

Time Commenced – 6.00pm

Time finished – 7.14pm

Communities Scrutiny Review Board 24 January 2022

Present: Councillor Dhindsa (Chair)
Councillors Prosser, Sandhu, Atwal, Pandey and Jennings.

In Attendance: Steve Caplan – Director of Property Services
Samantha Dennis – Director of Public Protection and Streetpride
Simon Aitken – Head of Refuse Collection and Street Cleansing
Carl Tring-Willis – Community Leadership Manager
John Sadler – Strategic Asset Manager
Duncan Cowie – Head of Parks and Active Living

25/21 Apologies for Absence

Apologies were received for Councillor Roulstone.

26/21 Late items introduced by the Chair

There were none.

27/21 Declarations of Interest

There were none.

28/21 Minutes of the meeting held on 22 November 2021

The minutes of the meeting held on 22 November 2021 were agreed as a correct record.

29/21 Waste Services Update

The Board received a report on Waste Services. This was presented by the Director of Public Protection and Streetpride and the Head of Refuse Collection and Street Cleansing.

It was noted that in 2018 the government released Resources and Waste, A Strategy for England, which contained a number of areas for consultation. The two main areas for waste services to consider and prepare for were separate food waste collections and consistency of collections. It was noted that guidance had not yet been issued.

It was reported that food waste in Derby was currently comingled with garden waste and collected in the free brown bin service. All other recyclables collected were collected in the blue bin. It was noted that non-recyclable waste was

collected in the black bin and that nationally it was reported that households produce on averaged over half a tonne of waste per year.

It was reported that in order to achieve consistency of collections in England, all waste streams will need to be standardised. If this happened, it could see Derby having to change the waste collection model in all waste streams .It was noted that this could result in capital investment in collection containers and fleet along with changes to staffing resource. With so many potential options councils were not able to model the future at this time but needed to be prepared to do so when further guidance was released. It was noted that nationally fly tipping has increased 18% from 957,000 to 1,134,000 from 2018/19 to 2020/21 according to Environment Agency statistics.

It was noted that in the East Midlands there were a reported 19 fly tipping incidents per 1,000 people. Which was in the mid-range nationally. The highest being London at 43 per 1,000 people.

It was reported that in Derby changes were made to the HWRC with implementation of covid measures and a booking system which was approved in December 2020 and reviewed in November 2021. It was noted that the Communities Scrutiny Review Board had discussed the need to review data over a longer time period to understand the impact of the booking system and this is being kept under review.

The Board noted that recommendations made by Executive Scrutiny to increase accessibility to the site by enabling bicycle access were accepted and implemented in December 2021 with a designated meet and greet area for cyclists to deposit waste.

It was noted that reports presented to Communities Scrutiny in July and September 2021 detailing information about Public Protection Officers (PPOs) and Streetpride developments generated conversations around waste collection and fly tipping. Both reports provided some data on fly tipping with PPOs being called to 1,394 fly tipping incidents with an average of 19.3% of service requests leading to enforcement action and Streetpride reporting a 26 % increase in fly tipping in 2020/21. It was noted that the Streetpride report noted that most cases of fly tipping were proactively identified and cleared by crews and not reported by residents.

The Board noted that the Council operated a kerb side bulky waste collection system which was mainly used by residents to dispose of items that were too large for their kerb side bin, such as furniture and white goods, but could also be used for multiple black bag clearances. Throughout the pandemic the bulky waste service was increased to provide capacity when the covid restrictions caused the HWRC to have to close. It was reported that this increased service received a good take up and continued after the pandemic.

It was noted that at Raynesway HWRC a booking system was modified in July 2021 to allow 12 bookings per calendar year from Derby and Derbyshire households, this was reviewed in a report to Council Cabinet in November 2021.

Prior to this, there was a significant proportion of bookings which were not attended which was blocking customers from accessing the HWRC.

It was reported that since July, there had been a change in the available capacity, with the exception of known pinch points, such as the Christmas and bank holidays. This suggested that the controls were working, freeing up capacity for those with household waste should they wish to make use of the facility. It was acknowledged however that the data needs to be monitored over a longer period.

It was noted that the report to Communities Scrutiny in September showed that fly tipping in Derby had increased by 26% from 19/20 to 20/21. So far in 21/22 this trajectory had continued with a 14% increase in cost and a 0.1% increase in cases to September 2021 which was better than the national picture for cases.

It was noted that visits to the HWRC dropped to zero along with tonnes of waste collected in April 20 with the covid restrictions and had not returned to pre-pandemic levels. It was noted that in terms of kerbside tonnages, there were many variables in the data, with home working thought to have an impact in increased kerbside tonnages from April 2020.

