

ITEM 5

Time Commenced: 17:15
Time Finished: 19:25

CONSERVATION AREA ADVISORY COMMITTEE `` 25 January 2018

Present: Maxwell Craven (Chair) – Georgian Group
Chris Collison – Co-optee
Joan D'Arcy – Derbyshire Archaeological Society
Ian Goodwin – Derby Civic Society
David Ling – Derby Civic Society
Chris Twomey – Royal Institute of British Architects
Paul McLocklin – Chamber of Commerce
Cllr Mike Carr – Elected Member
Cllr Robin Turner – Elected Member
Cllr Robin Wood – Elected Member
Cllr Jack Stanton – Elected Member

Officers in Attendance Chloe Oswald – Conservation Team Leader
Stephen Bate – Senior Planning Officer
Jackie Waring – Democratic Services Officer

40/17 Apologies

Apologies were received from Carole Craven, John Sharpe and Cllr Jack Stanton

41/17 Late Items to be introduced by the Chair

Chair accepted a late item DER/12/17//01643 – The Fireplace Workshop Ltd, Wyvern Way.

42/17 Declarations of Interest

There were no declarations of interest

43/17 Confirmation of the Minutes of the Meeting held on 7 December 2017

The minutes of the meeting held on 7 December 2017 were agreed as an accurate record.

44/17 George Rennie Awards

An annual award is made by CAAC in memory of a former long standing Conservative Officer for the city. Chloe Oswald reminded the Committee of the nominations they made for this award over the last two years and asked for nominations for 2017.

Discussions were held on amending the award title slightly to include the word 'conservation' and adding a couple of paragraphs detailing the background to the award onto the relevant section of the council website.

Resolved to:

- 1. Email nominations for the 2017 to be sent to Chloe Oswald before the next Committee meeting on 8 March.**
- 2. Suggest suitable dates for the award night presentations to Chloe Oswald**

45/17 Items Determined since the last meeting

The Committee received an update on previous applications that had been determined since the last report.

Resolved to note the report.

46/17 Applications not being considered following consultation with the Chair

A report of the Strategic Director of Communities and Place, detailing matters not brought before the committee for comment following consultation with the Chair, was considered.

Resolved to note the report.

47/17 Applications to be considered

The committee received a report presented on behalf of the Strategic Director of Communities and Place on the applications requiring consideration by the Committee.

City Centre Conservation Area

Application No. & DER/12/17/01669 - 11 Iron Gate, Derby (Slug and Lettuce)

Location:

Proposal: Installation of a fascia sign, a projecting sign and the retention of the installation of two internally illuminated menu boards

Expiry Date: 16/02/2018

Listed Building: GD2

<https://eplanning.derby.gov.uk/online-applications/plan/12/17/01669>

Resolution

No Objection: Committee felt the proposed lettering was clearer than the existing lettering. However, they requested more information on halo lighting so its acceptability could be assessed.

City Centre Conservation Area

Application No. & DER/12/17/01668 - 11 Iron Gate, Derby (Slug and Lettuce)

Location:

Proposal: Display of one halo illuminated fascia sign and one externally illuminated projecting sign and retention of two internally illuminated menu boards

Expiry Date: 16/02/2018

Listed Building: GD2

<https://eplanning.derby.gov.uk/online-applications/plan/12/17/01668>

Resolution

No Objection: Committee felt the proposed lettering was clearer than the existing lettering. However, they requested more information on halo lighting so its acceptability could be assessed.

.

Darley Abbey Conservation Area

Application No. & DER/05/17/00567 - Darley Park, Darley Abbey, Derby

Location:

Proposal: Construction of a multi user path and ancillary works

Expiry Date: 19/10/2017

Listed Building:

<https://eplanning.derby.gov.uk/online-applications/plan/05/17/00567>

Resolution

Object and recommend refusal: Committee repeated their concerns over width of path stating it is visually too intrusive. If path width was maintained Committee felt separate pedestrian/cycle lanes should be designated but really cyclists should be directed to cycle path on other river bank. Although new bridge proposal is of a better design it was felt it would not slow down cyclists. For path edging Committee stated preference of metal or timber but proposal was of no great concern, as edging will soften over time. Discussion was held on the colour of the gravel as Committee felt this of great importance.

