

## Report of the Strategic Director of Neighbourhoods

### Toilet provision in Derby

#### SUMMARY

##### 1.1

This report identifies how the City Centre public convenience provision could be enhanced whilst achieving saving in revenue budgets of £100,000 per year from 2011/12.

#### RECOMMENDATION

2..1 To allocate up to £350,000 of unsupported borrowing from capital under spend to fund the refurbishment of the city centre toilets.

2.2 To continue the provision of the following public conveniences with a view to investment in refurbishment :

- Assembly Rooms - City Centre
- The Spot – City Centre
- Victoria Street – City Centre

To continue the provision of the following existing automatic public conveniences and to review these when current maintenance agreements come to an end :

- APC Somerfield Car Park, Derby Lane, Normanton contract ends April 2014
- APC London Road, Alvaston contract ends October 2015
- APC Nottingham Road, Chaddesden contract ends January 2016

2.3 The development proposals for the city centre public conveniences involve the installation of automatic public conveniences within the existing public convenience buildings, with the exception of The Spot, which would be refurbished, managed and maintained separately.

Indicative costs are as follows :-

#### **Assembly Rooms**

To install:

- 1 Fully DDA compliant Automatic Public Convenience (APC)
- 4 Ambulant (1.5m by 1m) Semi Automatic Toilets up to

**£147,000**

### 2.3 **Victoria Street**

To install:

1 Fully DDA compliant Automatic Public Convenience (APC)

1 Fully Automatic Public Convenience (APC)

Both these units will be built into the existing building frontage up to **£110,000**

The installations may involve some structural alterations to the existing buildings and would therefore be subject to planning consent and other necessary approvals.

#### **The Spot**

This existing toilet would be generally refurbished

without becoming an Automatic Public Convenience up to **£92,000**

Annual maintenance provided by the installer and based on a 10 year contract would cost in the region of £32,000 in total for the Assembly Rooms and Victoria Street sites above, with a further estimate of some £16,000 per year to manage and maintain “The Spot” RADAR facility.

2.3 To close, the following out of city centre public conveniences on 31 March 2011:

- Sitwell Street Spondon
- High Street Chellaston
- Nunsfield (Boulton Lane)
- Spondon Cemetery
- Nottingham Road Cemetery and consider alternative provision
- Robincroft (Allestree Recreation Ground) and consider alternative arrangements
- Automatic Public Convenience (APC), Burton Road, Littleover,

## **REASONS FOR RECOMMENDATION**

- 3.1 Members are aware that good toilet provision in City Centres enhances the shopping and visitor experience whether this is during the day or at night when people visit the entertainment venues in the City Centre. Investing in modern systems that are available 24 hours per day ensures that the City can meet the City centre daytime and night time economy needs, particularly in the Area of Victoria Street where there are a number of nightclubs.
- 3.2 Members have agreed to a budget saving for public conveniences, which are toilets provided by the Council for general public use, for 20011/12, of £100,000. This is on a base budget of around £450,000 for this service. In order to achieve this, all public conveniences in the outer city areas serviced by a mobile cleansing team and listed in 2.2 will need to be closed.
- 3.3 As indicated in 2.3, an automatic public convenience will also be removed, which will have a “one-off” cost up to £15,000 to remove, cap off services and reinstate the footway. This “one-off” cost will be absorbed within Streetpride Budgets for 2011/12.

## SUPPORTING INFORMATION

- 4.1 The provision of public conveniences is not a statutory requirement for Local Authorities, and given the budget constraints anticipated both now and in the foreseeable future, it will not be possible for the Council to maintain all of its current stock of public conveniences across the City.
- 4.2 The Council recognises that the provision of public conveniences is an important feature of Derby's urban environment, and that it has its part to play along with other potential partners in the private sector who provide toilets for their customers and visitors. In the City Centre toilets are readily available to shoppers and travellers at the Bus Station and Westfield Centre.
- 4.3 The city centre public conveniences are to be retained as this can give the best opportunity to achieve the required savings whilst ensuring that there are adequate public conveniences in the city centre which will contribute to the City's future economic success as a retail and entertainment centre.
- 4.4 The Council will ensure adequate public convenience provision is arranged in the city centre directly from its own resources, which will be complimentary to any toilet provision made by the private sector for their customers in Westfield shopping centre and in larger shops and restaurants in the city centre.
- 4.5 The Council will take the lead in developing toilets across the City through the planning process, investing in city centre public conveniences to ensure these meet the expectation of residents and visitors alike, and exploring opportunities to provide adequate toilets in the outer city areas without increasing the burdens on existing Council budgets.

