Time commenced – 5.15pm Time finished – 6.55pm

CONSERVATION AREA ADVISORY COMMITTEE 20 March 2008

Present: Mr Craven (Victorian Society) (in the Chair)

Councillors Care, S Khan and Wood

Mr D Armstrong (Co-opted)

Mr P Billson (Derbyshire Historic Buildings Trust)

Mrs N Consterdine (Derby Civic Society)
Mr J James (Chamber of Commerce)

Mr M Mallender (Co-opted)

City Council Officers:

Mr Chris Gregson (Democratic Services)

Ms Debbie Maltby (Regeneration and Community)
Ms Chloe Oswald (Regeneration and Community)

70/07 Apologies

Apologies were received from Councillors Repton and Willoughby, Mrs Craven, Mr Sharpe and Mr Wyatt.

71/07 Late Items Introduced by the Chair

In accordance with Section 100(B)(4) of the Local Government Act 1972, the Chair agreed to admit the following item on the grounds that advice was required from the Committee before the next scheduled meeting of the Committee:

Codes No DER/01/08/00106 & DER/01/08/00107 - First floor, Royal Buildings, 1 – 8 Victoria Street and 22 – 23 Corn Market, change of use and alterations of first floor from tanning studio and hairdressers to function room/night club/music venue (Use Class A4)

The Committee welcomed the proposal to reinstate a similar use to the original function of the building and raised no objection in principle to the proposed internal alterations and illuminated crown and lettering. However, the Committee objected to the proposed external uplighting as it was considered to have a detrimental impact on the special character of the building and neither preserve nor enhance the character of the City Centre Conservation Area. It was felt that the up lighters would not appropriately illuminate architectural features and the amount of illumination would be excessive.

72/07 Declarations of Interest

There were no declarations of interest.

73/07 Minutes of the Previous Meeting

The minutes of the meeting held on 7 February 2008 were confirmed as a correct record and signed by the Chair.

74/07 Report on Applications Determined Since the Last Report

The Committee received an update on previous applications that had been determined since the last report.

75/07 Tall Buildings Strategy

The Committee expressed their agreement with the personal views put forward at this point following the first consultation workshop by Mr D Armstrong, who is also representing the Committee. These views include grouping tall buildings away from the town centre, and taking into consideration longer range views, such as those from Darley Abbey, although the Committee did not agree with sea level being a factor. Quality of design is also an essential factor. The Committee also suggested that a checklist for developers should be produced to consider when first defining a building as tall in relation to the existing topography and built environment in Derby, and secondly when assessing the impact of the building on its immediate and wider context.

The Committee requested that, following the second workshop, the summary document produced be distributed to Committee members for general discussion at the following meeting.

76/07 Street Lighting PFI

The Committee noted that, based on research, the historic paint colour for street furniture in the City was primarily dark green. It was suggested that this be considered for new lighting columns. In the Railway Conservation Area it was suggested that the 'Midland Red' colour reference which is kept by the Derbyshire Historic Buildings Trust be used for lighting columns, as with the existing.

77/07 Committee Report

The Committee considered a report of the Assistant Director – Development, concerning applications received and resolved to make the following comments:

City Centre Conservation Area

 a) Code No. DER/02/08/00171 - Various internal and external alterations to listed buildings including removal of ground level wall, staircase, W.C/ Cupboard to form public house with associated external drinking area – Derby City Church, Curzon Street

The Committee raised no objection in principle subject to investigation of the construction of the stage prior to removal. If the stage is considered to be an original feature of the building, every effort should be made to preserve it in situ.

 Code No. DER/10/07/01951 - Erection of 25 apartments, retail units (use classes A1/A2) Café/Restaurant (use classes A3/A5), office (use classes B1/A2) and associated car parking - 1-4 Bold Lane (Former Princes Supermarket)

The Committee noted and welcomed the amendments including the reduction in massing, particularly to Building 1. However, it was felt that previous concerns regarding the heights and massing of three of the four proposed buildings have not been fully addressed. The Committee therefore recommended refusal and reiterated their previous comments that three of the four buildings, particularly Building 1, were considered to be too overdominant in context, the square parapet roof forms when viewed from pedestrian level were considered to be inappropriate and the shop windows too large an expanse of glazing, not lining up with the Sadler Gate and Bold Lane frontages.

