



DERBY CITY COUNCIL

COUNCIL CABINET 26 APRIL 2005

Report of the Leader and Deputy Leader of the Council

The Review of the Council's Overview and Scrutiny Function – Proposals for a Revised Structure

RECOMMENDATION

- 1.1 To commend the Scrutiny Management Commission for its work in reviewing the current overview and scrutiny function, including options for reform.
- 1.2 To recommend Council to agree:
 - a) to adopt the scrutiny structure set out in Option 3b of the Commission's report
 - b) to approve the terms of reference of a four commission overview and scrutiny structure

SUPPORTING INFORMATION

- 2.1 We have considered the draft report on the Review of Derby City Council's Overview and Scrutiny function that the Scrutiny Management Commission has circulated to all members of the City Council.
- 2.2 We note that the IDeA facilitated workshop held on 22 January 2005 and attended by most Cabinet members, concluded that the overview and scrutiny commissions should have greater focus and provide greater support to the Council in delivering its priorities. It was also concluded that there was a need for an open and frank examination of the scrutiny commission structure to ensure it is fit for purpose.
- 2.3 We believe that the current six commission structure is too unwieldy and produces too many formal and informal meetings. This means that the time and energy of members is stretched too thinly and they are not able to undertake their scrutiny and policy review work as effectively as they might. The restricted availability of some members in the daytime and the demands of the Council's new licensing responsibilities contribute to these difficulties.

- 2.4 A smaller number of commissions, each with a cross cutting set of functions, would result in fewer meetings. This would free up members time to concentrate on more focussed, better quality, policy reviews and/or in-depth scrutiny reviews.
- 2.5 We are sure that the rest of the Council Cabinet would join us in emphasising our wish to work constructively with the overview and scrutiny commissions to the benefit of the Council and the citizens of Derby. We believe the Commissions play an important role in making the Council's decision-making effective and accountable.
- 2.6 For these reasons we are of the opinion that a scrutiny structure of the form shown in Option 3b of the Review of Scrutiny report would best meet the needs of the Council.
- 2.7 Appendix 2 of this report details some possible portfolio groupings for a four commission scrutiny structure of the form shown in Option 3b. We invite Council Cabinet to express a preference for one of these portfolio groupings, or for a different grouping.
- 2.8 An Internet trawl has shown that both Tameside and Trafford Metropolitan Borough Councils have overview and scrutiny structures that comprise four commissions or their equivalents. To provide additional information a comparison of the overview and scrutiny arrangements of these local authorities with Derby is shown in Appendix 3. If it is wished, arrangements can be made to visit these authorities to discuss their experience of operating a four commission overview and scrutiny structure.

For more information contact:

Background papers:

List of appendices:

Appendix 1 – Implications

Appendix 2 – Possible Commission portfolios for a scrutiny structure of the form shown in Option 3b of the Review of Scrutiny report

Appendix 3 – Comparison of Tameside and Trafford with Derby

IMPLICATIONS

Financial

1. None arising from this report.

Legal

2. None arising from this report.

Personnel

3. None arising from this report.

Equalities impact

4. Effective scrutiny will be of benefit to all Derby people.

Corporate Objectives, Values and Priorities

This report has the potential to link to all the Council's Objectives, Values and Priorities.

Appendix 2

Possible Four Commission Structure – Option 1

<p>Central Functions and Co-ordination Commission Corporate Council policies and strategies Corporate Legal, Administrative, Estates/Property Services and Repair and Maintenance Chief Executive's Policy, European, Best Value and Communications functions Corporate Finance and Financial Services including Taxation External Affairs – European, National, Regional and Local Democratic Representation Mayoral Office/Electoral Issues/Registrars Best Value Performance Plan and Derby Pointer Members Services/Allowances Corporate Personnel, Recruitment and Training functions and issues Employment training Health and Safety Corporate Equality Functions and Issues E-government, IT services/development and telecommunications Repairs and Maintenance Programmes Design Services Emergency Planning</p> <p><i>Community Governance and Consultation Community Regeneration and Development, including Community Planning Special Programmes Management including all Single Regeneration Budget Schemes New Deal for Communities</i></p>	<p>Retained from Scrutiny Management Commission portfolio</p> <p>Transferred from Community Regeneration Commission portfolio</p>
<p>Education Sport and Leisure Commission Schools Centrally Funded School Services, including Special Needs Youth Service Adult Education Mandatory and Discretionary Awards Access Support, including Ethnic Minority Achievement Grant (Role of Education Evaluation Panel)</p> <p><i>Community Centres and Council Activity Centres Arts and Libraries Assembly Rooms/Guildhall Museums/Art Gallery Outdoor events Sports and Play including Grants Leisure Centres and Coaching</i></p>	<p>Retained from Education Commission portfolio</p> <p>Transferred from Culture and Prosperity Commission portfolio</p>