### 4.10 Comparisons of East Midlands City Centre Toilet Facilities

	Toilet Facilities managed by the Council	Comments
<b>Derby</b>	<b>5</b>	Includes one at a car park (Assembly Rooms), the Spot, Victoria Street and Eagle Centre Market, and the Bus Station.
<b>Nottingham</b>	<b>3</b>	Includes one at a car park and one APC at a bus station.
<b>Leicester</b>	<b>4</b>	Includes two at bus stations and one at a car park

Both Nottingham and Leicester have toilet facilities in privately managed shopping centres. Of course, Derby's Westfield Centre also has toilet facilities for public use.

- 4.6 The closures which will save £100,000, are to all the outer public conveniences directly maintained by Streetpride's cleansing services. These facilities have relatively low usage, have been afflicted by vandalism in the past which means they are closed by 6.00pm every day, are relatively costly to run and are unlikely to meet the expectations of users in the future.

## OTHER OPTIONS CONSIDERED

- 5.1 “Do nothing”, would not yield the required budget savings.
- 5.2 Whilst considering the Council budget proposals, the Neighbourhoods Commission of January 2011 endorsed the principles of this report.
- 5.3 The Council has been provided with an indicative cost of £1.86 million to refurbish and automate at the seven outer sites to a similar standard as that proposed for the city centre sites. This would be based on the agreement of a 15 year maintenance contract with the automatic public convenience provider and would equate to £198,000 per annum in capital borrowing costs over a 15 year period.
- 5.4 Introducing a small charge for use of the toilet facilities. The main advantage of introducing a charge (typically 20p) for use of public conveniences is that it will help to deter petty vandalism and anti-social behaviour within the toilets.
- 5.5 The majority of users of the facilities will know the area well, and in the same way that shoppers become accustomed to bringing bags and a coin for the shopping trolley, potential users will come armed with the necessary coin. Those that object to the charge will find alternative approaches.
- 5.6 The introduction of charging will also raise income towards the running costs of the toilets, but after taking into account the cost of collecting, reconciling and banking the money, it is unlikely to have any significant impact on revenue streams

**This report has been approved by the following officers:**

<b>Legal officer</b> <b>Financial officer</b> <b>Human Resources officer</b> <b>Service Director(s)</b> <b>Other(s)</b>	Stuart Leslie Toni Heathcote Jane Dukes Tim Clegg
-------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------	------------------------------------------------------------

<b>For more information contact:</b> <b>Background papers:</b> <b>List of appendices:</b>	Malcolm Price 01332 641587 e-mail <a href="mailto:malcolm.price@derby.gov.uk">malcolm.price@derby.gov.uk</a> None Appendix 1 - Implications Appendix 2 - Impact Assessment
-------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------	-------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------

<b>IMPLICATIONS</b>
---------------------

**Financial**

- 1.1 Full Council on 1 March 2010 approved the General Fund Revenue Budget for 2010-13. Included within the budget proposals was a commitment to save £100,000 from a strategic review of public convenience provision.
- 1.2 Included in the capital programme for 2011-12 and 2012-13 is £1,523,000 of funding for the upgrading of cremators to comply with emissions legislation and minor refurbishment at Markeaton Crematorium. Included within this is £550,000 of unsupported borrowing from corporate resources.
- 1.3 It is proposed to re-allocate up to £350,000 unsupported borrowing from corporate resources towards the refurbishment of the three city centre public conveniences, if the Markeaton Crematorium scheme underspends as is currently forecasted. Any additional underspend on the scheme will be available towards other Council capital schemes.

**Legal**

- 2.1 Section 87 (3) Public Health Act 1936 gives local authorities the power to build and run on-street 'public conveniences' but it does not require them to do so.

**Personnel**

- 3.1 The closure of the out of city centre public conveniences would not impact on permanent posts.
- 3.2 Refurbishment and full automation of the three city centre public convenience sites would, through the inclusion of an ongoing maintenance package with the installer, put at risk 6 x permanent Public Convenience Attendant posts.

**Equalities Impact**

- 4.1 See Appendix 2.

**Health and Safety**

- 5.1 None identified.

**Carbon commitment**

- 6.1 None identified.

**Value for money**

- 7.1 Budget savings of around £100,000 will be achieved from 2011/2012.

**Corporate objectives and priorities for change**

- 8.1 Delivering value for money.

