

Time commenced – 5.17pm
Time finished – 6.50pm

CONSERVATION AREA ADVISORY COMMITTEE 16 MARCH 2006

Present: Mr M Craven (Victorian Society) (in the Chair)
Mr P Billson (Derbyshire Historic Buildings Trust)
Mrs J D'Arcy (Derbys Archaeological Society)
Mrs A Hutchinson (Derby Civic Society)
Mr M Mallender (Co-opted)
Mr J Sharpe (Ancient Monument Society)
Mr B Wyatt (RIBA Nott's & Derby Society)

City Council Officers:

Mr H Hopkinson (Development and Cultural Services)
Mrs D Maltby (Development and Cultural Services)

64/05 Apologies

Apologies were received from Mr J James and Mr D Armstrong.

65/05 Late Items Introduced by the Chair

The Chair introduced one late item:

Code No. DER/1105/1901 – Demolition of existing building and erection of assessment centre and overnight accommodation at 93 Green Lane (former Chest Clinic)

66/05 Declarations of Interest

There were no declarations of interest.

67/05 Minutes of the Previous Meeting

The minutes of the meeting held on 16 February 2006 were confirmed as a correct record and signed by the Chair.

68/05 Railway Conservation Area Appraisal – Officer Draft

Harry Hopkinson updated the Committee on the officer – draft of the Railway Conservation Area Appraisal and reported that he had received feedback from some individual Members. The Appraisal was being prepared in association with the City Centre Eastern Fringes Area Action Plan which was

to become part of the statutory Local Development Framework. The Committee were asked for their comments on the Appraisal. The Committee felt that the appraisal report was very good and clearly written.

It was noted that the report identified the importance of the London Road area and it suggested that in the future, it could be a new Conservation Area. The Committee were informed that the Appraisal suggested some minor extensions to the Conservation Area boundary and put forward some design parameters for new development.

It was noted that the City Centre Eastern Area Action Plan would be promoting new development within the area in general accord with the aspirations of the Cityscape masterplan. The Committee were informed that a programme for further public consultation on the Fringes Area Action Plan had not been finalised but that Members would have the opportunity of commenting on the draft proposals in due course.

69/05 The George Rennie Award

The Committee discussed the criteria for the George Rennie Award and suggested the following nominations:

- Parker's Piece Cricket Pavilion
- The Royal Oak House
- 16 Arthur Street – Former Shop
- The Arboretum
- The Royal Building Canopy
- 37 – 39 Friar Gate Bridge
- 1 Queen Street
- Redbrook Terrace, Brook Street
- Mill House, Brook Street

70/05 Report on Applications Determined Since the Last Report

The Committee received an update on previous applications that had been determined since the last report.

71/05 Committee Report

The Committee considered a report of the Assistant Director – Development, concerning applications received and resolved to make the following comments:

City Centre Conservation Area

- a) Code No. DER/206/244 – Installation of roller shutters at 12 Market Place (Saks Hairdressing)

The Committee objected and recommended refusal on the grounds that the proposed perforated lath shutter would be harmful to the character/appearance of the Conservation Area and would be contrary to the Council's established Shop Front Security Policy. An open-mesh type grille, as the existing, would be more appropriate on these premises within the Conservation Area.

- b) Code Nos. DER/206/218 and DER/206/219 – Change of use from retail and offices and extension to form restaurant (Class A), 34 and 35 Sadler Gate

The Committee objected and recommended refusal on the grounds that the proposed rear extension and the level of proposed internal alteration would cause the loss of historic fabric and would be harmful to the historic character of the listed building for which there was no justification in this case. The proposed alteration to the shop front involving the removal of the entrance door to no. 35 would further be harmful to the character of the listed building which historically, had been used as two properties.