<p><i>Tourism and Tourist Information Centre Festivities</i></p> <p><i>Cultural Diversity</i> <i>Community and Equalities Grants</i> <i>External Employment Initiatives</i></p>	<p>Transferred from Community Regeneration Commission portfolio</p>
<p>Housing, Health and Welfare Commission Children and Family Services Corporate Parenting Adult Services Assessment and Care Planning Social Services Support Services Health Improvement Planning Health Services</p> <p><i>Housing and Council Tax Benefits</i> <i>Welfare Rights</i> <i>Community Legal Services including Law Centre and Citizens Advice Bureau Crime and Disorder, including Youth Offending Service</i> <i>Housing Management</i> <i>Housing Strategy and Development</i> <i>Private Sector Housing</i> <i>Social Inclusion, including Anti-Poverty initiatives</i></p> <p><i>Environmental Health and Trading Standards</i></p>	<p>Retained from Social Care and Health portfolio</p> <p>Transferred from Culture and Prosperity Commission portfolio</p> <p>Transferred from Planning and Environment Commission portfolio</p>
<p>Planning, Environment and Transportation Commission Strategic Planning, including Traffic and Transportation Development Control and Building Control Footpaths, Highways and Maintenance, Car Parks Roads - Engineering and Design Service Highways Property Administration City Centre Management Licensing policy issues - Taxis/Entertainment etc Local Agenda 21 Strategy, Environmental Co-ordination and Initiatives Outdoor Amenities Client - Street Cleaning/Waste Collection and Disposal/Conveniences Recycling Land Drainage Energy Conservation Building cleaning All Direct Services Non-Highway Engineering Cemeteries and Crematorium</p> <p><i>Economic Development</i> <i>Parks and Allotments, including Client Grounds Maintenance</i></p> <p><i>Concessionary Fares</i></p>	<p>Retained from Planning and Environment Commission portfolio</p> <p>Transferred from Culture and Prosperity Commission portfolio</p> <p>Transferred from Scrutiny Management Commission portfolio</p>

Possible Four Commission Structure – Option 2

1. Central Functions and Co-ordination Commission

Corporate Council policies and strategies
Corporate Legal, Administrative, Estates/Property Services and Repair and Maintenance
Chief Executive's Policy, European, Best Value and Communications functions
Corporate Finance and Financial Services including Taxation
External Affairs – European, National, Regional and Local
Democratic Representation
Mayoral Office/Electoral Issues/Registrars
Concessionary Fares and Emergency Planning
Best Value Performance Plan and Derby Pointer
Members Services/Allowances
Corporate Personnel, Recruitment and Training functions and issues
Employment training
Health and Safety
Corporate Equality Functions and Issues
E-government, IT services/development and telecommunications
Repairs and Maintenance Programmes
Design Services
Emergency Planning

2. Children and Young People

Schools
Play schemes
Centrally Funded School Services, including Special Needs
Youth Service
Children and Family Social Services
Corporate Parenting
Assessment and Care Planning
Health Improvement Planning - children
Children's Health Services

3. Environment, Planning and Housing

Strategic Planning, including Traffic and Transportation
External Employment Initiatives
Economic Development
Tourism and Tourist Information Centre
Parks and Allotments, including Client Grounds Maintenance
Development Control and Building Control
Footpaths, Highways and Maintenance, Car Parks
Roads - Engineering and Design Service
Highways Property Administration
City Centre Management
Licensing policy issues - Taxis/Entertainment etc
Local Agenda 21 Strategy, Environmental Co-ordination and Initiatives

Environmental Health and Trading Standards
Outdoor Amenities
Client - Street Cleaning/Waste Collection and Disposal/Conveniences
Recycling
Land Drainage
Energy Conservation
Building cleaning
All Direct Services
Non-Highway Engineering
Housing Management
Housing Strategy and Development
Private Sector Housing
Supporting People
Housing Options