Darley Abbey Conservation Area

Application No. & DER/01/18/00007 - 12 Brick Row, Darley Abbey, Derby

Location:

Proposal: Alterations to the west elevation to include the re-positioning of an extraction vent, installation of an air brick and replacement windows

Expiry Date: 27/02/2018

Listed Building: G2S

<https://eplanning.derby.gov.uk/online-applications/plan/01/18/00007>

Resolution

No objection: Committee welcomed this application

Friar Gate Conservation Area

Application No. & DER/11/15/01451 - Site of 8-14 Agard Street, Derby, DE1 1DZ

Location:

Proposal: Student accommodation block containing 70 studios and 23 cluster flats and associated works including demolition of existing buildings on site

Expiry Date: 24/02/2016

Listed Building:

<https://eplanning.derby.gov.uk/online-applications/plan/11/15/01451>

Resolution

Object and repeat objection made at previous committee meeting on 21 January 2016

"Amended plans do not ameliorate impact on Cons Area. Heritage Impact submission is inadequate. Concerned at few open areas, intensifying the canyon

effect. Increased impact on existing student accommodation. Continued impact on heritage assets of Friar Gate. Acknowledge stronger HE objection, including recent advice on protecting setting of Listed Buildings.

With several proposals in vicinity, decisions should not be taken in isolation. Need to have policy statement on urban design issues/tall buildings along Agard Street. Should set a marker of the former railway/bridge, with no taller buildings further west. Tall tax office building should not set a precedent. Need to be proactive in advising/educating developers."

Friar Gate Conservation Area

Application No. & DER/11/15/01451 –Rear of 8-12 Agard Street, Derby DE1 1DZ
Location:

The committee:

- 1) Emphatically recommended refusal on the grounds that the proposed development:
 - a. will neither enhance nor otherwise improve the conservation area but will inflict significant and substantial harm on the conservation area; and
 - b. will directly affect in a negative way the significance and setting of Pickford's House Museum, a Grade-I listed building, and its garden, the function of which depends heavily on the authenticity of its environment, as well as directly affecting the setting of three other Grade-II* listed buildings (27, 42 and 99 Friar Gate) along with a large number of contiguous Grade-II listed buildings.
- 2) Commented that the size, massing, context (lack of contextual study) and design was wholly inappropriate for such a sensitive area, and that the loss of 8, 10 and 12, Agard Street, the final few original 19th century artisans' cottages here (one with a largely intact artisan's workshop and carriage entrance), would also substantially diminish the integrity of the Conservation Area.

Friar Gate Conservation Area

Application No. & DER/01/17/00002 - 11 Mill Street, Derby, DE1 1DY
Location:

Proposal: Two storey extension and change of use from retail and business (use class A1/B1) to eight apartments (use class C3) including alterations to the elevations

Expiry Date: 11/05/2017

Listed Building:

<https://eplanning.derby.gov.uk/online-applications/plan/01/17/00002>

Resolution

No objection subject to officers negotiating materials used for doors

Friar Gate Conservation Area

Application No. & DER/02/17/00227 - 30-31 Friar Gate, Derby, DE1 1BX

Location:

Proposal: Repair works to the listed building, installation of a new shopfront and erection of new access block to the rear of the existing. Erection of a new detached apartments building to the rear of the site.

