee felt that the space worked well as it is and the plans to alter the lighting and layout were unnecessary.

Resolved to note the oral report and recommend that the current lighting in the Museum Square should remain unaltered unless entirely necessary.

99/09 Committee Report

Allestree Conservation Area

Application: DER/03/10/00307 – Formation of soft play area, erection of 2m high fence and shelter and formation of a hard play area at St. Edmunds Church Hall, Kings Croft, Allestree, Derby

The Committee raised no objection to this proposal.

Application: DER/04/10/00409 – Formation of rooms in the roof space (bedroom, bathroom and store) and alterations to roof (formation of dormer and roof light) at 2 The Poplars Allestree, Derby

The Committee raised no objection to this proposal.

City Centre Conservation Area

Application: DER/03/10/00274 – Display of externally illuminated fascia sign and internally illuminated projecting sign at 22 Corn Market, Derby

The Committee recommended refusal of both the externally illuminated fascia sign and internally illuminated projecting sign on the grounds of the inappropriate colour used for the signs and the use of internal illumination which were considered to have a detrimental impact on the listed building.

Application: DER/03/10/00342 – Change of use from retail (use class A1) to restaurant/cafe (use class A3) and erection of extraction flue at 32-33, Sadler Gate, Derby

The Committee raised no objection to the change of use application but objected to the location of the flue on the rear elevation, as it is a highly visible location and would have a detrimental impact on the character of the conservation area. It was suggested that alternative, less obtrusive locations be considered, and that any flue should be painted a dark colour.

Application: DER/03/10/00364 – Change of use from retail (Use Class A1) to restaurant (Use Class A3) at 19-20 Sadler Gate, Derby

The Committee raised no objection to this proposal.

Application: DER/03/10/00376 – Display of externally illuminated fascia sign and projecting sign at (Avisa Financial Services) 4 Queen Street, Derby

The Committee objected to and recommended refusal of both the fascia sign and the projecting sign. It was considered that the depth of the fascia sign was too great and should be commensurate with the signs on the adjacent buildings. Members felt that the projecting sign would add unnecessary clutter to the building and, in accordance with the draft Shop Front and Advertisement Guide, the illumination of the signs was not justified for this use. The signs would therefore have a detrimental impact on the character of the conservation area and the setting of the listed building. It was suggested that the depth of the approved fascia sign at No. 5 may be more acceptable.

Application: DER/03/10/00392 – Change of use from retail (Use Class A1) to mixed use cafe/retail unit (Use Classes A3 and A1), including external seating area at (The Book Café) 20-21 Corn Market, Derby (The Book Cafe)

The Committee raised no objection to this proposal.

Little Chester Conservation Area

Application: DER/01/10/00009 – Installation of window in front elevation at 158 Mansfield Road, Derby

The Committee raised no objection in principle to the ground floor replacement sliding sash windows, but suggested that the finish should be paint rather than wood stained, which is historically more appropriate. It was noted that there are hardwood staining products available with a coloured finish to look like paint. However, Committee did object to the proposed first floor window, on the grounds that the design of the replacement window was of a non-traditional dummy sash, which by virtue of its general construction and top opening form would be an inferior replacement to the existing window frames and therefore would fail to preserve or enhance the appearance of the Conservation Area.

Mickleover Conservation Area

Application: DER/03/10/00338 – External alterations to garage to form garden room at 14 Orchard Street, Mickleover, Derby

The Committee raised no objection to this proposal.

Nottingham Road Conservation Area

Application: DER/04/10/00426 – Extension to cafe/delicatessen (kitchen) at 121 Nottingham Road, Derby

The Committee raised no objection to this proposal.

Others – not in Conservation Areas

Application: DER/03/09/00331 & DER/03/09/00332 - Partial demolition of The Hippodrome and formation of multi-storey car park, erection of retail unit, retail kiosk, offices and 4 apartments at the Hippodrome, Green Lane, Derby

The Committee regarded the amended plans submitted in order to reconfigure the traffic flow to have no impact on its original recommendation to refuse consent for both the planning and listed building consent applications, on the grounds that the further substantial demolition required was not justified.

Application: DER/04/10/00413 - Erection of student accommodation (389 units) and associated parking spaces at the site of the Builder Centre, Brook Street, Derby

The proposed student accommodation, parts of which would be six storeys in height, was considered by Committee to have a deleterious effect on views to the grade II* listed Rykneld mills complex, particularly the tallest mill building which is one of the most important buildings of height in the city. The design was also considered to be of insufficient quality and was not successful in its aim to reference the character of the immediate area, particularly when compared with the successful Mill House apartment scheme on the adjacent site. The Committee therefore objected to and recommended refusal of the scheme, and suggested that any re-design should not exceed four storeys in height.

Spondon Conservation Area

Application: DER/01/10/00095 - Erection of double garage, boundary wall, gates and formation of vehicular access at 3 Sitwell Street, Spondon, Derby

The Committee objected to and recommended refusal of the proposed vehicular access, on the grounds that the loss of the boundary wall, a feature which is prevalent in this part of the Spondon Conservation Area, would have a detrimental impact on the character of the area. No objection was raised in principle to the design, materials and siting of the garage, but it was suggested that reorientation of the garage and consideration of alternative access points from Sitwell Close should be considered, in order to retain the front boundary wall.

Application: DER/04/10/00412 - Erection of 2.4m high boundary fence and store at St. Werburgh's C of E School, Church Street, Spondon, Derby

The Committee recommended refusal on the grounds that the proposal will neither enhance nor preserve the Conservation Area. Members would rather see a more natural solution employed such as a prickly hedge. The Committee raised no objection to the outside store.

Application No. DER/10/00036/EN – 85-89 King Street, Derby – This is not a Planning Application: Extension and alterations to shop/flats to form retail (use class A1) and offices (use class B1)

The Committee supported the principle of development of the site but Members were not convinced by the present proposals. The Committee may be minded to accept a more modern proposal however; it would have to be of a high design quality. The Committee liked Mr Hodgkinson's ship's prow design idea for the site using a mostly glass structure narrowing to a point rather than a curved design. Members recommended that any scheme should include for the refurbishment of the adjoining terraced properties.

Strutts Park Conservation Area

Application: DER/04/10/00421 – Installation of windows at 49 Arthur Street, Derby

The Committee welcomed the reinstatement of the original vertical sliding sash windows and raised no objection in principle, subject to officer negotiation of a stone or cast stone reinstated mullion rather than timber.

Application: DER/04/10/00447 - Extensions to dwelling house (enlargement of kitchen and dormers), installation of replacement windows and alterations to roof covering at 62 Otter Street, Derby

No objection was raised to the modification to the dormer on the front roof slope, nor the reinstatement of vertical sliding sash windows to the front elevation. However, the Committee objected to and recommended refusal of the enlarged rear dormer window and the replacement of the sliding sash windows to the rear with casement windows, on the grounds that modification of the historic appearance of the existing features as proposed would neither preserve nor enhance the character of the conservation area.

Application: DER/12/09/01494 – Alterations to a door at 66 Belper Road, Derby

The Committee raised no objection to this proposal.

100/09 George Rennie Award

It was reported that the current long list for this year's award has only one item. The Committee resolved to nominate a sub group of three members to produce a long list for consideration at a subsequent meeting. Officers were asked to provide suggestions of suitable projects that have been completed this year for the sub group to consider.

MINUTES END