4. Adult and Community Regeneration

Adult Social Services
Health Improvement Planning - adults
Adult Health Services
Adult Education
Mandatory and Discretionary Awards
Access Support, including Ethnic Minority Achievement Grant
Community Centres and Council Activity Centres
Arts and Libraries
Assembly Rooms/Guildhall
Museums/Art Gallery
Outdoor events
Sports including Grants
Leisure Centres and Coaching
Festivities
Cemeteries and Crematorium
Community Cohesion and Social Inclusion
Community Governance and Consultation
Community Regeneration and Development, including Community Planning
Special Programmes Management including all Single Regeneration Budget Schemes
New Deal for Communities
Cultural Diversity
Housing and Council Tax Benefits
Welfare Rights
Community Legal Services including Law Centre and Citizens Advice Bureau
Crime and Disorder, including Youth Offending Service

Possible Four Commission Structure – Option 3 – Based on Cabinet Portfolios

COMMISSION 1	
1. Corporate Policy Corporate Council Policies and Strategies Corporate Finance and Financial Services including Taxation Corporate Legal and Administrative Services Corporate Communications European Policy Local Strategic Partnership Sub Regional Strategic Partnership External Affairs – European, National, Regional and Local Mayoral Office/Electoral Issues/Registrars Emergency Planning Members Services/Allowances Markets	2. Performance Management, Economic Development and Housing Performance Management Best Value functions Best Value Performance Plan Estates, Property Services and Repair and Maintenance Building Design Services External Employment Initiatives Economic Development Housing Management Client Housing Strategy and Development Private Sector Housing Homelessness Tourism and TIC City Centre Management Computer Services Development, Telecommunications and e-Government
COMMISSION 2	
3. Community Regeneration Social Inclusion Housing and Council Tax Benefits Derby Advice, including Home Energy Advice Community Legal Services including Law Centre and Citizens Advice Bureau Youth Service Community Safety Partnership Community Centres Community Grants and Equality Grants Community Governance and Consultation Community Regeneration and Development, including Community Planning Community Strategy and Neighbourhood Renewal Strategy Community Cohesion Derby Pointer Panel Area Neighbourhood Working, including Area Panels	4. Social Care and Youth Children and Family Services Adult Services Assessment and Care Planning Social Services Support Services Health Improvement Planning Health Services Partnerships Supporting People Youth Service

<p>New Deal for Communities Special Programmes Management, including all Single Regeneration Budget Schemes, Neighbourhood Renewal Fund and European Objective 2 and URBAN</p>	
COMMISSION 3	
<p>5. Lifelong Learning Schools, including Repairs and Maintenance Centrally funded Schools Services, including Special Needs Adult Education Mandatory and Discretionary Awards Access Support, including Ethnic Minority Achievement Grant</p>	<p>7. Leisure and Cultural Services Arts and Libraries Assembly Rooms, Guildhall Museums, Art Gallery Festivities Outdoor Events Parks and Allotments, including all non-highway Client Grounds Maintenance City Centre and Neighbourhood Horticultural Features Sports and Play including Grants Leisure Centres and Coaching Health and Fitness</p>
COMMISSION 4	
<p>6. Planning, Transportation and Environment Planning and Building Control Strategic Planning and Transportation including Car Parking Strategy Footpaths, Highways and Maintenance Roads – Engineering and Design Services Highways Property Administration Local Agenda 21 Strategy, Environment Co-ordination and Initiatives Client – Street Cleaning/Waste Collection and Disposal/Public Conveniences/Highways Grounds Maintenance Recycling Land Drainage Energy Conservation</p>	<p>8. Personnel, Equalities and Direct Services Corporate Personnel, Recruitment and Training functions Employment Training Health and Safety Corporate Equalities Functions and Issues All Direct Services Non-Highway Engineering Cemeteries and Crematorium Environmental Health and Trading Standards On-Street and off-street Car parking (other than car parking strategy)</p>

Derby	Tameside	Trafford
Unitary Authority	Metropolitan Borough	Metropolitan Borough
Population 221,708	Population 213,043	Population 210,145
17 Wards	19 Wards	21 Wards
51 Councillors	57 Councillors	63 Councillors
Six Overview and Scrutiny Commissions <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Scrutiny Management • Community Regeneration • Culture and Prosperity • Education • Planning and Environment • Social Care and Health 	Four Scrutiny Panels <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Personal Health and Service • Lifelong Learning and Cultural Services • Technical, Economic and Environmental Services • Resources and Community Services 	Four Scrutiny Committees <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Pivotal • Community • Technical • Education