

Time commenced – 5.31pm
Time finished – 7.21pm

CONSERVATION AREA ADVISORY COMMITTEE 15 DECEMBER 2005

Present: Mr K Hamilton (Twentieth Century Society) (in the Chair)
Mr M Craven (Victorian Society)
Mr D Armstrong (Co-opted)
Mr P Billson (Derbyshire Historic Buildings Trust)
Mrs J D'Arcy (Derbys Archaeological Society)
Mrs A Hutchinson (Derby Civic Society)
Mr J James (Chamber of Commerce)
Mr M Mallender (Co-opted)
Councillor Travis
Mr B Wyatt (RIBA Nott's & Derby Society)

City Council Officers:

Mr H Hopkinson (Development and Cultural Services)
Mrs D Maltby (Development and Cultural Services)

41/05 Apologies

Apologies were received from Councillor Tittley, Mrs C Craven, Mr C Glenn and Mr J Sharpe.

42/05 Late Items Introduced by the Chair

There were no late items.

43/05 Declarations of Interest

Mr Mallender declared an interest in item numbers DER/1105/1888
DER/1105/1865 & 1105/1866.

44/05 Minutes of the Previous Meeting

The minutes of the meeting held on 3 November 2005 were confirmed as a correct record and signed by the Chair.

45/05 Report of Decisions Taken by the Chairman on 25 November 2005

The Committee confirmed all the decisions made by the Chairman as set out in the notes of that briefing previously circulated.

46/05 A Proposal for a New Interpretation Panel to be Provided at Osnasbruck Square

Harry Hopkinson presented a proposal for an interpretation panel in Osnasbruck Square. The proposed panel would wraparound the existing shrubbery and be complimentary to the street scene.

The Committee noted the proposal.

47/05 Report on Applications Determined Since the Last Report

The Committee received an update on previous applications that had been determined since the last report.

48/05 Committee Report

The Committee considered a report of the Assistant Director – Development, concerning applications received and resolved to make the following comments:

Allestree Conservation Area

- a) Code No DER/1105/1904 – Internal alterations to listed building, 8 Cornhill, Allestree

The Committee objected and recommended refusal on the grounds that the proposed new door opening involved the unjustified loss of historic fabric and plan-form. The Committee had no objections in principle to the proposed alterations to the existing door openings but considered that historic joinery/doors should be retained and reused.

- b) Code No DER/1105/1918 – Extension to Village Hall (office and wc), 1 Cornhill, Allestree

The Committee objected and recommended refusal on the grounds that the proposed flat-roofed extension was totally unsympathetic to the character of the existing pitched-roofed village hall and would therefore fail to preserve or enhance the character/appearance of the Conservation Area. The Committee had no objections to the principle of an extension in the general position shown on the submitted plan but considered that it should be designed with a pitched roof and details to match that of the existing building and employ matching materials in its construction.

City Centre Conservation Area

- c) Code No DER/1105/1888 – Alterations to listed building to insert fire doors, 40 St Mary’s Gate

The Committee raised no objections.

Friar Gate Conservation Area

- d) Code No DER/1105/1865 & 1105/1866 – Erection of offices, site of 7 Mill Street

The Committee raised no objections subject to the details of the development appropriately matching those of the existing building and the use of traditional materials/detail being to the satisfaction of the Council’s conservation officer.

- e) Code No DER/1005/1760 – Display of various signage, 6 Friar Gate

The Committee objected and recommended refusal on the grounds that the proposed application of an aluminium fascia and the introduction of the stainless- steel, illuminated letter sign would be uncharacteristic to the architectural/historic character of this listed building. The Committee also objected to the proposed two ornamental lamp columns at the entrance on the grounds that these would seriously detract from the Bakewell railings across the building frontage and the setting of the building generally.

Nottingham Road Conservation Area

- f) Code No DER/1005/1788 – Demolition of boundary wall and premises, 52 Keys Street and adjacent contractor’s yard

The Committee noted the supporting information/justification that the applicant had now submitted in support of the proposed demolition but considered that this failed to demonstrate that sufficient efforts had been made to market the building for its current commercial use. Notwithstanding this issue, the Committee considered that the applicant’s case against a scheme of conversion of the frontage building to Keys Street to a residential use was unconvincing and that the suggested conversion/redevelopment costings needed independent assessment based on a more conservation-orientated approach to repair/stabilisation. It was therefore recommended that the application be refused on the grounds that inadequate justification had been made for the demolition of this building which makes a positive contribution to the appearance and character of the Conservation Area.

Strutts Park Conservation Area

- g) Code No DER/905/1577 - Erection of a detached garage, changes to the rear and DER/905/1620 elevation: replacement of basement kitchen window replacement of rear entrance door at cellar level, installation of French doors to the rear elevation at cellar level and changes to the front elevation: replace fanlight above front door and

installation of decorative security railings to the front elevation of the property, 4 North Parade, Derby

The Committee commented on each aspect of this proposal as follows:-

The Committee had considered the application for the proposed new garage at it's previous meeting on the 3 November 2005 when it had recommended refusal on the grounds that the proposal, being of taller proportions and with a roof alignment contrary to that of the listed terrace, was even more harmful to the appearance and setting of the listed building than the previous proposal that had been recommended for refusal. Particular concern was also expressed over the inappropriate nature of the double-width up and over garage door.

No objection to the replacement basement window subject to satisfactory joinery details.

Whilst noting that the proposed replacement rear door was an improvement upon the existing hardboard solid door, the Committee considered that the applicant should be encouraged towards a reinstatement of an original door pattern as may be found on a nearby property.

It was noted that the replacement of the existing window with French doors had been previously approved.

No objection to the replacement fanlight subject to details exactly matching the original.

No objections to the railings across the building frontage subject to these matching the detail of the adjacent railings.

Objection to the proposed grille over the basement-light on the grounds that the design was excessive and over-elaborate. It was suggested that a far more simple arrangement should be devised perhaps based an example of a nearby property.

Others

- h) Code No DER/1105/1866 and DER/704/1380 – Demolition of wall and pillars and amendments to include the erection of a 1.2m high wall, at Stafford Street

The Committee raised no objections subject to no demolition taking place other than as part of the implementation of Connecting Derby road proposals and a full record of the wall being taken prior to it's demolition and also subject to the wall being dismantled/rebuilt on a new alignment as part of a single operation and to it's original height and to the same detail (including brick-bond) as the existing.

- i) Code No. DER/1105/1901 – Demolition of existing building and erection of Assessment Centre and Overnight Accommodation at the site of 93 Green Lane

The Committee objected and recommend refusal on the grounds that the proposed new development would have a seriously detrimental effect on the setting of the nearby grade II* and grade II listed buildings by virtue of its excessive height, scale, mass and inadequate detailing. It was noted that no.93 Green Lane forms part of a very distinctive group of buildings within this section of Green Lane that included a number of statutorily listed buildings and that the proposal involved the demolition of the existing Victorian building and its replacement with a new four storey brick built building. It was considered that a suitable scheme could be devised involving the retention of the existing building fronting Green Lane and the redevelopment of the buildings/area to the rear.

Chair of the next ensuing meeting
at which these minutes were signed