It was suggested that other views may be necessary to assess the impact of the proposal, including longer range views from Uttoxeter New Road.

c) Code No. DER/12/07/02272 & DER/12/07/02273 - Display of non Illuminated projecting sign, 4 Royal Buildings, Victoria Street

The Committee raised no objection in principle to the proposed signage but suggested that the projecting sign be positioned further to the right on the front elevation so as not to interfere with the stone door surround, and that the exact location be agreed with the Council's Conservation Officer.

Darley Abbey Conservation Area

d) Code No. DER/02/08/00267 - Replacement windows, Darley Abbey Village Hall, Abbey Yard, Darley Abbey

The Committee objected to the removal of the historic Crittall windows in one of the few remaining war time buildings of this type, and recommended refusal. It was suggested that, if the current windows are beyond repair and the installation of secondary glazing inappropriate, new double glazed Crittall windows should be installed.

Friar Gate Conservation Area

e) Code No. DER/02/08/00284 - Installation of fire escape-door on rear elevation at 8-9 Friar Gate (Fat Cat)

The Committee raised no objection.

f) Code No. DER/02/08/0233 - Erection of railings to new flats, 8-14 George Street

The Committee raised no objection.

g) Code No. DER/03/08/00329 - Change of use to café wine bar (A4) and formation of new entrance door, 5 George Street

The Committee raised no objection subject to officer satisfaction with details.

h) Code No. DER/02/08/00246 - Change of use from tyre sales/depot to restaurant (use class A3) and two storey extension to create kitchen, store, staff and ancillary office space and reconfiguration of car parking layout at 4 Friary Street

The Committee objected to and recommended refusal of the proposed alterations to the modern small industrial building in a prominent position within the City Centre Conservation Area, as the design and materials (UPVC) were not considered to be of a sufficient standard and would therefore neither preserve nor enhance the character of the conservation area. It was suggested that a more appropriate approach would be to emphasise the industrial nature of the building with a contemporary interpretation of its original use. The Committee raised no objection in principle to the change of use.

i) Code No. DER/01/08/00113 – Change of use from residential (Use Class C3) to Retail (Use Class A1) at 39 Friar Gate

The Committee raised no objection.

Nottingham Road Conservation Area

j) Code No. DER/02/08/00204 – Change of use from retail (Use Class A1 to café (Use Class A3), 121 Nottingham Road

The Committee raised no objection.

Railway Conservation Area

k) Code No. DER/01/08/00139 - Installation of Shop Front at 10 Midland Road

The Committee raised no objection.

 Code No. DER/01/08/00143 - Display of Externally Illuminated Fascia Sign at 10 Midland Road

The Committee raised no objection in principle to individually halo illuminated lettering subject to officer satisfaction with detail and materials.

m) Code No. DER/12/07/02299 & DER/12/07/2300 - Erection of shelter and formation of car parking area, 1 Railway Terrace (Brunswick Inn PH)

The Committee objected to and recommended refusal of the proposed smoking shelter and parking areas, on the grounds that the inappropriately designed shelter would neither preserve nor enhance the character of the conservation area. The Committee also considered that the loss of the seating area, designed to reflect the railway history of the area, would result in the loss of a valuable space within the conservation area and would have a detrimental impact on its character.

Spondon Conservation Area

n) Code No. DER/01/08/00128 - Installation of velux window, 6 Sitwell Street, Spondon

The Committee objected and recommended refusal on the grounds that the roof light would have a negative impact on the character of the conservation area. It was noted that there was a roof light on the adjacent property, but this roof slope was at a higher level and therefore less visible from the street than the roof slope of 6 Sitwell Street.

Strutts Park Conservation Area

o) Code No. DER/02/08/00247 - Installation of door and windows to front elevation,13 Edward Street

The Committee raised no objection.

p) Code No. DER/01/08/00140 - Residential development (three Apartments), Land rear of 11 -13 North Street

The Committee objected to and recommended refusal of the proposed dwellings as the design of the elevations was considered to be neither modern nor traditionally proportioned, and therefore would not preserve or enhance the character of the conservation area. No objection was raised in principle to the height and footprint of the proposal, but the massing and elevational details were considered to be inappropriate. It was suggested that a more appropriate design approach, in light of the location within the former gardens of the North Street properties, would be as an ancillary building rather than a copy of those fronting North Street.

Minutes End