It was reported that a spike in the fly tipping data line in October 2020 had been analysed by the service and correlated to the implementation of the new Whitespace system which enabled real time reporting and scheduling for front line crews. It was noted that this would have generated an inconsistency in the change-over from paper sheets to the technology but had levelled out since the implementation has been completed.

The Board noted that using a technology bases system for street cleansing will continue provide robust and accurate data going forward. Trends in fly tipping in Derby city do not differ from the national picture where there has been a year-on-year increase. There is however some stability this year with no significant growth in annual fly tipping increase from last year.

It was reported that in order to support residents with information on how to dispose of their waste correctly, Streetpride Waste Minimisation Officers carried out educational visits to schools along with a number of campaigns.

It was reported that a number of other changes and initiatives have taken place to support waste and recycling, including:

- The garden and food waste scheme was introduced in April 2019 in two phases, residents who already has a brown bin received the service first with a further 20,000 bins delivered through June and July
- In July 2019 an opt in dry recyclable collections were introduced to the areas within Normanton, Arboretum and Mackworth that had previously been removed. This has produced some good quality material from the area.
- In April/May 2020 capacity was increased within the bulky waste

- service to allow additional bookable spaces for residents. This increase has been well received by residents with a good uptake.
- In November 2020 Whitespace was introduced within street cleansing. This system enabled work to be sent directly to the in-cab technology which allows work to be completed quicker, and to move work from one team to another instantly whilst providing an audit trail and produce reports to enable modelling and heat maps on issues to be produced.
- In October 2021 a policy change was made to make all recycling containers free to make it easier for residents to recycle more and dispose of their waste in a sustainable way.

A councillor questioned whether the Council could work with Highways England to reduce fly tipping on dual carriageways in Derby. The Director of Public Protection and Streetpride confirmed that they would discuss this with Highways England. A councillor questioned whether councillors could work with Streetpride to educate young people in Derby. The Director of Public Protection and Streetpride informed members that they would discuss this with them after the meeting. The Director of Public Protection and Streetpride agreed to provide members with a ward-by-ward breakdown of which schools had already been visited.

A councillor asked whether a ward-by-ward breakdown for fly tipping was available. The Head of Refuse Collection and Street Cleansing informed members that they would be provided with this information.

A councillor asked when robust data from whitespace would be available. The Director of Public Protection and Streetpride informed the Board that quarterly performance reports including this data would be brought to Neighbourhood Boards. Members requested that a report containing this data for all wards was brought to a future Board meeting.

Members agreed to recommend that the Council reintroduced compactor days.

The Board resolved:

- 1. to note the information provided within the report.**
- 2. to recommend that a report containing robust whitespace data for all wards is brought to a future meeting.**
- 3. to recommend to the Cabinet Member for Streetpride and Public Spaces that the Council considers reintroducing compactor days.**

30/21 Derby Poverty Commission

The Board received an update on Derby Poverty Commission. This was presented by the Community Leadership Manager.

It was noted that in Derby, pre-pandemic activities aimed at addressing and alleviating the effects of poverty were largely driven by community organisations, faith organisations, and other charitable ventures providing

a range of services including foodbanks, clothes recycling, and debt support, however these were typically without collaboration or a joined-up approach.

It was reported that there was a very real need for a new collective approach to tackling poverty and responding to the unfolding emergency locally. In Derby, the strength of the partnership between the city and the VCSE sector enabled the launch of an emergency food response scheme, which had continued to evolve to become the city's Food 4 Thought project.

It was reported that other 'alliances' that had emerged both pre- and during the pandemic were yielding positive outcomes for young people through the Youth Alliance, strengthening the role of the Faith Sector through the Faith Forum work, plus countless other new platforms which brought together key players to work together on key themes, such as the more recent Derby Health Inequalities Partnership.

It was noted that this new way of working - the 'Derby Way' - was underpinned with new governance frameworks including the city's new Partnership Board which continued to enable and embrace coproduction in tackling and resolving some of our cities deepest rooted challenges.

The Board noted that it was this new partnership landscape that enabled the coproduction of the Derby Poverty Commission, aimed at improving collaboration and encouraging a joined-up approach to addressing and alleviating the effects of poverty in the city. This would be achieved through an immediate (short), medium and long-term strategy, reflecting the emergency 'response', medium term 'recovery' and longer term 'resilience' of our city in respect of tackling poverty.

The Board noted that the Derby Poverty Commission was chaired by Peter Robinson, Dean of Derby, and was an independent Commission with membership and participation from across all sectors in the city.

