

Time commenced – 6.00pm
Time adjourned – 6.40pm
Time re-commenced – 6.45pm
Time finished – 8.25pm

ADULTS, HEALTH AND HOUSING COMMISSION
31 October 2011

Present: Councillor Hussain (Chair)
Councillors Ashburner, Radford, Russell, Shanker and Webb

In Attendance: Councillor Dhindsa

42/11 Apologies for Absence

Apologies for absence were received from Councillor Atwal.

43/11 Late items introduced by the Chair

There were no late items.

44/11 Declarations of Interest

Councillor Webb declared a personal and prejudicial interest in item 50/11 b. as former Cabinet Member – Adult Social Care and Health and left the room during consideration of this item.

45/11 Minutes of the Previous Meeting

The minutes of the previous meeting held on 5 September 2011 were agreed as a correct record and signed by the chair.

46/11 Call-in

There were no items referred to the Commission in relation to the Call-in of a key decision.

47/11 Councillor Call for Action

There were no Councillor Calls for Action.

48/11 Health Scrutiny Items

Update on Normanton Medical Centre

The Commission received a presentation from Val Beech, a member of the Normanton Medical Centre Patient Participation Group. The Patient Participation Group raised concerns over the forecasted closure of Normanton Medical Centre in early 2012 and asked the Commission to recommend that it would not go

ahead.

The Commission also received a presentation from Trish Thompson, NHS Derby City, on the “Retraction of Normanton Medical Centre”. NHS Derby City had been asked to review the closure of Normanton Medical Centre to assure the Overview and Scrutiny Commission and the Patient Participation Group that patients would not be disadvantaged in any way by the closure and that services available elsewhere were comparable.

Trish reported that the Normanton Medical Centre was awarded on a fixed term basis and that this was due to end in March 2012. All alternative local practices were open 8.00am until 6.30pm. 5 practices within less than one mile radius of Normanton Medical Centre were open until 8.00pm Monday to Friday. All local practices had “open” lists. All local practices offered a range of appointments and had access to interpreter services.

Trish reported that Normanton Medical Centre had used Derby Open Access Centre and Accident and Emergency more than other practices in that locality. A cost per patient comparison suggested that Normanton Medical Centre cost more per patient than other practices, without substantially better outcomes. Trish explained that the decision to close was due to the fixed contract coming to an end and that there had been investment in other local practices. It was also reported that the level of quality at Normanton Medical Centre was not the deciding factor, but quality would be better at other practices.

The commission questioned whether any of the ten practices used in the comparison were private practices. Trish explained that all were PCT practices. Trish was also asked whether the management of Normanton Medical Centre would have been aware that it was a fixed term contract. She explained that under European law, this had to be made clear when offering contracts.

Resolved to allow the PCT to make their decision regarding the closure of Normanton Medical Centre.

Cavendish Pharmacy Closure - Update

The Commission received an update on the proposed closure of Cavendish Pharmacy. It was reported that the pharmacy had been open for four years and was a 100 hour pharmacy. The pharmacy contractors had advised the PCT in August of their intention to close. The contractors must give six months notice so the early closure date would be 24 February 2012. It was reported that there were 14 other pharmacies within a one mile radius and that two were also 100 hour pharmacies.

Resolved to note the update and raised no concerns.

Contracts for Adult Drug & Young Persons Substance Misuse – for Information

The Commission received a report on contracts for adult drug and young persons’ substance misuse.

Resolved to note the report.

49/11 Budget Consultation

The Commission received an introduction from Martyn Marples, Director of Finance and Procurement, where he welcomed recommendations from the Commission on the budget proposals for the Adults, Health and Housing Directorate.

The Commission received a presentation from Tina Frost Morris, Head of Finance for Adults, Health and Housing, on the Revenue Budget Proposals 2012/13 – 2014/15 for the Adults, Health and Housing Directorate.

Cath Roff, Strategic Director for Adults, Health and Housing, gave a verbal report on some of the decisions that had been made.

The Commission discussed the Housing Revenue Account reforms and whether there would be re-investment if proposals were to go through. They also discussed the under occupation of some properties and whether occupants could be offered something more appropriate.

There was recognition about the increasing importance that Derby Care Link and physical adaptations would play in re-enablement. The Commission also discussed the importance of focusing support for carers, especially through the voluntary sector.

The Commission questioned the reduction in the Older People's Management function. It was reported that the savings would be found through the restructuring of the Older Peoples Management Function.

The Commission recognised the importance of the work carried out by Derby Advice and recommended that current staffing levels be maintained and not reduced by one post each year for two years 2012/2014.

The Commission questioned the reduction in supporting People Budget and raised concerns regarding the lack of detail in how these savings would be made. Members agreed that more information was needed ahead of the decision by the Council so that the Commission could properly assess the impact the budget savings would have on local services.