Expiry Date: 01/08/2017

Listed Building: GD2

<https://eplanning.derby.gov.uk/online-applications/plan/02/17/00227>

Resolution

Object and Recommend refusal: Some improvements had been made in the amended plans, such as repairs to windows rather than replacement. Committee still raised concerns over size, in particular the height, of the fascia. It was felt there was a need to reduce the signage to give a greater gap below first floor windows. Discussion was held about the rear roof design. CAAC stated this seemed strange; could one cat-slide roof not be possible (although note that this was not raised previously). Committee also questioned whether the façade could be cleaned of paint, to return to brickwork. (If front fascia sign issue could be resolved, the objection would be removed).

Friar Gate Conservation Area

Application No. & DER/02/17/00226 - 30-31 Friar Gate, Derby, DE1 1BX

Location:

Proposal: Change of use to mixed use on ground floor (retention of retail use (Use Class A1), and Use Class A2 and A3 use, with residential units on the upper floors (8 units). Installation of a new shopfront and extensions to form new access to the rear of the existing building. Erection of two storey building to rear to form four further residential units. (12 units in total)

Expiry Date: 01/08/2017

Listed Building: GD2

<https://eplanning.derby.gov.uk/online-applications/plan/02/17/00226>

Resolution

Object and Recommend refusal: Some improvements had been made in the amended plans, such as repairs to windows rather than replacement. Committee still raised concerns over size, in particular the height, of the fascia. It was felt there was a need to reduce the signage to give a greater gap below first floor windows. Discussion was held about the rear roof design. CAAC

stated this seemed strange; could one cat-slide roof not be possible (although note that this was not raised previously). Committee also questioned whether the façade could be cleaned of paint, to return to brickwork. (If front fascia sign issue could be resolved, the objection would be removed).

Friar Gate Conservation Area

Application No. & DER/07/17/00880 - Site of 18 Agard Street, Derby, DE1 1YS

Location:

Proposal: Demolition of light industrial building (use class B1). Erection of a nine storey building of 156 studio flats (sui generis use) and associated development including erection of 2m high fencing

Expiry Date: 25/10/2017

Listed Building:

<https://eplanning.derby.gov.uk/online-applications/plan/07/17/00880>

Resolution

Strongly Object and Recommend refusal: CAAC felt only minimal amount of changes had been made to the original plans and they still had fundamental concerns. The Committee strongly Objected and Recommend refusal due to the harm to the significance of the Conservation Area especially along Agard Street which was an integral part of the domestic appearance of the area in association with the main buildings along Friar Gate. It was felt the development did not preserve or enhance the character of the conservation area and has a detrimental impact which is harmful on the setting (as part of significance) of the grade I, II* and II listed buildings nearby, in particular and including Pickford's House (referenced the relevant sections of the Planning (LB and CA) Act 1990. Committee felt a better design was needed and that the use of 1 brick type would give too much monotony. Concerns were also raised at the principle of losing former Friar Gate gardens to intrusive buildings. CAAC raised similar concerns as above - to other Agard St proposals - regarding impact on student accommodation and impact on more domestic scale of Friar Gate heritage assets. CAAC stated that they were willing to assist in providing design guidance for future development.

Hartington Street Conservation Area

Application No. & DER/12/17/01609 - Garages at Hartington Mews, Hartington Street,

Location: Derby

Proposal: Change of use from garages to two dwelling houses (use class C3) including alterations to the front and side elevations

Expiry Date: 27/02/2018

Listed Building:

<https://eplanning.derby.gov.uk/online-applications/plan/12/17/01609>

Resolution

No objection - subject to achieving improvements to external appearance. Committee raised some concerns, particularly of internal configuration and introduction of new door openings, which should be incorporated into existing apertures. There was potential concern expressed about increased intensification of activity, with more cars impacting on the Conservation Area. Need to clarify window and cladding details.

Others - not in Conservation Area

Application No. & DER/01/18/00020 - Derby Rugby Club, Haslam's Lane, Derby

Location:

Proposal: Erection of an equipment/maintenance storage container with associated hardstanding

Expiry Date: 07/03/2018

Listed Building:

<https://eplanning.derby.gov.uk/online-applications/plan/01/18/00020>

Resolution

No objection - subject to suggested temporary condition of 5 years. Committee felt the location of the storage container was an improvement on the one previously submitted.