It was noted that the Commission focused on the effects of poverty, identifying the root cause, as opposed to advocating short term solutions. The Commission advocated developing locally based solutions utilising the strengths of Derby's communities and organisations. The Commission worked closely with alliance models, seeking to find strength in partnership. It was noted that the Commission operated 4 sub-groups which were each dedicated to looking at a subject area: person, home, digital, post-pandemic.

It was reported that Poverty Truth Commissions were built on a principle of collective and participatory decision making to tackle poverty, in which people with lived experience of poverty (Community Commissioners) build relationships with those in positions of influence and power (Civic Commissioners). Working together, they co-create meaningful and longer-

term solutions and change through time spent listening to one another's truth and experience.

It was noted that this approach worked harmoniously with the Commissions desire to work at a grass-roots level due to its involvement and leading from the residents of Derby as commissioners. It was noted that a Poverty Truth project group was now in place, and that there was now a dedicated full-time resource committed to facilitating the start-up of a Poverty Truth Commission and "finding" suitable lived-experience commissioners.

A councillor commented that it was important for the Poverty Commission to be given the funding it needed in order to tackle poverty in Derby. Members of the Board agreed to recommend that the Poverty Commission should consider the bigger structural issues that put people into poverty.

The Board resolved:

- 1. to note the information provided within the report.**
- 2. to recommend that the Poverty Commission should consider the bigger structural issues that put people into poverty.**

31/21 Equalities & Diversity - 'Better Together'

The Board received an update on Equalities & Diversity - 'Better Together'. This was presented by the Community Leadership Manager.

The Board noted that the Race Equality Hub was chaired by Councillor Dhindsa and was attended by minority community representatives across the city. It was reported that the Hub met every two months, and the main purpose of these meetings was to discuss the priorities of the Council. The Hub had a fluid work programme that determined the areas of focus, and the work programme was contributed to by Council officers, community members and partner agencies who may wish to gain direction, views, and contributions from minority communities. It was reported that recently the Hub had been able to contribute to:

- o Employment Statistics – a Task and Finish Group has been working alongside Human Resources officers to redesign the report style for our employment data. While this has taken some considerable time and effort, progress is being made and we anticipate completion of this early in the New Year.

- o ONS Census 2021 – Hub members supported the regional representative of the Office for National Statistics in completing the Census 2021 locally by spreading the word of the necessity and offering support in the completing of the census forms within the minority communities across Derby.

o Black Lives Matter Manifesto – The Hub has been instrumental in keeping the BLM Derby Manifesto on the Council's radar, leading the city's response to the key themes highlighted in the Manifesto presented to the Council in July 2020. The main themes include employment, health, political representation amongst others.

o Political representation: OBV – In response to the BLM Manifesto, an online event open to communities and Black and Minority Ethnic employees was successfully held. Attendees were provided with information on

- Shadowing Councillors - Operation Black Vote
- Standing for Election and Registering to Vote
- Becoming a Councillor and what that means

It was noted that the Derby Health Inequality Partnership of Public Health, Community Action Derby and local communities focussed on reducing health inequalities in Derby in response to the COVID-19 Pandemic. Initial meetings had been held since the start of the pandemic with key officers, however this had been broadened to include other Council officers and community representatives.

It was reported that research into vaccine hesitancy within the Black African and Black African Caribbean communities was launched in the autumn of 2021. Events were held with various groups including the Derby West Indian Community Association DWICA, Women's groups, Black Health Professionals. Further events were being held to include Hadhari, Men's groups, Young People, and Pastors and Leaders. It was noted that Public Health would use the anonymised results to help support the relevant communities.

A councillor asked whether Board members could be provided with the Council's employment statistics for ethnic minorities. The Community Leadership Manager informed members that they would ask the Lead on Equality and Diversity to send these statistics to Board members.

Resolved to note the information provided within the report.

32/21 Allestree Golf Course

The Board considered a report on Allestree Golf Course. This report was presented by the Head of Parks and Active Living, the Strategic Asset Manager and the Director of Property Services.

The Board noted that on 11 September 2019 Cabinet approved the sale of Allestree Hall and agreed that as the sale of the Hall would affect the operation of the Golf course. It was noted that Cabinet had resolved:

- To consult with stakeholders regarding the potential closure of the golf course.

- To undertake an Expressions of Interest Exercise (EOI) to provide an opportunity for third parties to set viable proposals to operate the golf course.
- That if no viable proposal is received, the golf provision ceases and for the course to be decommissioned and absorbed into the existing parkland.

It was reported that a consultation exercise was launched on 16 December 2019 and was open for 14 weeks, closing on 23 March 2020.

