

APPENDIX 4.

Derby Riverside: Spreadsheet - comparison of “consented” and alternative flood defence schemes.

“Consented” Flood Defence Alignment		
Cost Plan Summary January 2019		
Cost of works inc fees		£28.18m
Land acquisition costs		<u>£12.85m</u>
Total Project costs:		£41.03m
Buildings to be acquired and demolished:		
<p>Exeter House (4 no RTB flats and 38 no tenanted flats)</p> <p>4 no. Riverside House flats (converted to escape route)</p> <p>Part of Stuart Street car park</p> <p>Trent Barton bus depot, Meadow Road</p> <p>Northcliffe House (Former Derby Telegraph works), Meadow Road.</p> <p>Derbyshire Housing Aid building, Phoenix Street.Crompton House, Derwent Street, (Nat West)</p> <p>Bio House (part only former petrol filling station apron)</p>		
Commentary re property acquisitions. Four buildings are		

Alternative Flood Defence alignment		
Cost Plan Summary January 2019		
Cost of works inc fees		£19.61m
Land acquisition costs		<u>£16.12m</u>
Total Project costs:		£35.73m
Buildings to be acquired/demolished:		
<p>Exeter House (4 no RTB flats and 38 no tenanted flats).</p> <p>Part of car park facing Stuart Street.</p> <p>1 Stuart Street (Probation Office)</p> <p>3 Stuart Street (Methodist Housing Association HQ)</p> <p>5 Stuart Street (Peat House – multi-occupied)</p> <p>Derbyshire Housing Aid building, Phoenix Street. (Part facing Stuart Street)</p> <p>Crompton House, Derwent Street (Nat West).</p> <p>Bio House (part only - former petrol filling station apron).</p>		
Commentary re property acquisitions Five buildings (one		

directly affected by this proposal, four apartments would be lost to the scheme and potentially c 131 existing jobs which are not relocated and are directly affected . Exeter Place – forty two apartments (Council flats) will be lost to the scheme.

in multi occupation) are directly affected by this proposal, forty two apartments (Council flats) would be lost to the scheme and potentially c 534 existing jobs are directly affected.

Advantages	Disadvantages
Already has outline planning permission (2015) and in principle support of partners	Requires the purchase of at least four Riverside House apartments to accommodate dry access escape route.
Requires relatively few acquisitions - will not require the purchase and demolition of the three office blocks at nos 1, 3 and 5 Stuart Street.	No river frontage created along Stuart Street with poor visual impact. Potentially expensive road infrastructure improvements proposed.
Flood defence levels in Package 1 not compromised	Will require a 8m x 4m flood defence gate at Phoenix Street (note: this was not costed in the original Business Case)
Opens up the river frontage at Meadow Road opposite Bass's Recreation area	The three offices on Stuart Street are projected in higher floods (but less frequent floods) to

Advantages	Disadvantages
Opens up the River frontage for amenity value, adjacent to Stuart Street, between the Riverside Flats and Exeter Bridge (a new 'Riverside Park')	Requires the demolition of three fully occupied office blocks fronting Stuart Street, with the loss of potentially 415 jobs.
Will not require the purchase of the Trent Barton bus depot.	Has a small impact on flood levels in the Package 1 area.
May not require the purchase of the DHA building on Stuart Street – detailed work needed to consider re-orientated access arrangements etc.	Will require a new, full planning application.
Larger area (xx ha) made available for regeneration/development	CPO will be required

	experience higher water levels as a result of the OCOR works. In the event of such a flood the Council would be obliged to pay to the occupiers/owners of those buildings compensation for losses that could be proved to be as a result of the OCOR works.
	CPO will be required.

Unlikely CPO will be required – and potentially avoids expensive CPO Inquiry.	Property resilience measures required at the Riverside apartments, Stuart Street office blocks, the Brewery Tap PH and the Smithfield Arms PH.
	Development sites not coming forward so the defence will be a stand-alone wall
	Requires the construction of a pedestrian link bridge between the two Riverside House apartments and a further

	Property flood resilience measures required at the Brewery Tap PH.
Less piling required as it utilises the existing cut off wall at Meadow Road	Does not 'Create more space for water' at Southern end.
Protects the Smithfield Arms PH Note: Further work required to advise on location of existing building	

	bridge link to dry land on St. Alkmund's Way	foundations and ensures capacity of composite wall to carry proposed defences.	
	Will provide a smaller Derby Riverside regeneration opportunity - area xx ha	No requirement for the flood gate at Phoenix Street	
	Remediation cost to Trent Barton Bus Depot	Maintains egress from Meadow Road in times of flood	
	No exit from Meadow Road in times of flood	No need to purchase the flats and construct escape links and bridge to St Alkmunds Way.	
	Requires 5.5m high flood defence wall	Highway pumping station does not require relocation at Meadow Road	
	Highway pumping station will need to be relocated along with electricity supply	Does not require the purchase of part of the car park area on Stuart Street	
	Requires Stopping Up orders for Stuart Street and Exeter Place	Does not require any Stopping Up orders or road re-alignments though this is not precluded for the future.	
	Requires road re-alignment of Exeter Place/Meadow Road		