Friar Gate Conservation Area

- c) Code No. DER/106/156 – Display of non-illuminated company signage at 5 Vernon Street

The Committee objected and recommended refusal on the grounds that the introduction of external signage would be seriously detrimental to the dignified special character of this stuccoed Regency listed building and the unified, harmonious character of the street scene of Vernon Street within the Conservation Area. It was considered that any approval would set a most undesirable precedent for similar external advertisement matter on all other properties within the street. It was further considered that the fixing of external signage would be an unnecessary intrusion into the historic fabric.

- d) Code No. DER/206/214 – Change of use from office to hair salon on 2nd floor at 37 Friar Gate

The Committee had no objections subject to no implied approval to any associated internal alterations that may require the grant of listed building consent.

Mickleover Conservation Area

- e) Code No. DER/106/212 – Erection of a bungalow on land adjacent 9 The Hollow, Mickleover, access of Ingham Drive

The Committee had no objections to the principle of the proposed bungalow subject to it being sited as far as practicable away from the original house at 9 The Hollow and there being no subsequent

requirement to provide a new vehicular access from The Hollow to the existing property, no. 9 The Hollow, which would have a very serious impact on the character of this part of the Conservation Area..

Strutts Park Conservation Area

- f) Code No. DER/106/143 – Erection of six apartments, land at corner of North Street and Henry Street

The committee had no objections to the principle of the development but considered that the three-storey form on the Henry Street frontage was inappropriate and needed to be reduced to two storey height in order to relate to the smaller built form of Henry Street and in order to afford improvement to the proportions of the proposed, visually exposed gable elevation.

- g) Code No. DER/106/187 – Formation of rooms in roof space (bedroom and ensuite) and insertion of dormer, 3 Margaret Street

The Committee objected and recommended refusal on the grounds that the size and scale of the proposed roof-level extension was excessive and would appear as a discordant feature in the roofscape to the detriment of the appearance and character of the Conservation Area. It was further considered that the proposed installation of roof lights in the front roof slope would interrupt the continuity of the front roof slope to the detriment of the appearance and character of the Conservation Area.

- h) Code No. DER/206/251 – Formation of vehicular access at 8 Kedleston Road

The Committee had no objections.

- i) Code No. DER/206/335 – Erection of 165 apartments, site of 4 Orchard Street and adjacent land and buildings on St Helen's Street

The Committee had no objections and recommend refusal on the grounds that the proposed redevelopment is of an inappropriate height, scale and design for this area of high townscape value which includes the setting of the grade II listed Friends Meeting House and the grade I listed St Helens House. It was considered that proposal would have an over-bearing impact on the line of the new highway to be constructed as part of Connecting Derby, should this road scheme proceed. I

It was noted that an Archaeological Assessment had been submitted with the application and it was considered that the report recommendations should be implemented in full, including further pre-determination archaeological evaluation, in accordance with PPG 16. The absence of any assessment of the impact of the proposed development on the wider historic environment was noted with concern. It was requested that any revised proposals for the redevelopment of these sites should be

accompanied by an appropriate assessment of its impact on the historic environment, including full streetscape elevations and detailed drawings of the new development adequately showing architectural detailing, materials etc.

Late items

- j) Code No. DER/1105/1901 – Demolition of existing building and erection of assessment centre and overnight accommodation at 93 Green Lane (former Chest Clinic Building)

The Committee objected and recommend refusal on the grounds that, as previously advised, the existing building forms part of a very distinctive group of buildings within this section of Green Lane, including a number of statutorily listed buildings, and that it's demolition would seriously compromise the setting of the listed buildings, particularly that of the grade II* listed Arts School. The Committee considered it essential that the existing building should be partially retained to maintain the essence of the street scene with new development behind the retained portion along the Degge Street frontage.

Notwithstanding this view over the retention of the existing building, in terms of the design of the redevelopment proposal, the Committee considered that this was insufficiently related to the context of the site with particular concern being expressed over the two-storey height of the recessed panels containing windows on the Green Lane elevation, the poor manner in which the building turned the corner with the gable feature having no presence from the southerly direction and the lack of quality detailing throughout.

MINUTES END