It was noted that four bids were received which varied in quality, some providing either basic or incomplete financial information, whilst others were seeking a subsidy from the Council to run the course. Whilst one party did not specify an amount of subsidy required, it was inferred that support of the Council would be required as in their view "... the commercial returns and risks associated with operating a course in a public do not allow there to be a straightforward commercial investment opportunity. Growing the facility into new activities will require civic commitment."

The Board noted that in addition, there were unrealistic assumptions or omissions in the bids, relating to:

- The failure to appreciate the time, cost, and resources to create new/replacement facilities considering the challenging planning environment associated with the Park.
- Limited recognition regarding potential TUPE costs and issues.

It was reported that the outcome of both the consultation and EOI exercises were subsequently considered by the Council's leadership team in August 2020 with the exercising of the delegated authority on 2 November 2020, leading to the following decision:

- To note the results of the consultation exercise.
- That no viable business proposals to operate the Golf Course have been submitted.
- That the golf provision at Allestree Park to cease and for the course to be decommissioned and absorbed into the existing parkland.
- The course to be closed on 31 December 2020.

It was noted that after the deadline for submission of bids, and the decision to close had been made, following the publicity around the closure of the course, another party who was experienced in the managing and operating of several golf courses in the East Midlands

came forwarded in late 2020 with a proposal to operate the course. Officers were subsequently authorised to evaluate the proposal.

The Council's leadership team following consideration of the bid on 14 January 2021 subsequently resolved:

- Not to proceed with the proposal submitted
- Not to proceed with any other enquiries that may be received in connection with operating the golf course.
- To confirm that the course can be decommissioned and absorbed into the existing parkland.

It was noted that the course was closed on 31 December 2020 and works to decommission it and incorporate into the existing parkland commenced early in 2021.

It was reported that in response to a resolution passed at the Full Council meeting on 21 July 2021, the Councils' Cabinet revisited their decision regarding the closure of the golf course, at their 4 August 2021 meeting, the conclusion of which was that on the balance of the evidence considered, there were not sufficient grounds to overturn its decision of September 2019.

It was noted that in October 2021 an application was made by members of the "Save Allestree Golf Course" Group to the Secretary of State to use his powers under section 98 of Local Government, Planning and Land Act 1980 to direct the Council to disposal of the Allestree Park Golf Course.

It was reported that following consideration of the evidence submitted by both parties the Secretary of State made the following decision

"On the evidence before him, the Secretary of State is satisfied that the land is being sufficiently used by Derby City Council for the purposes of public parkland, incorporated into the wider Allestree Public Park. For this reason, the Secretary of State has decided that it would not be appropriate for a section 98 direction to be given in this case."

It was noted that at their meeting of 10 November 2021, Cabinet resolved to start a consultation process regarding the rewilding of Allestree Park including the area that was the site for the former golf course.

The Chair asked to be provided with a copy of the minutes from the Council Cabinet meeting on 11 September 2019. The Strategic Asset Manager agreed to provide this.

A councillor questioned where the estimated cost of repairing the building of c£2.8m had come from. The Director of Property Services informed the

Board that this was a listed building and that heritage experts had provided the estimate of c£2.8m.

A councillor asked how the sale of Allestree Hall was progressing. It was noted that the potential purchaser had invested time and money into this sale and that complex issues were being worked through. The Strategic Asset Manager informed the Board that they would be notified when the sale was completed.

A councillor commented that it was disappointing for the Council to be losing this asset. The councillor suggested that the Council needed to improve maintenance of heritage assets to avoid losing any more.

Board members noted that Derby was losing heritage assets and encouraged Cabinet to look at ways to reverse this and to maintain assets.

The Board resolved:

- 1. to note the information provided within the report.**
- 2. to note that Derby was losing heritage assets and to encourage Cabinet to look at ways to reverse this and to maintain assets.**

33/21 Minute extract 53-21 of the meeting of the Executive Scrutiny Board held on 7 December 2021

The Board considered a recommendation from the Executive Scrutiny Board on Performance Plan 2021/22. It was noted that a presentation on Climate Change would take place and that scrutiny board members would be invited to attend.

Resolved to note that a presentation on Climate Change would take place and that scrutiny board members would be invited to attend.

34/21 Work Programme 2021/22

The Board considered a report setting out the Terms of Reference and Remit of the Board.

The report provided Members of the Board with the opportunity to consider its terms of reference and remit for the forthcoming municipal year, its work programme for 2021/22 and any topic reviews. The Board agreed that items that has not been considered during the 2021/22 municipal year should be included in the Board's work programme for 2022/23.

Resolved to recommend that items that has not been considered during the 2021/22 municipal year should be included in the Board's work programme for 2022/23.

Minutes End.