

Time commenced – 5.15pm
Time finished – 8.05pm

CONSERVATION AREA ADVISORY COMMITTEE 15 JULY 2004

Present:

Mrs J D'Arcy (Derby Archaeological Society) (in the Chair)
Mr P Billson (Derbyshire Historical Buildings Trust)
Mr R Pegg (Derby Civic Society)
Mr J James (Chamber of Commerce)
Mr D Armstrong (Co-opted)
Mr M Mallender (Co-opted)
Councillor Marshall
Councillor Roberts
Councillor Travis

City Council Officers:

Mr H Hopkinson (Development and Cultural Services)
Mrs C Oswald (Development and Cultural Services)

Apologies:

Mr K Hamilton (Twentieth Century Society)
Mr M Craven (Victorian Society)
Mrs C Craven (Georgian Group)
Mr J Sharpe (Ancient Monuments Society)
Mr C Glenn (IHBC East Midlands)
Councillor Liversedge
Councillor Tittley
Councillor Willitts

01/04 Appointment of Chair

Agreed to appoint Mrs Joan D'Arcy as Chair for the meeting.

02/04 Appointment of Chair for the Ensuing Municipal Year

Agreed to appoint Mr Keith Hamilton as Chair for the ensuing municipal year.

03/04 Appointment of Vice Chair for the Ensuing Municipal Year

Agreed to appoint Mr Max Craven as Vice Chair for the ensuing municipal year.

04/04 Late Items Introduced by the Chair

The Chair agreed to admit one item on the former site of St Mary's RC Primary School – DER/204/185 & DER/204/186 as a late item.

05/04 Declarations of Interest

Mr J James declared a personal prejudicial interest in DER/204/185 and DER/204/186 – Demolition of school and erection of four dwellings and 18 apartments, part of former St Mary's School, corner of Darley Lane and Edward Street. He also declared a personal prejudicial interest in DER/104/65 and DER/104/66 – 38 Ashbourne Road and land adjacent to 85 Markeaton Street.

Mr Mallender declared a personal prejudicial interest in DER/604/1141 – Demolition of brick chimney from coach house and installation of fixed valley gutter, 35 and 36 St Mary's Gate.

06/04 Report on applications determined since the last report dated 4 June 2004

The Committee received an update on previous applications that had been determined since the last report, dated 4 June 2004.

07/04 Committee Report

The Committee considered a report of the Assistant Director - Development concerning applications received and resolved to make the following comments:

City Centre Conservation Area

- a) Code No. DER/604/1141 – Demolition of brick chimney from coach house and installation of fixed valley gutter, 35 and 36 St Mary's Gate
 - The Committee recommended refusal of the application on the grounds that the demolition of the brick chimney would be detrimental to the historic fabric of the curtilage building to the grade II* listed building and to the character of this part of the Conservation Area.

Mr Mallender having declared an interest in the above item left the meeting during discussion and voting thereon.

- b) Code No. DER/604/1210, DER/604/1211 & DER/604/1216 – Installation of mezzanine floor and installation of new windows, 9 Strand. (The Old Institute PH)

- No objections in principle to the external alterations on the elevation to the Strand, however, the Committee showed concern over the proposed extension to the internal mezzanine floor and its impact on the character of the internal space. The Committee requested that this part of the proposal be amended in order to maintain the elliptical relationship to the original internal space.

City Centre Conservation Area

- c) Code No. DER/604/1120 – Alterations to form public bar with toilets, kitchen, office and staff room, and installation of staircase, 10 Wardwick
- No objections in principle to the proposed alterations, however, the Committee deferred detailed comments to the Chairman and Vice Chairman following an internal inspection of the building, which was to be arranged as soon as possible after the meeting.

Friar Gate Conservation Area

- d) Code No. DER/604/1091 & DER/604/1159 – Repair and rebuild boundary wall including railings and gate and erection of summer house at 15 South Street
- No objections subject to details of materials and design of railings being presented to the satisfaction of Officers.
- e) Code No. DER/604/1127 – Formation of car park in rear yard, 93 Friar Gate
- No objections in principle, however, the Committee had concerns in relation the practicalities of the proposed car parking layout and the potential impact on mature trees adjacent to the site. It was requested that views of the Arboricultural Officer be sought.
- f) Code No. DER/604/1160 – Construction of gates to side of building at 3 George Street
- No objections.
- g) Code No. DER/604/1234 – 38 Ashbourne Road and land adjacent to 85 Markeaton Street
- No objections subject to no demolition taking place until a contract had been let for the redevelopment of the site.

