

Time Commenced – 6.00 pm
Time Finished – 7.35 pm

Children and Young People Overview and Scrutiny Board

19 May 2015

Present: Councillor Whitby (Chair)
Councillors Williams (Vice Chair) and Councillors Care, Keith,
Nawaz, Hezelgrave, Eldret

In attendance: Councillor Hussain (Cabinet Member); Councillors Skelton and
Ashburner (signatories), Pegg and Naitta

67/14 Apologies for Absence

There were no apologies for absence.

68/14 Late Items

There were no late items.

69/14 Declarations of Interest

There were no declarations of interest.

70/14 Meeting procedure for a call-in of a Council Cabinet decision

The Chair referred to the procedure and advised members of the board of its application during the meeting.

71/14 Call-in of Council Cabinet decision 206/14 – Closure of Castle Nursery

The Chair presented a range of reports which had been circulated to the board for consideration. These comprised:

- A report which had been prepared for Council Cabinet at its meeting on 15 April 2015 by the Cabinet Member for Children and Young People;
- Minute extracts from the Council Cabinet meeting on 15 April 2015; and
- A Notice of a Call-in of an Executive Decision which had been received from Councillors Ashburner, Carr and Skelton on 24 April 2015, in relation to the same matters as referred to in minute 206/14 of Council Cabinet.

Signatories to the Call-in Councillors Skelton and Ashburner were present at the meeting and in-turn presented their reasons for calling in the decision. It

was stated by the signatories that they believe the following principles of decision making had been breached by the making of the decision:

- e) Clarity of aims and desired outcomes; and
- f) A record of what options were considered and giving the reasons for decision and/or that relevant issues do not appear to have been taken into consideration

Councillor Skelton questioned the use of data from the Childcare Sufficiency Assessment March 2011 when more recent data was available from the Early Years Market Position Statement. Councillor Ashburner suggested that low attendance numbers have resulted from the wrong category of Ofsted result being advertised, and that it would be better to close one of the less well performing nurseries than to close one that has been rated 'Outstanding' by Ofsted.

Following questions by members of the board, the Cabinet Member, Councillor Hussain, presented his response to the call-in. Councillor Hussain stated that the Council has kept the nursery school open as long as possible on a disproportionate cost of around £4,000 per child in comparison to other similar facilities within the city costing between £900 and £1,200 per child.

Members of the board questioned the Cabinet Member about; the use of accurate data, quality of other facilities across the city, what opportunities have been given to the nursery to improve the situation and what responsibilities the Council has to promote the facility. The Cabinet Member and officers responded that the data used was accurate and that the facility was aware of its position for some years prior to submitting an action plan for improvement.

Following summarising statements and contributions by members of the board, members voted on whether or not the decision-making principles were breached. Of the seven participating scrutiny board members, three voted that there had been a breach of principle f ('a record of what options were considered and giving the reasons for decision and/or that relevant issues do not appear to have been taken into consideration') while four members voted that there had been no breach.

Under paragraph 18 of the Meeting Procedure for a Call-in of a Council Cabinet Decision, the Chair proposed to the board that it must now resolve that Council Cabinet decision 206/14 did not breach the council's decision-making principles. This was carried.

Resolved that Council Cabinet decision 206/14 did not breach the council's decision-making principles.

MINUTES END