Others - not in Conservation Area

Application No. & DER/12/17/01658 - River Derwent Corridor including sites from

Location: Darley Abbey, Little Chester, Chester Green, North Riverside, Bass Rec', Pride Park to Alvaston Park, Derby

Proposal: Approval of appearance, access and landscaping reserved matters under previously approved Outline permission Code No. DER/02/15/00210 in respect of the Aida Bliss site

Expiry Date: 12/04/2018

Listed Building:

<https://eplanning.derby.gov.uk/online-applications/plan/12/17/01658>

Resolution

No objection - subject to negotiations over improved plant screening and painting in recessive colour of sheet piling. Concerns were raised over the suggested materials and proposed appearance of sheet piling, particularly of distant views from the west bank. CAAC agreed that this flood defence is an inevitable consequence until the site is redeveloped.

Railway Conservation Area

Application No. & DER/12/17/01583 - London Road Community Hospital, London
Location: Road, Derby
Proposal: Formation of nine additional parking spaces and erection of a lighting column
Expiry Date: 27/02/2018
Listed Building:

<https://eplanning.derby.gov.uk/online-applications/plan/12/17/01583>

Resolution

No objection - subject to officers negotiating changes to car park configuration, to ensure accessibility of all spaces and retention of some landscaping as CAAC were concerned that loss of landscaping would not enhance the Conservation Area.

Strutt's Park Conservation Area

Application No. & DER/10/17/01366 - 11 Chevin Road, Derby
Location:
Proposal: Demolition of bungalow. Erection of replacement dwelling house (use class C3)
Expiry Date: 01/01/2018
Listed Building:

<https://eplanning.derby.gov.uk/online-applications/plan/10/17/01366>

Resolution

Maintain objection on heritage grounds and recommend refusal. CAAC felt the scale and massing were acceptable and that the amendments to the materials/windows improved the visual appearance. However, their maintain concerns were over the proportions of the windows. CAAC felt this was an important gap in the Duffield Road frontage and needed an outstanding modern design, with an elegant solution to reflect the proportions of the adjoining Edwardian property. The Committee agreed the overall design was not good enough quality to enhance Conservation Area.

Strutt's Park Conservation Area

Application No. & DER/12/17/01660 - 35 Kedleston Road, Derby

Location:

Proposal: Front and rear extensions to dwelling house (enlargement of porch, kitchen/diner, utility room with storage above)

Expiry Date: 06/03/2018

Listed Building:

<https://eplanning.derby.gov.uk/online-applications/plan/12/17/01660>

Resolution

No objection – subject to amendments to ensure timber windows and doors. CAAC raised no objection to proposed timber cladding.

Others - not in Conservation Areas Conservation Area

Application No. & DER/12/17/01643 - The Fireplace Workshop Ltd, Wyvern Way,

Location: Chaddesden, Derby

Proposal: Demolition of existing retail unit. Erection of retail units (use class A1) with ancillary cafe, a restaurant (use class A3/A5) with 'drive thru' facility together with landscaping, revised parking and access and associated works

Expiry Date: 06/04/2018

Listed Building:

<https://eplanning.derby.gov.uk/online-applications/plan/12/17/01643>

Resolution

Object and recommend refusal: CAAC felt that the former railway workshop building was an attractive and prominent building worth saving. They felt this building was a reminder of the heritage of Chaddesden sidings and strongly considered this to be a landmark heritage asset at the gateway to Derby. They felt the building could be restored and usefully incorporated in any development. Proposed layout needs revising, with more imaginative solution to restore and redevelop the building. This is a non-designated heritage asset but under para 135 of the NPPF this needs to be considered when undertaking the planning balance exercise.

Minutes End