Mr James having declared an interest in the above item left the meeting during discussion and voting thereon.

- h) Code No. DER/604/1138 – Conversion to Brasserie (A3 Use) – Internal alterations to remove existing mezzanine floors and screens and replace with new mezzanine floors and glazed screens, St Werburgh's Church, Friar Gate

- No objections in principle, although the Committee noted the following concerns:
 - The possible impact of the proposed use on the adjoining consecrated Johnson Chapel. It was felt that increased sound levels could have an adverse effect on the structure of the building. The Committee recommended sufficient sound proofing measures be implemented.
 - The use of surrounding external space which was formerly a graveyard, to be used as drinking and dining areas. The Committee requested that this type of use be prevented from these sensitive areas.
 - The bearing of the new mezzanine floor structure into the original stone columns of the church which could cause irreversible harm to the historic fabric of the building.
 - The visibility of the proposed ventilation terminals from the kitchen area on the roof slope. It was suggested that these could be redesigned in a way to disguise their function or relocated to a position which was not visible from street level.
 - The existing footpaths across the front of the church should be retained in their present form.

It was also requested that a watching archaeological brief be required during any excavations.

- i) Code No. DER/604/1153 – Change of use of ground floor and basement to bar/restaurant, including glazed roof to external void fronting Friar Gate, raising paved area for disabled access and new railings and gate across steps (Planning Permission), 100-102 Friar Gate & car park to rear of Stafford Street
- j) Code No. DER/604/1167 – Construction of fire resistant partition to rear of two ground floor doors, in connection with change of use of ground floor to bar/restaurant (Listed Building Consent), Part of 100 Friar Gate

- The Committee reiterated their previous comments on this scheme:

‘The Committee recommended refusal of the application on the grounds that the proposed change of use would be contrary to the presently restrained and dignified character of this part of the Conservation Area. It was also considered that the addition of physical elements such as lighting, signage, seating, tables and patio areas would be detrimental to the setting of the listed buildings and to the appearance of the Conservation Area. Serious concerns were also raised over the scale of the internal alterations and their impact on the historic building fabric of no. 99 (grade II*), no. 100 (grade II) and no’s 100-102 (locally listed).’

- k) Code No. DER/604/1149 – Change of use of ground floor and basement to bar/restaurant and change of use of second floor to two apartments including removal of part of chimney stack on ground floor and second floor, blocking up opening and creating opening between 100 and 102

- The Committee reiterated their previous comments on this scheme:

- No objections to the principle of a residential conversion, but the Committee raised concern in relation to the physical impact the proposed work could have on the historic fabric of the listed building.

l) Code No. DER/604/1152 – Demolition of existing two storey building and adjoining links to Stafford House and 102 Friar Gate (Conservation Area Consent), 4-6 Stafford Street

m) Code No. DER/604/1151 – Erection of four storey apartment block comprising 16 units (Planning Permission), Site of 4-6 car park to rear of 4-10 Stafford Street

- The Committee reiterated their previous comments on this scheme:

‘The Committee recommended refusal of the application on the grounds that the design of the proposed four storey development was considered to be poorly articulated and poorly proportioned in relation to the adjacent buildings, with inappropriate detailing of the roof, eaves and stone facing at ground floor level. It was considered that the storey heights in the new development should reflect those of adjacent buildings as expressed by their external elevation. It was noted that accordingly a building of the height proposed should be three storeys only.

It was also considered that, in the absence of a satisfactory form of redevelopment of the site, the application for Conservation Area Consent for the demolition of the existing building was premature and should be refused.’

n) Code No. DER/604/1150 – Change of use of second floor to two apartments (Planning Permission), 101-102, part of 100 Friar Gate & car park to rear of 4-10 Stafford

- The Committee reiterated their previous comments on this scheme:

‘No objection to the principle of residential conversion but the Committee raised concern over the physical impact of the proposed works on the historic fabric of the listed building.’

o) Code No. DER/604/1154 – Change of use from offices to six apartments, 8-10 & car park to rear of 4-10 Stafford Street

- The Committee reiterated their previous comments on this scheme:

‘No objection subject to appropriate detailing and routing of services, materials, sample brickwork and details of railings and gates. The Committee also requested that the proposal included the reinstatement of the missing ridge chimney stack from no. 8 Stafford Street.’