## Public Toilets Closure Impact Assessment

	Sites to be closed	Usage	Other issues	Immediate Impacts for the customer	Impact of closure on the customer
1	Sitwell Street Spondon	Local community facility not likely to be used by non-community users.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>No baby changing</li> <li>No disabled access</li> <li>No disabled access or equipment</li> <li>One light inside</li> <li>No front door - gated only</li> <li>Poor signage</li> <li>Fence around entrance damaged</li> <li>Estimated £32k repair costs</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>No wash hand basins</li> <li>No hot water in ladies or gents</li> <li>Fire damage o/s gateway</li> <li>Ornate skylight vandalised</li> <li>floor tiles missing and damaged</li> <li>Fire damage to cubicle</li> <li>Poor ceiling condition</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>No impact on general public</li> <li>Some impact on local community</li> <li>Community members close to home and/or community centre or library</li> <li>There are no facilities for those who are disabled at this site</li> </ul>
2	High Street Chellaston	Usage by local shoppers.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Poor signage</li> <li>No disabled access / equipment</li> <li>No baby changing</li> <li>No front door - gate only</li> <li>No external lighting</li> <li>Estimated £24K repair costs</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Hole in wall through to ladies .</li> <li>Graffiti to tiles</li> <li>Boarded windows</li> <li>No wash hand basins</li> <li>No hot water in either ladies or gents</li> <li>Urinals badly corroded / damaged</li> <li>Ceiling poor,</li> <li>Glass missing above toilet door,</li> <li>W/c leaking,</li> <li>Floor poor condition,</li> <li>Holes in wall,</li> <li>Low level antisocial behaviour from local youths</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>No impact on general public</li> <li>Some impact on local community</li> <li>There are no facilities for those who are disabled at this site</li> </ul>
3	Nunsfield	Nunsfield House patrons likely to use facilities in the Social Club. Off the main road and unlikely to be a well known facility from those outside the nearby community.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Poor signage</li> <li>No disabled access or equipment</li> <li>Smashed window above toilet</li> <li>One inside light</li> <li>No external lights</li> <li>No baby changing</li> <li>Estimated £11k repair costs</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>No hot water and wash hand basin in gents,</li> <li>No hot water in ladies.</li> <li>Damage to tiles,</li> <li>Sexual graffiti,</li> <li>Damage to cubicle wall.</li> <li>Smashed window above toilet</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>No impact on general public.</li> <li>There are no facilities for those who are disabled at this site</li> </ul>

	<b>Sites to be closed</b>	<b>Usage</b>	<b>Other issues</b>	<b>Immediate Impacts for the customer</b>	<b>Impact of closure on the customer</b>
<b>4</b>	Spondon Cemetery	Only open when the cemetery is open.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• No signage</li> <li>• No lighting</li> <li>• No power</li> <li>• Damaged windows</li> <li>• No disabled access or equipment</li> <li>• No baby changing</li> <li>• On structural "at risk" register</li> <li>• Estimated £35k repair costs</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• No wash hand basins,</li> <li>• No hot water in either ladies or gents.</li> <li>• Sexual graffiti,</li> <li>• Bad structural cracking to building</li> <li>• Guttering missing</li> <li>• Window boarded up,</li> <li>• Some vandalism,</li> <li>• Dark and 'out of the way',</li> <li>• Youths congregate during the evenings</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• No impacts on general public</li> <li>• Cemetery visitors only are affected</li> <li>• There are no facilities for those who are disabled at this site</li> </ul>
<b>5</b>	Nottingham Road Cemetery	Only open when the cemetery is open.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Sharps bin for needles on wall and is used</li> <li>• No baby changing</li> <li>• No disabled access / equipment, external lighting</li> <li>• Estimated £35k repair costs</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• No hot water in either ladies or gents</li> <li>• Sexual graffiti</li> <li>• Tile damage to all parts</li> <li>• Leaking from pot urinal - needs repair / replacement</li> <li>• Locks go missing</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• No impacts on general public,</li> <li>• Cemetery visitors only are affected.</li> <li>• There are no facilities for those who are disabled at this site</li> </ul>
<b>6</b>	Robincroft Allestree Recreation Ground	Recreation Ground Users. Facilities available for cricket club and bowls club patrons and members.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Regular sexual graffiti</li> <li>• No baby changing</li> <li>• No disabled access or equipment</li> <li>• Poor signage</li> <li>• Vandal damage to windows</li> <li>• Estimated £20k repair costs</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• No hot water or hand driers,</li> <li>• No external lighting</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• No public changing rooms.</li> <li>• There are no facilities for those who are disabled at this site.</li> </ul>
<b>7</b>	APC Littleover Shops	Low usage by local shoppers	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Aging Automatic Public Convenience</li> </ul>		This unit has a RADAR key facility