The Commission raised concerns regarding the planned closure of Warwick House, care home for older people, and questioned whether it was part of the budget proposals. It was explained that it had been part of a previous budget and that it would not close before the end of the current financial year. The Commission felt that there was no evidence to show that the closure of Warwick House would deliver efficiencies and savings.

Resolved:

- 1. The AHH Commission recommends that the current level of staff**

resource at Derby Advice is maintained. The Cabinet is proposing to a reduction of £22k in each of the two years 2012-2014, however the Commission feels that Derby Advice provides effective advice to residents which has protected or generated approximately £4.3m of savings for the benefit of the local community;

2. The Commission is provided with further information on the proposed saving in the Supporting People budget. The Commission was informed that the non statutory services are taking a bigger share of savings in this years budget and since Supporting People falls in the non statutory category, it is making a significant contribution to the savings. However the Commission felt there was insufficient information on the proposed reduction in Supporting People budget to enable them to fully assess the impact this will have on local services. The Commission noted that some savings contained in last years budget proposals were still yet to be achieved after more than 6 months into the financial year;
3. The Commission recommends the Cabinet does not to proceed with the closure of Warwick House as it is not convinced that the closure will achieve demonstrable financial savings or efficiencies. Although the closure of Warwick House is not included in this years budget proposals, the Council Cabinet had taken a decision to close this home no sooner than the end of the current financial year.
4. The Commission recognises that these are difficult times for the authority and that there will still be significant risks which have not been tested locally or nationally. Although options are limited, the Commission feels that proposals represent a significant reduction in the volume of services delivered by the authority and was concerned about the potential impact this would have on some the most vulnerable people in the city.

50/11 Updates on items from the November Forward Plan

a. Council Day Services for Older People: outcomes of consultation

The Commission received an update report on Council day services for older people from Phil Holmes, Head of Older Peoples Commissioning. On 19th July 2011 Council Cabinet decided to consult on a proposal to transfer services from Whitaker Road Day Centre to Morleston Street Day Centre and subsequently close Whitaker Road Day Centre by 31 March 2012. The consultation ran from 1 August to 24 October 2011. The report outlined the process followed, updates on the development of day opportunities for older people and feedback about the outcome of individual reviews for all day centre customers.

There was some discussion around the consultation process and whether it had met with legal requirements. It was reported that legal advice had been taken before the consultation process began to ensure that it would be robust.

Resolved:

1. to note the report;
2. to note that service users and stakeholders have been consulted.

b. Public consultation on changes to short term breaks and Day Service for People with Learning Disabilities

The Strategic Director for Adults, Health and Housing reported that Cabinet will be asked to approve a period of formal consultation about proposals to modernise short breaks currently provided by the Council at Ashlea Hostel and daytime services for people with learning disabilities currently provided at Wetherby Day Centre and locally based centres.

Resolved to note the update.

c. Local Investment Plan Refresh

The Strategic Director for Adults, Health and Housing reported that it was unlikely that there would be a Local Investment Plan as the Derby Housing Marketing Area would now be delivering the plans instead of Derby City Council.

Councillor Webb asked what impact this would have on Derby City Council's Core Strategy. The Strategic Director for Adults, Health and Housing reported that she had not seen it yet, but she would bring it to a future Commission meeting.

Resolved:

1. to note the update;
2. to receive Derby City Council's Core Strategy when it is available.

51/11 Commissions Response to Psychotherapy consultation

Mahroof Hussain, Overview and Scrutiny Manager, reported on the Commissions response to the Primary Care Trust's (PCT) Psychodynamic Psychotherapy Services consultation. The PCT's proposals involved initially reducing and eventually phasing out psychodynamic psychotherapy services, "to reflect lack of clinical evidence" whilst proposing an increase in Cognitive Behaviour Therapy and Dialectic Behaviour Therapy for a range of conditions.

There was some discussion around the importance of retaining some level of psychodynamic psychotherapy services. It was explained that there was evidence to suggest that those people who suffered from multiple disorders required psychodynamic psychotherapy.

Evidence showed that some measures had already been implemented by the PCT before the Commission had been consulted and that this appeared to have caused concern to some service users and staff. The lack of proper consultation appeared to have happened before and the Commission did not want to see it happen again.

Resolved:

- 1. that the Trust retains psychodynamic psychotherapy services as part of a balanced treatment service;**
- 2. that access to psychodynamic psychotherapy services is made fair and equitable across Derby and Derbyshire;**
- 3. that the Trust should seek to equalise rather than reduce the level and quality of service provision in Derby and Derbyshire.**

52/11 Retrospective Scrutiny

There were no items.

53/11 Council Cabinet Forward Plan

There were no items.

54/11 Matters referred to the Commission by Council Cabinet

There were no items.

MINUTES END