Spondon Conservation Area

p) Code No. DER/604/1148 – Erection of dwelling house, land at Orchard Cottage, 23 Church Street, Spondon

- The Committee recommended that, in accordance with the advice of PPG15, this application for outline planning permission should not be determined without further details of the proposed dwelling house. This was in order that proper account could be taken of its impact within the street scene and on adjacent trees and boundary walls, all of which contribute greatly to the appearance and character of this part of the Conservation Area.

q) Code No. DER/104/156 & DER/104/157 – Extension to dwelling (Conservatory), 57 Chapel Street, Spondon

- No objection in principle subject to details of the proposed conservatory being to the satisfaction of Officers.

Railway Conservation Area

r) Code No. DER/604/1178 & DER/604/1179 – Alteration to vehicular access, relocation of entrance gates, erection of brick pier, fence panel boundary fence Midland Hotel, Midland Road, Derby

- No objections.

Strutts Park Conservation Area

s) Code No. DER/204/185 & DER/204/186 – Demolition of school buildings and erection of 4 townhouses and 18 apartments, site of former St Mary's RC Primary School, corner of Darley Lane and Edward Street

- The Committee noted that the minor detailed amendments that had been made to the proposal since it was last considered, had not addressed its fundamental objections to the proposed height and scale. The previous concerns were reiterated:

'The Committee strongly recommended refusal of the application on the grounds that it would be overdominant within the street scene and would therefore be detrimental to the appearance and character of the Conservation Area. It was requested that consideration be given to the possibility of the conversion and reuse of existing school buildings in preference to their demolition. However, despite these concerns, the Committee did welcome the proposed use of natural materials.'

Mr James having declared an interest in the above item left the meeting during discussion and voting thereon.

t) Code No. DER/604/1221 – Replacement of three windows to front of dwelling, 46 Arthur Street

- No objections.

- u) Code No. DER/604/1135 – Retention of windows and door to dwellings, 10 Joseph Wright Terrace, Arthur Street
- The Committee recommended refusal of the application on the grounds that the materials of construction were inappropriate to the Conservation Area. It was considered that the small development of terraced houses would not have been approved with uPVC windows and should approval be given, it would be contrary to an established policy approach, that is applied consistently to new developments within Conservation Areas.
- v) Code No. DER/604/1133 – Extension to dwelling house (enlargement of kitchen), 16 Otter Street
- No objections subject to the use of matching materials.
- w) Code No. DER/604/1143 – Extensions and alterations to dwelling, to form utility, laundry room, shower room, garage, kitchen, dining room, studio, dressing room, en-suite and enlargement of existing bedroom, Brent Cottage, Burleigh Drive
- The Committee reiterated their previous comments on this scheme, noting that only very minor amendments had been made to the scheme as previously submitted:

'The Committee recommended refusal of the application on the grounds that the proposed extension is over-intensive and would cause the loss of the historic character of the existing building which makes a substantial contribution to this part of the Conservation Area.'
- x) Code No. DER/504/971 – Display of internally illuminated signage – 40 Arthur Street
- The Committee recommended refusal of the application on the grounds that the proposed internally illuminated box signs would be seriously detrimental to the appearance of this part of the Conservation Area. The Committee did, however, suggest that more traditional board signs be used in conjunction with external illumination, which would be more appropriate to the Conservation Area.

Others

- y) Code No. DER/604/1104 – Display of pole mounted information sign at Littleover Grange, 457 Burton Road, Littleover
- No objections.
- z) Code No. DER/604/1087 – Installation of Fir Escape, Stairway and door to banqueting suite at Littleover Grange, 457 Burton Road, Littleover
- No objections.

aa)Code No. DER/604/1158 – Replacement of damaged faience brickwork, internal alterations to facilitate disabled persons access, refurbishment of existing WCs and provision of disabled persons WC at Walkers Bingo and Social Club, Green Lane

- No objections subject to the use of matching materials.

bb)Code No. DER/604/1036 – Alterations and extension to Social Club, 33 Boulton Lane, Derby (Nunsfield House)

- No objections.

08/04 Policy Review

It was agreed at the last meeting of the Committee that the proposed amendments to the City Centre Conservation Area boundary were the final recommendations of the Committee subject to the Chair making any minor changes to the supporting text.

The Committee requested that the final amendments be formally considered by the City Council and confirmed in due course.

09/04 Redevelopment of the Haslam's Work Site, City Road, Chester Green

It was advised that this item had been withdrawn at the request of the developer, Miller Homes, who was still awaiting responses from various organisations that would have a direct bearing on the design philosophy for the site.

It was requested that this item be considered at the next meeting of the Committee which would take place on 12 August 2004.

MINUTES END